1 2 3 4	CITY OF MORENO VALLEY PLANNING COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBER – 14177 FREDERICK STREET
5	Thursday, June 25 th , 2015, 5:00PM
6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CALL TO ORDER <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Good evening ladies and gentleman. I would like to call the June 25 th Special Meeting of the Planning Commission to order. The time is 5:11 PM. Grace, may we have a rollcall please?
13 14 15	ROLL CALL
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Commissioners Present: Chair Lowell Vice Chair Sims Commissioner Ramirez Commissioner Barnes Commissioner Van Natta Commissioner Baker
23 24 25 26 27 28	<u>Staff Present:</u> Rick Sandzimier, Planning Official Paul Early, City Attorney
20 29 30	PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
31 32 33 34	<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Now we have a special opportunity. A gentleman by the name of Mr. Frank Wright would like to lead us in the Pledge of Allegiance. Could you please come forward to the microphone?
35 36 37 38 39	<u>GRACE ESPINO-SALCEDO</u> - Chair Lowell I do want to announce that Commissioner Korzec will not be here today. She is excused absent, and we do have present alternate Commissioner Lori Nickel. And absent also we have Erlan Gonzalez.
40 41 42	<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Mr. Wright. Thank you, Sir. Since this is a Special Meeting, I do not believedo we have to approve the Agenda for tonight since this is a continuation of a Special Meeting?
43 44	PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - No.

3 PUBLIC COMMENTS

5 Any person wishing to address the Commission on any matter, either under 6 Public Comments section of the Agenda or scheduled items or public hearings, 7 must fill out a "Request to Speak" form available at the door. The completed 8 form must be submitted to the Secretary prior to the Agenda item being called by the Chairperson. In speaking to the Commission, member of the public may be 9 10 limited to three minutes per person, except for the applicant for entitlement. The Commission may establish an overall time limit for comments on a particular 11 12 Members of the public must direct their questions to the Agenda item. 13 Chairperson of the Commission and not to other members of the Commission. 14 the applicant, the Staff, or the audience.

15 16

1 2

4

17 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Okay, so we don't have the approval of the Agenda, no Consent Calendar, and no approval of Minutes so it looks like we're going 18 19 straight into the Public Comments portion of the meeting. But, before I do so, I 20 have a couple disclaimers I'd like to read. The public is hereby advised of the procedures to be followed in the meeting and they are displayed on the side of 21 22 the room and in the rear of the room. We also have the ADA Disclaimer. It says: 23 Upon request this Agenda will be made available in appropriate alternate formats 24 for persons with disabilities in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act 25 Any person with a disability who requires a modification or of 1990. 26 accommodation in order to participate in the meeting should direct their request 27 to Mark Sambito, our ADA Coordinator. His phone number is 951-413-3120. 28 Please make your request at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. The 48 29 hour notification will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to ensure accessibility to this meeting. Additionally, the Public Comments procedures for 30 Speaker Slips, we are currently reopening the ability to submit new Speaker 31 32 Slips. There was a little bit of concern at the end of last meeting that people had 33 to attend graduations and some other events, so until 6:00 tonight I'm going to be 34 accepting more Speaker Slips. At 6:00, that is the absolute drop-dead no more 35 Speaker Slips. They will not be reopened in the third meeting should it continue. Just make sure, if you want to speak, now is the time to fill out your Speaker Slip. 36 37 This is the absolute dead last chance. Also please turn your cellphones to silent 38 or vibrate to be kind of respectful in that manner. Also, if you have any signs or banners, please don't hold them up over your head and waving them and that is 39 40 that. With that said, I do believe we should just move on to our Public Hearing 41 Items. I believe our first speaker is Scott Heveran, and the second speaker would be Alicia Espinoza followed by Debra Craig and Lindsay Robinson. Also, 42 43 before you get started, we have a couple of TV screens setup throughout the 44 room outside and I believe across the way in the gymnasium that shows the lists 45 of speakers numerically. The numerical order was based on the order that these Speaker Slips were received at the last meeting. We kept them in order and you 46

1 can kind of get an idea of where we are and who is up next, so please pay 2 attention to that. Please, Sir.

3

4 SPEAKER SCOTT HEVERAN - Good evening. I appreciate the Planning Commission and the Chairman's willingness to answer questions posed by the 5 public, and I appreciate that this is a different kind of meeting in that the rules are 6 7 kind of fluid. But I do appreciate you opening it up and allowing all people who 8 want to speak the chance to speak, and I don't think it should be closed until the 9 meeting is over. Okay the thing about it is the presentation by the Applicant, that 10 was a lot to digest and I'm grateful I had the week to do so. Some of it was extremely difficult to swallow, and some of it I just don't swallow. 11 Mv 12 understanding and my reason for opposing this project are many but my top three, and they haven't changed, are traffic, pollution, and this forced vision. You 13 14 know, the Applicant he...there's a lot of people out here that have the signs and he's very good at drumming up support. You know, it's almost like a cult-like 15 thing. Everybody is going to this ranch and becoming indoctrinated. You know, 16 if it was only for good instead of evil. The mitigations that are being offered are 17 lacking. The traffic associated with logistics does not break for peak traffic. If 18 19 that were true everybody that commutes wouldn't see a truck. Pollution: The HEI Study's own author refutes the conclusion by Highland Fairview. I came 20 here in the 80's and the air was not clear. It wasn't good, but over time that 21 22 actually improved. We've made great strides and I'm hopeful one day that the 23 end of fossil fuel use is near and trucks that are as harmful as a Bob's Big Boy are all over the road. I'm pretty hopeful for that. But the reason why our air is 24 25 clear isn't because of the industry or the trucking industry it's because of all the organizations that are against this project; the Sierra Club, the AQMD, you know. 26 27 all the other people that are looking out for the air. This developer admires China so much and their speed to market. Perhaps he should've bought land in China 28 29 and built his warehouses there. In the US, air is very important to us.

- 30
- 31 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Thank you. Your time is over. Alicia Espinoza please. Is
 32 Alicia Espinoza in the room today?
- 33
- 34 **<u>AUDIENCE MEMBER</u>** No she is not here.
- 35
- 36 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Okay then we will hold her spot until the end just to make 37 sure that she has the opportunity to speak. Debra Craig please. I must 38 apologize, Ms. Craig. At the last meeting, Deanna Reeder came up and told me 39 that she wasn't feeling good and was going home, and for some reason your 40 name and her face got crossed in my brain. It was just a total snafu on my part. 41 I apologize.
- 42
- 43 <u>SPEAKER DEBRA CRAIG</u> No, you're not the first person who has confused
 44 us, so you know no offense to Deanna but...
- 45

1 **CHAIR LOWELL** - It's just one of those things that it was late in the night and 2 my apologies.

3

4 **SPEAKER DEBRA CRAIG** - That's fine. I didn't want to speak that night anyways, so this worked out great.

67 CHAIR LOWELL - Perfect, thank you. The floor is yours.

7 8

9 SPEAKER DEBRA CRAIG - Okay well good afternoon. My name is Debra 10 Craig, and I've lived in Moreno Valley for 25 years. I'm having a sense of déjà vu right now and have a copy of a newspaper article that explains why. It's a story 11 12 about a project that could generate over 2200 truck trips a day. It talks about 13 how the diesel trucks will create all of this traffic and air pollution. It tells how this 14 project will create significant and unavoidable effects on the environment. As I 15 read the quotes, it sounded like they were predicting the sky would fall and this project would end Moreno Valley as we all know it. The date of this article is 16 January 9th, 2009. It's an article about the Planning Commission Public Hearing 17 on the Skechers Distribution Center. I don't think any of you were there, but I 18 19 was there that night in support of the Sketchers project. Did any of their predictions come true? No. And, in fact in the three years it's been open, I've 20 never heard any complaints about Skechers and their trucks. And, if there is a 21 22 truck traffic apocalypse that naysayers predicted is happening, it isn't because of Skechers. There was one thing that did come true, which was mentioned in this 23 article. It was how Highland Fairview pledged to make the corporate park as 24 25 environmentally friendly as possible, and they did. The Skechers Distribution Center is the largest LEED Gold Certified Project in the United States. Now, six 26 27 years later, I am here in support of the World Logistics Center. Of course, the chicken little's are also here with the same rants, the same dire warnings, it's just 28 29 a different day. I am for the World Logistics Center because it is the right project at the right location with the right developer and at the right time. In fact, so 30 many neighboring cities around us are starting to build large facilities like what 31 the WLC will cater to I feel there is a sense of urgency in approving this project 32 and getting it off the ground. I feel so strongly that our City must act as quickly 33 as possible, I'm hoping this is the last Planning Commission Meeting we'll need 34 35 and it will go to City Council in 10 days. Please approve this project. In six vears. I hope no one will look back and read a newspaper article how this project 36 didn't happen because people were so fearful. Instead, I hope we will be reading 37 38 about how approving the World Logistics Center was a defining moment in 39 helping our City become a more prosperous community. Thank you.

40

43

41 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Lindsay Robinson followed by Tom
 42 Chelbana followed by Maxine Davidson.

44 <u>SPEAKER LINDSAY ROBINSON</u> - Thank you very much for being here.
 45 Lindsay Robinson. I am opposed to it. Debra is a hard act to follow. At the last
 46 meeting, you all said you met in small groups with Staff members and Mr.

1 Benzeevi to hear all about the positives of this project. I would like to request that you meet in the same groups the same amount of time with the residents 2 that are opposed to it because three minutes isn't enough time. Moreno Valley's 3 4 website polled the top two reasons for living in Moreno Valley is affordable housing and proximity to work, so commuting some people commute. 5 Т commute. That's a choice. Air, okay, red flag. They say there's no health 6 7 issues. Why are three homes getting air filtration? That shows that they do 8 know there's a health issue. Every home in Rancho Belago should get air filtration, the schools, and the Renaissance Village. And also the developer 9 10 should be made to pay for indoor stadiums for the athletes and the playgrounds if they know there is a health issue. You've heard a lot about that. Jobs, jobs, 11 12 jobs. The current zoning for Moreno Highlands has 21,000 jobs. That's 1000 13 more than what this has projected. There also are supposed to be homes put in 14 there. Businesses opened on the East End and have since closed because those promised homes were not built. Noise: You can't mitigate the noise. 15 There are so many unhealthy things here. We moved out there to be away from 16 noise and congestion. Sound walls aren't going to work for everyone out there. 17 Those that do get sound walls are going to lose their views. That's wrong. You 18 know, it's important the health well being, quality of life that we all deserve, and 19 this project is going to destroy all that for too many. Moreno Valley's motto is 20 "Where Dreams Soar." Well a lot of our dreams are going to be crushed if this 21 22 happens because it's the wrong location, wrong project, wrong time, and I can't 23 remember what else I was going to say. Thank you very much.

24

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. I had a quick question for you before
 you go Lindsay. Okay, never mind. I don't have a question for her. We have
 Tom Chelbana followed by Maxine Davidson. Are either of those two here
 today? We have Carl Prude, Deanna Reeder, and Elie Chouinard. I see Ms.
 Reeder is back there. What about Eunice Kang, Owen Christian? I'm just calling
 to get everyone's attention, so the next one up is Carl Prude followed by Deanna
 Reeder. I don't see Carl making any motions, so let's go to Deanna Reeder.

32

SPEAKER DEANNA REEDER - Deanna Reeder. First things first, some of the 33 Planning Commissioners during your Planning Commission interviews with the 34 35 City Council were asked if you supported the World Logistics Center project and several of you answered that question affirmatively. So, those of you that were 36 37 asked during that interview if you supported the project, you need to disclose that 38 to the public when you get to deliberations and before you actually vote on the 39 project because that is very important that the public know how you previously answered this question. You're free to explain that yes you were for it and then 40 you became, you know, unbiased and whatever your vote is now but you need to 41 disclose that to the public before you actually vote on the project. There's a lot of 42 reading with the project, and I'll admit I have not read everything. Now I have 43 44 read through the Conditions of Approval, the Development Agreement, the Specific Plan, and different parts of each of the appendices depending on what it 45 was and what it meant to me. Now the most interesting thing I think about this 46

project is the reason for it is jobs, jobs. But, if you go through the appendix 1 and you look at the Traffic Study, what it says is that there's an assumption that 2 the people that are going to be working at the World Logistics Center would have 3 4 been working someplace else already, so the assumption is these are not any new jobs. The assumption in that particular appendix is that nobody unemployed 5 is going to get a job that people that were already employed and driving 6 7 somewhere else are going to be at the World Logistics Center. Now I'm sure that 8 assumption is so that he doesn't have to account for traffic that's still going to be 9 on the road if people that are unemployed do get a job there. Now, if you look at 10 other parts of the...well there's just a lot of pieces to it. Most of you haven't read it but there's probably about 30 different things, so each of them has a different 11 12 name and a different appendix number, but each of them tells a different story. 13 The Development Agreement and the Specific Plan, pretty much the Specific 14 Plan says maybe we'll do all this stuff if it's feasible. I can't tell you how many times if came up. And then when you're talking about jobs numbers; jobs, jobs, 15 jobs. Well you can't tell a story one way in one part of it and tell a story a 16 different way in a different part, and that's exactly what this does. It pretty much 17 says that they know they've inflated the numbers, but oh well they can do that if 18 19 they want to.

20

22

24

21 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much.

23 SPEAKER DEANNA REEDER - Thank you.

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - We have Elie Chouinard. We have Eunice Kang, Owen
 Christian. Are either of those people here? Perfect and what was your name,
 Sir?

- 28
- 29 **SPEAKER ELIE CHOUINARD** Elie Chouinard.
- 30
- 31 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Elie Chouinard, you're up.
 32

SPEAKER ELIE CHOUINARD - Well thank you for listening. Again, my name is 33 Elie Chouinard. I'm a resident of Moreno Valley, and I have been a homeowner 34 35 since 1986. I want the record to show that I support the World Logistics Center. I feel it's a viable solution to our present and future economic, environmental, and 36 social issues. That's where I stand. It seems to me that the City Staff has 37 38 thoroughly studied this project and, as far as I know, they don't have a 39 reasonable issue against the project so I feel that you folks should go along with 40 your Staff. Thank you.

- 41
- 42 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Thank you very much. Eunice Kang. Okay we will move
 43 along. We have Owen Christian followed by Robert Harris and John Peikert.
- 44
- 45

SPEAKER OWEN CHRISTIAN - Hello. I'm Owen Christian and I pulled into 1 Moreno Valley in mid December of 1985. Some of you maybe can relate, but I 2 remember there were no curbs or gutters or anything like that. I had two traffic 3 4 lights in the City and the names of the streets were on those 4x4 posts, and I'd carry a flashlight with me at night when I would go and visit around in the City, 5 stop at times, get out, and shine that flashlight on that post to see the name of 6 7 the street. That's where we came from, but there's been a lot of good changes 8 taking place in the years. We have a beautiful city, a lot of good things going for Moreno Valley, and I want to see that continue. Now change is coming. You can 9 10 see the difference between from when I came to the city and where it is now. Listen change is still coming, and it's going to keep on coming. We can ignore 11 12 that and get run over by it or else we can embrace the change that's coming and 13 mold it, direct it and use it as a positive thing for our community. I believe that 14 the World Logistics Center is one of those changes that's really great. It's going to be a positive thing all the way around for us here. Now, years ago, I was 15 reading from a very prosperous businessman and he made a statement that 16 stuck with me all these years. He said whatever a man can conceive and 17 believe, he can achieve. And I believe people have visions what can happen 18 here and also Highland Fairview believes it. They've invested millions of dollars 19 already, and I want you as the Planning Commission to just open the door so that 20 they can move in and achieve something that is great, something that will be a 21 22 really positive thing for Moreno Valley for many, many years to come. Thank 23 vou.

24

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you, Sir. We have Robert Harris up next followed by
 John Peikert and Ruthie Goldkorn.

27

36

SPEAKER ROBERT HARRIS - Good evening Chairman Lowell and Planning Commissioners. My name is Robert Harris and I've lived in Moreno Valley for approximately 32 years. And, before I get any further, I just wanted to mention did you guys neglect to ask the alternates if they had conflicts of interest because you all declared that you had no conflicts of interest but I never heard that from the alternates. Shouldn't they also declare that they have no conflicts of interest?

35 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - I can address that after your three minutes.

37 **SPEAKER ROBERT HARRIS** - Okay I'm here to support the World Logistics 38 Center and I first came to Moreno Valley because of the affordable homes and I 39 was a commuter. I commuted to Paramount for 18 years, and in the early years it would take maybe an hour/hour and 15 minutes. And then, as years went by, 40 two/two-and-a-half hours. If there were accidents, maybe three. This is a 41 Ninety percent of all of working adults in Moreno Valley 42 common thing. commute, so they all have a similar experience. We are a bedroom community. 43 44 Moreno Valley now has the opportunity to bring 20,000 jobs with the World Logistics Center and that will improve our tax base. It'll improve our quality of 45 life, and it may even improve our high school graduation rates. Currently, the 46

1 City of Moreno Valley has 0.47 jobs per household. Anyway the people on the East side that are opposing this project, they are mostly retired people with a few 2 exceptions and they don't want the project. They don't have to work, you know, 3 4 so I think they're being selfish by not wanting this to go forward. There have been other times in Moreno Valley where we had the opportunities for large 5 projects to go in. At one point, our City had the opportunity for Boeing, 6 7 McDonnell Douglas, Lockheed Martin, Northrop, and even a Western Chevrolet 8 plant and the project was killed because the people living on the East side didn't 9 want it. Am I over?

10

12

11 **CHAIR LOWELL** - No. You have a few seconds left.

SPEAKER ROBERT HARRIS - Okay. Anyway the project was killed, and I
 would like to see that this project not be killed. Also I have some comments that I
 would like to submit to the public record. Is that possible?

- 16
- 17 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** I'll pass it off to Staff and they'll take care of it for you.
- 18

19 <u>PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER</u> - Here we'll take those.
 20

- CHAIR LOWELL And just to clarify with the declaring of no conflict of interest, 21 22 we were trying to determine if we needed to use an alternate Planning 23 Commissioner. That was the first meeting where we had alternates that may or may not have been used; actually, no it's not the first meeting. We had an 24 alternate we used but by going down the line saying that we did not have a 25 conflict of interest just validated our ability to sit on this specific item, and I didn't 26 27 go to ask the alternates because they weren't going to be seated for this item. It seemed kind of a mute point, but if you'd like to we could ask. I don't think it's 28 29 necessary though.
- 30

31 SPEAKER ROBERT HARRIS - No I'm good. 32

33 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Well one of our alternates is missing and when we get to that
 34 point I'll ask. Next in line is John Peikert followed by Ruthie Goldkorn.

35

SPEAKER JOHN PEIKERT - Good evening. I have resided in this town since 36 1973. I've seen a lot of changes in the 42 years I've been living here. Mainly the 37 38 tremendous housing boom and the tremendous influx of people; the population growth. I support the World Logistics Center. Please approve the Plan. 39 Somewhere on a logo I've seen during the City's duration people, pride, and 40 progress. This is definitely progress, and I believe it's in the right direction. Do 41 not let this opportunity slip away. Moreno Valley residents need local jobs. 42 43 Thank you for your time.

- 44
- 45

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Alright Ruthie Goldkorn followed by Jim Maxwell and Tom
 Jerele, Sr. We see Tom in the back. Are Ruth or Jim available? Are they in the
 room? Okay, so we'll go onto Tom. Next following Tom is Wayne Horner
 followed by Juan Malfavon.

5

6 SPEAKER TOM JERELE, SR. - Tom Jerele, Sr. speaking on behalf of myself and also on behalf of the Sundance Center where I spent a little bit of time. 7 8 Chairman, Vice Chair, Commissioners, Staff and the public: Thank you for continuing this Hearing. Before I go any further, allow me to please thank all of 9 10 you, especially the Staff. The consultant came and explained the Development Agreement last time after the Developers presentation. I learned more in that 11 12 five hours we had the first meeting about this project than I had since I had first 13 heard about it, so it was a very informative meeting. It was conducted very well. 14 I liked that whole temperament of the project here and the way you have been approaching it, so thank you. I have not spoken about the WLC to this date with 15 the exception to say that we should go forward with the Public Hearings and feel 16 putting into a referendum this late in the game is fair not only to the Developer 17 but to the entire city. It's time we put this behind us here. One of the things I did 18 19 to learn more about the project was to self educate. In doing that, I wanted to get as much information as I could on both sides. I think there were five meetings 20 that were against the project. I went to four of them. And at one of the early 21 22 meetings I asked the guestion that didn't get looked at at that time, it came up during a later one, does anybody have a viable alternative for land use on this 23 project and nothing came forward. A lot of people talk big and so oh we could 24 have a Disneyland, we could have this. We could have a water park, you know, 25 no chance of doing that today. But, long story short, we got a stadium. But Mr. 26 Benzeevi is a very accessible man. I'm sure if anybody had a viable alternative, 27 he's not hard to talk to. I mean I've talked to him about possible uses for this 28 29 project, and he always has an open door. He is probably one of the most accessible people in the City, so I have not seen to this date a viable alternative. 30 The other thing is that this move to logistics didn't come vesterday. This goes 31 back about four City Councils. This started a good seven to eight years ago. 32 33 The best example I can give you, Prologis as I've said many times, I'm sure wasn't driving up the 60 Freeway and said hey lets stop here and spend a couple 34 35 million dollars. I think they were encouraged to come in. The welcome mat was out for logistics, so I think this City as a City has been encouraging logistical 36 37 development. So there is a proven marketing need. I am going to endorse the 38 project tonight and speak in favor of it, encourage your approval. One of the 39 issues, the big issue is air pollution. Trucks are not only getting cleaner, but I 40 firmly believe only two hours commute from the ports there I think they'll be all electric within 20 years, so we'll have zero emissions coming out of those trucks. 41 So I think that'd be a big shift and then finally I do have one constructive criticism. 42 Somebody hollered out from the crowd don't we want to see the project? I want 43 44 to see it. That berm on the West side, you know, my mind is calculating the cost and I can think of a lot better uses for the millions of dollars it's going to cost for 45 that money. Thank you. 46

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Wayne Horner followed by Juan Malfavon, Ivan Martinez,
 and Gerardo Malfavon. Hope I'm not massacring that name. I have no idea how
 to pronounce it. Would you introduce yourself please.

5 6

1

SPEAKER JUAN MALFAVON - My name is Juan Malfavon. You just did butcher my name but that's okay.

7 8 9

10

CHAIR LOWELL - Sorry about that one.

SPEAKER JUAN MALFAVON - I'd like to start off with saying that I'm a retired 11 12 Marine Corps Officer. I did 20 years in the Marine Corps. Of those 20 years, 18 13 of those were in the logistics field. I planned all the preposition/disposition transfer of equipment from the United States to Iraq and back. It was a lot of 14 15 work. It takes a lot of people and with that I found that numbers, which was my job, numbers were facts and facts were absolute. What we haven't talked about 16 are the absolute facts of the job. We hear we're getting 20,000 jobs, but what we 17 don't hear is how many children we have in our community who are going to be 18 19 looking for jobs. Well I pulled up a little bit of information on the Moreno Valley website. I found just about 150,000 students between the ages of 15 and 21, 27 20 schools in the district, and we have a total of 111,000 students. Well where are 21 22 those kids going to go for jobs if not here? They're going to go to Disneyland. 23 They're going to go to Perris to distribution centers. Are they going to go to 24 March Air Base who hires 8500 people? Well I don't think anybody going to 25 March to get a job because you have to be retired just like me to get a job at March as a civilian. There's 8600 people at March, and they're all active duty 26 reservists meaning they go to work there but they're paid military pay. They're 27 not the civilians who are in our communities. There are people who come here 28 29 temporarily, live here for a few years, and then leave. But some of those people don't leave. I happen to be one of them. I came from Escondido, California. I 30 bought a home here, and I love it here. I had commuted to Camp Pendleton for 31 32 almost 16 years prior to retiring. I'm not working right now. I'm actively unemployed because what I do is I'm assistant coach. I coach kids in Lake 33 34 Elsinore at the U12 level and I coach kids here in Moreno Vallev at the U17 level. 35 and this is what I mean by our children. All these numbers don't include our kids. Half of these kids their parents never come to practice because they're always at 36 37 work. Their parents never show up at the games because they're working on 38 Saturdays. I pick kids up every single day and take them to practice and take 39 them home and then take them to practice and take them home. And I know the parents appreciate it because I appreciate it because I grew up without a father 40 so I know what it's like to have somebody be a father figure, and I always tell 41 42 those kids do your best. Do right, stay strong, stay safe, and try to become a better citizen. Well how can we expect our children to be better citizens if when 43 44 they graduate from high school they have to leave looking for work somewhere? What happens when you don't have a job? And I'll tell you, the local sheriff has 45 anticipated 14,000 more beds in jail by the year 2020. That's what they're 46

- looking at. They want to build more jail beds instead of more jobs. Thank you
 very much.
- 3

4 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Ivan Martinez. No Ivan Martinez?
 5 We have Gerardo Malfavon.

6

7 SPEAKER JUAN MALFAVON - That's my brother, and he has conceded his
 8 time to me. Can I speak longer?
 9

- 10 **CHAIR LOWELL** Unfortunately you cannot.
- 11

SPEAKER JUAN MALFAVON - He's in traffic, just one of those guys who can't
 come home.

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay, I'll keep him on the list in case he makes it. We have
 Stan King followed by Susan Bellinger and Keith Howerton. I don't see anybody
 moving. So we'll just keep going down the line. We have James Fields. We
 have Susan Nash, Tom Paulek.

20 SPEAKER SUSAN BELLINGER - Good evening Planning Commission. I am Susan Bellinger and our family has lived in Moreno Valley since 1984. I wanted 21 22 to express my opposition to this project. It is nothing personal to any particular developer, but I feel that this is not the best thing for Moreno Valley. I think it's 23 going to open a Pandora's Box of lawsuits and problems that are going to go on 24 for many, many years. One of the things that occurred to me is we're in a severe 25 drought in California right now. It seems to be getting worse almost by the 26 27 moment and so here we are looking at using a huge amount of water for construction activities when we need to be saving that water for drinking or 28 29 sanitation for people. Now one thing I don't know it just occurred to me like maybe we should look into having like a reservoir like a lake sort of development 30 that the people on the East Side would like because I think California is going to 31 start looking for reservoirs very soon. Anyway I feel like this was a unilateral 32 33 decision to rezone it from residential to industrial. The East Side residents were not sincerely included. It was kind of a City decision with Henry Garcia and Barry 34 35 Foster and those people decided to make the East Side industrial without consulting the residents. The surrounding cities, as I said, don't want this. They 36 37 don't feel that there is the infrastructure to support it outside of the development. 38 I feel like the City of Moreno Valley residents will have to pay taxes to support 39 this development, which many of them don't want and then the people outside in 40 Riverside, Redlands, so forth are very opposed to it and have said they don't have the money to pay for the infrastructure outside of this development and they 41 will not. Also the jobs. Now I've seen jobs estimated from zero to 24,000. To 42 me, that's a very unreliable job estimate. In 15 to 25 years who knows what kind 43 44 of housing there will be in Moreno Valley. Who knows what robotics will do to the jobs, so the jobs-to-housing ratio is not even part of the discussion. It's just too 45 far....this project is too much in advance to even guess. I just want to say one 46

1 thing about the roundabout where the trucks stage and go onto Theodore Freeway. I don't think it's going to be possible for all the trucks to stay on a 2 roundabout to go on the Theodore Freeway. It's just impossible and I also 3 4 wonder why it says that a City Truck Map is posted at the exits of the World Logistics Center if all the trucks are just going to stay on the roundabout. I don't 5 think there's enough deadlines for the mitigation. I think you should have dates 6 7 for all of the mitigation and who is going to enforce the truck idling to three 8 minutes and so forth. Thank you.

9

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. So that was Susan. Let's go back,
 was Stan King in the room today? Is Ivan, Ivan Martinez? We called you, but I'll
 let you go for it. Just in time.

13

14 SPEAKER IVAN MARTINEZ - Thank you. I just got off work. So my name is Ivan Martinez. I'm 28 and a resident of Moreno Valley, life long. There are many 15 points I could make against the World Logistics Center tonight. I would like to 16 comment on just one though and that is the tone of recent public meetings. I've 17 noticed a correlation between Public Hearings that involve Highland Fairview 18 19 proposals. About 10 years ago I worked with then Councilmember Charles 20 White gathering signatures to put the Rancho Belago name designation, which Highland Fairview proposed on the ballot to hopefully get rid of it. We held 21 22 community forums where supporters of the name would show up. They were very often loud, disruptive, and aggressive. One resident who came to see the 23 forum later told me she felt intimidated and would not show up to public meetings 24 25 like this again. In recent meetings, I've noticed some of the same thing going on. 26 I've even noticed some of the same people. I just wanted to say that I hope 27 people are not intimated by this behavior and that they understand that this is behavior that's probably meant to keep people from participating. Furthermore, 28 29 the support for this project seems orchestrated as if they have been instructed to clap and shout out loudly when one of them speaks and boo people who speak 30 There is nothing wrong with organization, but when it seems 31 against it. 32 orchestrated the image support for this project should be taken with a grain of 33 salt. Thank you very much.

34

35 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Thanks. Okay, just to clarify, Stan King I didn't see him in the audience. How about Keith Howerton, James Fields, Susan Nash? That's a 36 37 negative, negative, negative. What about Tom Paulek, Rudy Krantz, Maribel 38 Sandoval? No, no, no. Okay, we'll just keep moving down the list. We have 39 Ken and Bethany Clark. Although there are two names, you only get one Speaker Slip. What about Matthew Pineda, Marvin Niles? Wow, we're just 40 striking out. We have Darline Bailey, Kenny Bailey. What was your name? I 41 saw a hand go up. No? I saw a hand go up third row back, no? Okay, we'll just 42 keep going down the list. Darline Bailey, Kenny Bailey, Frank Wright. I know 43 44 Frank Wright was here. He led us in the Pledge of Allegiance. Thank you for leading us in the Pledge of Allegiance. That was really nice. Thank you. 45

46

SPEAKER FRANK WRIGHT - Yes, Sir. 1 My pleasure. Chairman and Commissioners: Frank Wright resident of Moreno Valley for 35 years. It is 2 imperative that we make a proper decision in favor of accepting the logistics 3 4 center project. Financial conditions are now approaching a state of perplexity whereby Food Stamps, welfare, and unemployment will not support the livelihood 5 of many people and now Congress is debating in cutting Social Security that will 6 7 curb the income of many of the seniors. If we raise taxes, then by possibility 8 many may have to move, homes could be lost with the result of many foreclosures, businesses would shut down, and the City would lose as much 9 10 revenue as it would expect to gain. And the fact that Moreno Valley is under the suppression of the City of Riverside. The logistics project is designed specifically 11 12 to bring in the revenue severely needed to our City and to support the families of 13 vast homeowners by supplying technical jobs, professional positions, as well as many other levels of work. This is our last chance in making Moreno Valley its 14 own empire within Inland Empire. Do you see that picture? By being self 15 sufficient and self sustaining an opportunity that we cannot pass up where this is 16 a timely occasion for attaining a goal so desired that it will change the history of 17 Moreno Valley. Because of that you, the Members of the Commission, have the 18 19 necessity to support the people for the best benefit of the City the identity of 20 responsibility and good leadership, which you all have, and the maturity of 21 making the most proper decisions in making a substantial life for all. Therefore, 22 we encourage you in presenting to the City Council this very feasible and prosperous project for their acceptance to vote upon. If we lose this grand 23 opportunity then surely we stand the chance to fall in the same positions as the 24 25 City of Bell and San Bernardino. Chairman and Councilmember's please choose wisely for your decision for the benefit of Moreno Valley and its people. Thank 26 27 you and may God bless you all.

28

29

30

32

31 CHAIR LOWELL - Yes, Sir.

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - I just wanted to point out that it is
 about 10 minutes to 6:00, and based on your direction to restrict comments, I just
 wanted to at least give you an opportunity to make that announcement again
 before the 6:00 hour.

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - Mr. Chairman, if I may.

37

38 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - In case anybody didn't hear, we are fast approaching 6:00. 39 Six o'clock is the cut off if anybody would like to fill out a Speaker Slip that has 40 not done so already. We will take a break just before right around 6:00 just to 41 give people the chance to stretch their legs and fill out the slips, very last-ditch 42 effort, and we will take a couple more speakers in the meantime. We have Don 43 Markham. We have Richard Harry and Kathleen Dale. I saw a couple hands. I 44 see Kathleen is up here. In the back, what was your name?

- 45
- 46 **SPEAKER RICHARD HARRY** Richard.

1 2 CHAIR LOWELL - Come on down please. You said your name is Richard 3 Harry?

4

5

6

8

SPEAKER RICHARD HARRY - Yes.

7 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you.

9 SPEAKER RICHARD HARRY - Ladies and gentleman of the Planning 10 Commission: My name is Richard Harry. I've lived in Moreno Valley for 23 years commuting most of that time to work in other cities such as LA, Pomona, and 11 12 San Bernardino. I won't go into the effect because many of us have spoke about 13 that, but I think that it is about time Moreno Valley step into the future by planning to accept the opportunity offered by the World Logistics Center project to bring 14 15 jobs to Moreno Valley and, one of my favorites, the \$22 million for schools and community colleges annually. Take note that, in addition to this, \$7 million will be 16 contributed for education and training in logistics and robotics in local schools for 17 the jobs the WLC will be bringing along with this project will give notice to Moreno 18 19 Valley residents of jobs that are coming before they are announced to the 20 general public and will train residents for these jobs. That means that many of our children and grandchildren will not have to leave Moreno Valley to find a job 21 22 and also our neighbors. The developer is also giving millions to the City 23 infrastructure improvement for things such as libraries, etc., which is important to 24 the City. The Skechers Building has proved that the fears of pollution from the 25 facility and the trucks was unfounded; proven to be unfounded. We have the 26 zero emissions. The trucks going to the ports, according to the law, have almost 27 zero emissions; less than a backyard barbecue grill. Besides that, I have never seen a Skechers truck in Moreno Valley on the streets or on the road. 28

29

31

30 CHAIR LOWELL - Please keep your comments to yourself.

32 **SPEAKER RICHARD HARRY** - But most of them travel during the evening from say 8:00 at night to 6:00 in the morning, and I have not heard of any backup on 33 34 the traffic or anything because of any Skechers trucks. Thank you.

35

36 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you, Sir. 37

- 38 **SPEAKER RICHARD HARRY** - Vote for this project.
- 39

40 CHAIR LOWELL - Was Don Markham in the audience today? Okay, Kathleen

41 Dale, you are next.

42

SPEAKER KATHLEEN DALE - Good evening Commissioners. My name is 43 44 Kathleen Dale. I've lived in Moreno Valley for all but two short periods of my 45 childhood while my dad was stationed away from March. My family lived on Gifford Avenue east of Redlands Boulevard at ground zero for more than 30 46

1 years, and I currently live along Cactus Avenue near Perris Boulevard in an area 2 that will be significantly impacted by the project proposal to make Cactus Avenue into a new crosstown highway. I have submitted two sets of written comments to 3 you. The first one dated June 11th raises numerous procedural errors and points 4 out errors, omissions, and inconsistencies in the record before you that basically 5 render you unable to make an informed decision regarding the development 6 7 applications and certification of the EIR. The second letter that was submitted 8 today provides excerpts from the Moreno Highland Specific Plan regarding 9 proposed land uses, job projections, and project surplus revenue to the City. In 10 case there is any doubt, I'm opposed to this project, and I agree with the very knowledgeable attorneys, environmental organizations, and public agencies who 11 12 have provided extensive evidence that the record before you requires substantial 13 additional work and recirculation of a revised draft EIR before you take any affirmative action. The minimization of the consequences of the Cactus Avenue 14 15 extension change in the project subsequent to circulation of the 2012 draft EIR is just simply appalling. In adjusting the proposed circulation system to address the 16 modified Specific Plan Boundary and to address impacts to the old Moreno 17 neighborhoods east of Redlands Boulevard, the Circulation Plan has been 18 19 modified to shift about 20,000 vehicles per day originating from the proposed 20 development to Cactus Avenue east of Redlands Boulevard on a road segment that currently carries about 470 vehicles per day. I'm told your Staff disagrees 21 22 with this assessment but it's in your documents and you've each been provided 23 excerpts from the EIR that give you that information ready at hand. This change 24 alone clearly triggers the recirculation requirement by impacting new sensitive 25 receptors, both residents and wildlife because this road cuts across the open 26 space area. And I think it's Planning Area 30 and presents the potential for new 27 or more severe impacts regarding esthetics, air quality, biological resources, 28 cultural resources, hazards hydrology, land use noise, public services traffic, and 29 utilities that aren't addressed in the final EIR. The Development Agreement requires significant amendment to clearly disclose the infrastructure and services 30 each party is responsible for and the corresponding costs. The Development 31 32 Agreement provisions regarding the DIF fees are in direct conflict with the EIR 33 analysis and the mitigation program, and these conflicts must be resolved by 34 amending either the Development Agreement or the EIR before a decision is 35 rendered. I also have some additional detail...

36 37

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much.

38 39

AUDIENCE MEMBER - Order, we want order.

40

41 <u>SPEAKER KATHLEEN DALE</u> - And recommendations in my June 11th letter
 42 regarding the Development Agreement.

43

44 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Thank you. That's enough. I can get the bailiff involved if 45 you wouldn't mind knocking it off. Okay, with that said, it is past 6:00. Can Staff 46 verify that there's nobody in the audience, nobody in the hallway, nobody in the

1 gymnasium across the street that is still trying to fill out a Public Speaker Slip? Perfect. That's fine. I'm just trying to make sure that you were able to submit the 2 green piece of paper. Because, if you submitted it, you're on the list. I'm just 3 4 trying to make sure that you've had the opportunity to. What was your name again, Sir? Yeah we did call you, and I can call you up right now. Let's just 5 double check. Is there anybody else still trying to fill out a green slip? I see a 6 7 couple hands. Okay that's fine. I'm just trying to make sure you did fill one out. 8 Okay, at this time, I'm going to close the period where we're accepting new Speaker Slips for this meeting. Okay I don't see anybody else wanting to fill out 9 10 one, so no more Speaker Slips. We are done receiving new Speaker Slips.

- 11
- 12 **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** Mr. Chairman, if I may.
- 13 14 15

CHAIR LOWELL - Yes, Sir.

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - I was just talking with our Staff.
 Our Staff is working with the City Clerk who has collected some additional
 Speaker Cards. We'd like to bring those forward and we'll integrate those.
 Some of the speakers that are filling out Speaker Cards are over in the
 gymnasium, so they may take a little bit of time to get over here.

21

23

26

22 **CHAIR LOWELL** - That's fine.

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - But we will update the list, so I just
 wanted to let you know that there are some additional names to add.

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay. Thank you very much. I did hear that we had a
 couple people that we called that were not physically present at that moment in
 time, and it was Ken and Bethany Clark. And what was your name? You had
 your hand up. Sandoval. Maribel Sandoval, okay, you can go up after Mr. Clark
 over here.

SPEAKER KEN CLARK - Good evening ladies and gentleman. My name is 33 Kenneth Clark. I'm speaking on behalf of myself and my wife. I've been here in 34 35 Moreno Valley since 1988. We've raised our kids, foster kids. I've heard issues on both sides and what we're looking at is what outweighs the other. I've been 36 here. I've watched Moreno Valley change since I've been here five times from 37 38 drugs to prostitution to low riders; the whole thing. My personal opinion on this 39 view, roughly from mid 30s up, it don't concern us. This logistics project is for the 40 future. As the gentleman got up and said, the change has changed and it's going to change. Whether you like it or not, it's going to change. So now, in view of 41 that, we're looking at our children or our children's children. Even my children 42 are all moved, grown, and have their own. But we're looking at the little small 43 44 children. To me, this project belongs to them. With the kind of information that I thought I understood is we're in this...it won't be anymore of the old style hands-45 on thing. You're going to have to go to school to learn computer, so all this is 46

1 what they're teaching now at school to the kids. I can't keep up with my grandkids. I don't know the computer that well. But, to me, I'm for it. We have to 2 look out for the future, which are our children or our children's children, who like 3 4 myself I'm over 60 and some people in Moreno Valley are way over 60. No offense to...I heard a lady say that they came here for peace and quiet. That 5 changes. That changes everywhere, so I'm looking for that too. But we're retired 6 7 and I'm no longer working. My wife is retired. My kids are grown and their gone, 8 but we have to look back on the kids that are coming up. From what I'm 9 understanding from these other people who are against this project, I don't care. 10 Forget them. They can die as far as I'm concerned. That's the way I'm seeing it, but the kids are the future. They need to have something to work towards. I'm 11 12 for this project. If you don't have to ride an hour, hour-and-a-half, two hours to go 13 to where you have to and it will just take me 10 minutes to get to work, even walk 14 to work, I think it's profitable for Moreno Valley. We need to change. I hope I'm here to watch it happen. I'm 63, at least I hope I'm here by..... 15

16 17

18

20

23

- CHAIR LOWELL Thank you very much.
- 19 SPEAKER KEN CLARK Thank you very much.
- <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Maribel Sandoval followed by Imelda Santana. We have
 Louise Palomarez and Bob Palomarez. Maribel, please.
- 24 <u>SPEAKER MARIBEL SANDOVAL</u> I'm Maribel Sandoval and I'm a Moreno
 25 Valley resident and I'm....
- 27 **CHAIR LOWELL** Can you approach the microphone a little bit better?
- 28

26

- SPEAKER MARIBEL SANDOVAL And I'm in favor for the World Logistics
 Center because, if you want a job, you should just get a job and we all live in
 Moreno Valley so that's it.
- 32

34

- 33 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Thank you very much.
- 35 SPEAKER LOUISE PALOMAREZ - Louise Palomarez activist here in the community for over 26 years. Okay, I agree with all the speakers here because if 36 we don't jump on this bandwagon, we lost it. And some of the speakers said well 37 38 let's put a reservoir. Wait a minute, don't we not have no water? Don't we not 39 have no water? Also another speaker said Redlands. You know, all the surrounding cities don't want it; Redlands, Perris. Well that's why they don't want 40 it. They're going to build it in their backyard. Redlands wants it. Redlands that's 41 a small community. It's already going into the logistics. They already have it 42 built up. Everybody wants it in their backyard. That's why. Again, as far as the 43 44 surrounding cities, we got some of the supervisors out at Riverside they own land off the 10. They own land off the 15 and the 215. They want it in their backyard. 45 They don't want it in our backyard. How long are we going to be the toilet bowl of 46

1 Riverside County? That's what I want to know. How long are we going to be in the desert? I've said this before, another 40 years? We have two opportunities 2 to bring good companies here. Boeing and all that, we missed that boat. We 3 4 missed the second boat. Now we're going to miss the third boat? This is the wave of the future. We need this in our City. We need this for our kids. A lot of 5 people don't, you know, go to college and all that. They can go to college and 6 7 learn this in six months to one year. You know, not everyone wants to go to college for four years so we need this. We need these jobs in our City. We need 8 the revenue. What could it do? You know, I was here the other day at the 9 Council meeting. They were going back and forth with the budget. Come on! All 10 this money to the City, all the revenue. It will take 15 years to build up but we got 11 12 to start somewhere. We got to be a City on a hill now. We're tired of just being 13 on the backburner forever. How long do we got to wait? How long do we got to 14 stay in the desert? Like I said, another 40 years? It's our turn. It's our time. We need this project. If we don't get this project, we are going to be like San 15 Bernardino. We're number 49 right now. San Bernardino is number 50 about 16 jobs per household. Come on! Our kids, they're coming out of these high 17 schools. They got to commute to every surrounding county. I got kids that live 18 on the East End, four kids. They're not complaining about this. They want it to 19 They bought their houses here. All my kids commute to every 20 come. surrounding county but this county; every surrounding county. They don't even 21 22 work here. They got to drive out of here. My generation, we had to drive out of here. My kids, they're driving out of here. My grandkids they're going to college. 23 They don't even want to live here no more. They didn't buy houses, so they're 24 up and ready to go after they get out of college. We need this. If we don't have 25 this, forget it. We're the lowest performing schools in the district, Riverside 26 27 County. We got the lowest performing schools, so we need this for our kids. The parents aren't here. They're commuting on freeways all the time. They can't put 28 29 into their kids like this other man was talking about. He's involved with kids with sports and all that. He knows what it is. We need our parents here. It's not 30 going to supply jobs for everybody.... 31

32

34

- 33 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Thank you very much.
- 35 **SPEAKER MARIBEL SANDOVAL** But it will supply a lot of jobs plus all the 36 money it's going to give our schools. Thank you.
- 37

39

38 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - We have Imelda Santana and we also have Bob Palomarez.

40 **SPEAKER BOB PALOMAREZ** - Good evening Commissioners, Chair. All the 41 speakers before me have said a lot that are for this project, and it's true. You 42 know, I live up in Sunnymead Ranch and when I opened my front door before I 43 could see all the hills to the west and all the flatlands. Now all I see are logistics 44 west of the 215 from one end to the other, and that's fine with me because I 45 know that's progress. Jobs are coming, business is coming, and every 46 surrounding community is benefitting by it and that's what the people of Moreno

1 Valley want. They want their piece of the pie. You know, they've been waiting and the project speaks for itself. I'm sure you've gone over it. All the negativity 2 that people come out is because that's the echo of what they did with Skechers. 3 4 Like Louise was saying about, you know, Redlands they're going....Redlands, Colton, Rancho you all know it. Everybody's building while we're just looking 5 around and seeing them build and reading about what they're doing. The future 6 7 is now. We can't wait anymore. If we don't pass this thing, gradually we're going 8 to see the streets, and they're already getting that way, they're turning into slums a little bit. You know, I'm not talking about way on the East End, I'm talking about 9 10 central Moreno Valley. I see it because I go through there everyday. Another thing, when I go on the freeway in the morning going west, man all that traffic that 11 12 is leaving Moreno Valley well even the hybrids now. you know, the State of 13 California wants to impose....what they want to do is eliminate the gas tax 14 altogether and charge you by the miles you drive. So all the people that are driving back and forth, it's going to cost them. Even the people that have 15 hybrids, fuel-efficient vehicles, because the State is losing too much money. 16 They can't fix the roads. And another thing I just want to say, this is kind of a 17 little thing about the naysayers here, this little thing that we can easily forgive a 18 19 child who is afraid of the dark the real tragedy is when man is afraid of the light. 20

- <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Thank you, Sir. We have Alice Bradley. We have Gideon
 Kracov. We have Tom Hines and Karen Jakpor. I don't know. What was your
 name?
- 25 **SPEAKER ALICE BRADLEY** Alice Bradley.
- 2627 CHAIR LOWELL Yeah, by all means. You're up next, yes.
- 28

24

29 SPEAKER ALICE BRADLEY - Good evening Chairman Lowell and Planning Commissioners. My name is Alice Bradley. I'm a lifetime resident of Moreno 30 Valley, so I've been here a little longer than a lot of you. I'm no youngster. But 31 I'm here on behalf of the Moreno Valley Historical Society, and it's a little bit 32 different issue. But it's regarding the World Logistics Center proposed closure of 33 34 a portion of Alessandro Boulevard. I'd like to read the letter that I submitted to 35 you. The Moreno Valley Historical Society works to preserve and celebrate the proud history of our region. We recognize that our history is not just in the 36 amazing photos of our founders, the historic buildings that we seek to save, or 37 38 the relics of the past. Our history is also contained in the ways that people lived, 39 the way they traveled, the paths they used to settle our valley, and trade with their neighbors. Because we seek to preserve and celebrate all of our history, 40 we strongly oppose any attempt to close a portion of Alessandro Boulevard, a 41 vital link to our valley's history. Not so long ago, Highway 60 simply did not exist. 42 Instead, travelers used what we now think of as historic roads to get to Riverside, 43 44 Redlands, Beaumont, Hemet, and other surrounding towns. From there, they could travel east, west, north, and south. Few roads were more important to 45 what is now Moreno Valley than Alessandro Boulevard. The centrality of 46

1 Alessandro Boulevard to Moreno Valley's history is explained in Viola Hamner's 2 book titled Moreno Valley, California In the Beginning. In it she states historic Alessandro Boulevard, our best-known highway, has been extended over the 3 4 years and now stretches 17 miles from Gilman Springs Road westerly into the City of Riverside. On November 11, 1988, it was designated a City of Moreno 5 Valley Landmark Resolution CPAB88-2. It has been, over the years, a San 6 7 Bernardino County Road, a Riverside County Road, a California State Highway, 8 part of the Transcontinental US 60, part of Old Jackrabbit Trail, and lastly a 9 Moreno Valley City Boulevard. The desire to close a portion of Alessandro 10 Boulevard for new development violates our history and robs future generations of the ability to better understand our history and how our founders lived and 11 12 worked. A Development Plan can be changed or altered. Streets can be easily 13 moved a bit in one direction or another. Truck traffic can be restricted with 14 signage and enforcement. We ask that you not attempt to change or alter our 15 history by erasing a vital part of the valley.

16 17

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much.

18 19

20

21 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - We have Gideon Kracov followed by Tom Hines, Karen Jakpor, and Melody Lardner.

SPEAKER ALICE BRADLEY - Thank you for your consideration.

23

24 **SPEAKER GIDEON KRACOV** - I'm learning a lot tonight. Chair and 25 Commissioners, my name is Gideon Kracov. I'm a lawyer here for the Laborers 26 Union Local 1184 and has thousands of members who work and live in Riverside 27 County, hundreds here in your City. We've previously submitted many comment letters for the record, most recently letters of June 10th and June 24th. I think you 28 have these. The laborers want good healthy jobs, but they're concerned about 29 this project and whether it will meet the standard good/healthy jobs. Our written 30 comments focused on deficiencies in traffic, air quality, biological, agricultural, 31 32 and urban decay impacts but tonight I'll talk of just two of those. Air guality: Your final EIR is so patently deficient in the area of air quality that the California Air 33 34 Resources Board has taken the highly unusual step of filing a formal comment 35 letter criticizing your document. It points out that the EIR dismisses health impacts of diesel particulates from trucks based on a single recent study. CARB 36 37 states the use of only one study as the basis for this analysis is not sufficient for 38 the purpose of providing a comprehensive analysis of health risk. The study is 39 only one of many scientific studies related to health risks. In fact, there are many 40 other studies that conclude that diesel particulate matter is a health hazard. Now 41 your EIR cannot simply ignore the legal conclusion of CARB, the California 42 Agency with regulatory authority over this issue yet that's what your environmental document does. CARB concludes that feasible, feasible 43 mitigation should include a requirement of zero emission, a requirement of zero 44 45 emission, a near-zero emission vehicles and trucks. Local 1184 members breathe this polluted diesel air. This project can and should do better. Next is 46

1 urban decay. We submitted expert comments that, given the scale of the project, the likelihood of significant urban decay impacts in the primary and secondary 2 market areas including other cities is high including the potential for existing 3 4 similar industrial uses, warehouse uses, to be rendered no longer viable and forced to close or stagnate. We understand and we want local good jobs, but 5 without an adequate analysis it's not clear what the local and regional costs of 6 7 this project are. The project could shift the location of warehouse development 8 without accounting for potentially offsetting impacts to existing businesses, existing neighborhoods. This will hurt good jobs. Jobs that Local 1184 seeks 9 10 and the quality of life in this region as a whole. In summary, Local 1184 believes there are too many unanswered questions and unmitigated impacts to approve 11 12 this project tonight. Thank you for your consideration and thoughtful attention to 13 all these comments.

- 14
- 15 16

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much. We have Tom Hines.

SPEAKER TOM HINES - I wonder if 1184 objected to anything along the 215 or
 if they objected to anything along the 10?

20 <u>**CHAIR LOWELL**</u> - Keep the applause down to a minimum. Please, please 21 continue.

22

19

23 **SPEAKER TOM HINES** - Will do. What is a job worth? My first job was at Sears warehouse and with that money that I made there I put myself through 24 college. What is a job worth? Every job is a good job for somebody. When 25 March closed and we lost 6000 jobs, our property values went down 35%, so if 26 we bring in 6000 jobs or 12,000 jobs or 18,000 jobs would our property values go 27 up 35%, 70 or 105%? I don't know about you, but I would like to be able to 28 someday retire and sell my house. But it is also going to be important that there 29 are jobs for our children and that the robotics industry that is developing we don't 30 need buggy whips or kerosene lanterns anymore. Those jobs have gone away. 31 And if in the next 10, 20 or 30 years 50% of the jobs people have today are no 32 longer existing that means we have to retool as America, as Moreno Valley. 33 Each individual needs to be thinking about what type of a job will they have in the 34 35 next 10 years because some of our jobs won't be needed. The Riverside Robotics Society is going to be starting a robotic college, the first in the world. 36 37 They are going to locate somewhere, probably in Riverside. Why doesn't our 38 City and our economic development people offer them a location here in Moreno 39 Valley. We have just landed Fisk and Fisk is going to be a great corporate tenant 40 for our City. Moreno Valley has the doctor of LEED Certified Gold Buildings. The best ecological builder in the whole world is right here in our own City. The 41 Moreno Valley Business Journal supports jobs because either a City is dying or 42 43 growing.

- 44
- 45

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Karen Jakpor followed by Melody
 Lardner and Yvonne Redmon. Okay, so Karen is not here. Yvonne is not here.
 What about Melody Lardner? No? Okay, so we're going to go to Donovan
 Saadik.

5

6 SPEAKER DONOVAN SAADIK - Alright. Good evening, Commission. My 7 name is Donovan Saadik. I've been a resident here since 1977. I was actually 8 pre Moreno Valley, and I've been hearing a lot of people talk about the kids. Well and I'm really happy we're having this discussion and there's not a lot of 9 10 animosity going on right now, but you got to reach out and understand each others sides. So this isn't about winning or losing. It's about this is my position, 11 12 that's their position. Now a lot of the people that are talking about the kids. 13 When you talk to them, you say well where are you from? Their not from here. 14 So, if you're talking about the future for our kids, most kids as we know when we grow up we don't want to live our parents lives. We want to go and do something 15 16 else and make our own way in the world, so there is no guarantee that the kids are going to be here. The kids that are from Moreno Valley are going to be here 17 later on. Now maybe down the line some other kids that's good and great. But 18 19 some of the things that I had a problem with the presentation. I've never seen a 20 presentation where it is so good that there is no bad. How do you make a presentation where oh it's going to be awesome; this, this, this, this. Now I'm a 21 22 military guy and just like my fellow marine was over there saying, he had some good points, but at the same time he is a logistics man and he knows as well as 23 anybody else to logistics there's some bad sides of logistics. And you've got to 24 25 take that into consideration. The Panama Canal is going to be complete in three months. The Nicaragua Canal is opening up. That's going to have a significant 26 impact on warehousing in the West Coast, a 30% to 40% reduction. These are 27 facts. Now you might not like the facts but you can't sit there and say that it won't 28 have a potential of what's going to happen here. Now, infrastructure costs, fair 29 share. He keeps saying that in the thing, fair share. Now, if we look at what 30 happened in the Skechers debacle, we paid a lot of our fair share in that so \$150 31 million I don't think I want to go through that again in infrastructure costs. His 32 33 land, he wants to develop it, you incur the costs. And not everybody wants jobs 34 in the warehouse. I was raised here, so I'm going to tell you right now back in my 35 day when I was coming up and I graduated high school the only option I had if I wanted to stay in this area was to join the military. That was it. You didn't go 36 37 somewhere and then come back or whatever you're going to do so not 38 everybody wants to be working in a warehouse. If you take all the kids that are 39 here, all the people that...the thing's not going to be complete until 2030. I'll be 40 in my 60s by then, so it's not going to do me any good. So for people that need jobs, people are under the impression that this thing is going to be built in a 41 couple years. It's a 15 to 20 year build-out, so you've got to start telling the truth 42 43 on that.

44

45 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Paul Granillo, Maricela Ramirez,
 46 Wendy Clay, and David Lara-Tellez.

- 2 **SPEAKER MARICELA RAMIREZ** Hello and good afternoon.
- 4 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Would you introduce yourself?
- 6 **SPEAKER MARICELA RAMIREZ** Yes, Maricela Ramirez.
- 8 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Thank you.

10 SPEAKER MARICELA RAMIREZ - I'm in favor of the World Logistics Center. It has been a long time for this project to finally come to the big day to decide. I 11 12 know the challenges and obstacles you've had to building the road but with 13 patience and perseverance I know it will be one day completed. I have been a 14 resident for 35 years as mentioned the first time I spoke and I have definitely 15 seen the City grow tremendously. I have been a student and can relate with those who commute. Sometimes there will be sacrifices to gain profits, so 16 working as a team will be the only way things will turn out safe and progress. 17 18 Let's not talk the talk but walk the walk. Thank you.

19 20

1

3

5

7

9

- **SPEAKER WENDY CLARK** My name is Wendy Clark, not Wendy Clan.
- 21

23

22 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Oh, Wendy Clark. Thank you.

24 **SPEAKER WENDY CLARK** - I support the World Logistics Center myself. I have family that were retired from Aerospace, and they suffered from the long 25 26 distance drives back and forth day in and day out and I have a brother that does 27 have stents in his heart so I do kind up speak up with my family. Basically, my 28 family has been split. I have kids that have moved out of here. They were trying 29 to find work. They didn't find work, so they had to move away and I do support it with the future for our children or our children's children. We do need jobs. We 30 do need the tax revenue here to support the colleges and stuff, so we can get 31 32 trained for this project. That's about it. Thank you.

33

34 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. David Lara-Tellez followed by Chef
 35 Basil and Joe Celentano.

36

37 **SPEAKER DAVID LARA-TELLEZ-** Commissioners, Staff and public: My name 38 is David Lara-Tellez. I'm a resident of Moreno Valley and I'm in favor of the 39 World Logistics Center. What I wanted to talk to you today about is #1 I wanted to compliment you on the last meeting you held with the circus being in town. I 40 think you did a wonderful job of dealing with this without having the chaos that 41 could have occurred. I appreciate that. We do have an atmosphere right now 42 where we have four or five council people who are under recall. We've had a two 43 44 year relentless attack by the Press Enterprise to depict our City as being corrupt. 45 And even after there was no corruption found after two years, they're not now trying to promote Moreno Valley. They are continuing to bash us. I think it's time 46

1 for our City to move forward. I think that this Commission has a wonderful opportunity to help us do that. We are here with a project that the opponents 2 have...I mean Staff actually has to say it is a real project because one of their 3 4 claims was that it wasn't a real project. I hear the opponents talk about higher paying jobs. That's the project that's not real. Where is that project on your 5 calendar? Do you have that project, the higher paying jobs that are going to 6 7 come to Moreno Valley? No you don't. You have this project in front of you. 8 And, yes, it's probably going to be a 10 year build-out. What did our City leaders do 10 years ago that have brought jobs now? Nothing. That's why we are where 9 10 we are now. We did not become the second worst major populated city for jobs in the nation by accident. Well we did by accident kind of. We didn't plan to get 11 12 here. I don't think that previous Councils and previous Commissions intended to 13 have us be the second worst city in the nation for jobs. I think that they never 14 failed to miss an opportunity to miss an opportunity. There is an opportunity in front of you now and 10 years from now people are going to look back. The 15 children who are in second, third, and fourth grade right now are going to look at 16 you and say there were jobs available for me because you did the right thing 17 because you did not let this circus atmosphere and these people who make 18 19 these ridiculous claims that this is not a real project they can't argue this project on a real basis. They have to claim that it doesn't even exist. I thank Staff for 20 having clarified that and I want our City to move forward. I want Moreno Valley to 21 22 be what it should be. We are the second most populated city in the county. We are not a colony of Riverside. We are Moreno Valley. We need jobs and we 23 24 need opportunities. Thank you.

25

26 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - We have Chef Basil. We have Joe Celentano, Elsa Reyes
 27 Coulter.

28

29 SPEAKER JOE CELENTANO -Good evening. My name is Joe Celentano. I've been a resident in the area since 1976. I'm a retired chief master sergeant. I 30 have an aircrafts and engine maintenance background and then I moved into 31 32 aerospace and got into the logistics and statistics business. I am not against 33 jobs, and I don't think anybody here is against jobs. I think what we're trying to 34 do it trying to make sure that the types of jobs that we have are going to bring 35 success to Moreno Valley. Logistics is a good step forward, but it's not the only thing. I'd like to see the medical corridor become a reality instead of just a lot of 36 37 talk. We've gone around and lost a lot of the minor and small manufacturing 38 communities that we did have in Moreno Valley. They left for parts unknown for 39 obvious reasons. They just weren't able to make the money here. I think what 40 we're trying to do it trying to be good. I would like to say that I enjoyed the presentation by Highland Fairview and one of the things that I think really came 41 to point was the fact that we only heard him say that this is good. To me, that 42 sounded like when I went down to buy a new car. When you buy a new car, all 43 44 you hear are the good things. You don't hear about the airbag problem and you don't hear about the key problem or you don't hear about the brake problems. 45 There are things that the EIR brought out that I think need to be given more 46

1 consideration and more thought and I am a proud member of Moreno Valley. I intend to stay that way and my family does too. Thank you for the opportunity to 2 3 speak. I'd like to bring this into the Minutes if I may.

4

CHAIR LOWELL - I will take it for you. Thank you. So we have Chef Basil. We 5 6 have Elsa Reyes Coulter. We have Walter Guinea. Please introduce yourself.

7 8 SPEAKER ELSA REYES COULTER - Elsa Coulter. Yes my name is Elsa 9 Reves Coulter. I am here to support the project of the World Logistics Center 10 and not because anybody obligating me. No. I say this because later on when Iddo held this and held that and it's coming to our area and well if he, one person 11 12 like him, now can help the groups of children who do so poor, our children in this 13 city, who can do? This project is for the future of Moreno Valley. We have to 14 think for our children, not for us; the older retired people like me. The people are opposed say there will be more traffic and more people with this project. Well, 15 without this, that is going to happen. In South Perris, we have growing 16 warehouses. To the west, all the economy is growing with traffic and people 17 from Moreno Valley. In Moreno Valley, what? Sit down looking for that. We all 18 know our City, in a very short time, will have no money to pay including salaries. 19 We need money from the taxes that this project is going to give to the City. 20 When this project is finished, at the construction is going to be forever and the 21 22 young people will be here and will have opportunities. I support this project at least for our heritage, for the young and children. This opposition group here, 23 well last year was opposition for me, for women who do good, and no expensive 24 25 music program for children. What I'm trying to say is sometimes the people are in a position for everything in our community. It's true. You have to start the 26 27 project and do something wonderful for the community. That we understand but we trust you are ready to prepared to pass this. If we lose a big project like this 28 29 in the middle of the city, Los Angeles Airport in the middle of the city, Las Vegas in the middle of the desert so this is nothing for one city this project. Who 30 approved that project was a person like you. Nothing more is more and they're 31 only looking for projects for the city. So please today approve this project for the 32 33 future of our young people. Thank you.

34

35 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you. Water Guinea followed by David Murray and Tom Thornsley. Are any of those three people present? We have Walter 36 Guinea, David Murray, and Tom Thornsley. I don't see anybody making any 37 38 hand motions, so we'll keep moving down the line. We have Betty Master, 39 Morgan Keith, and Felipe Leos. Please introduce yourself.

40

41

44

SPEAKER BETTY MASTERS - I'm Betty Masters. It does have an S. 42

43 CHAIR LOWELL - Masters.

45 **SPEAKER BETTY MASTERS** - I saw that presentation by Mr. Benzeevi and oh how I wish that my math calculations of jobs were what he anticipated. I love 46

1 math. Therefore, I went home and I thought 20,000 doesn't seem to jive with the previous jobs to square footage so I started looking at the local warehouses here. 2 Thank heavens I can give you some numbers. If you have your calculators, you 3 4 can do the same thing I did. I applied Skechers jobs to square feet and then I looked at several others around here. The best I can do for you is say that 5 20,000 jobs is simply not calculable. It won't work. I got 13,467. I knew one 6 7 ratio, not the 20,000 that have been estimated and constantly touted by both 8 Benzeevi and the paid economist John Husing. So I looked at four other local 9 warehouses because I think anybody that wants a job ought to have a job, so I 10 wanted to find out if this wonderful presentation and anticipation of so many jobs could possibly be true. It was not, but what I can tell you is what's reasonable. 11 12 By applying that ratio to the World Logistics Center at the full build-out and 13 somebody said maybe 10 years, actually if you look at it, it could go up to 25 years before my numbers would be in play. Nine thousand five hundred and six 14 of my five ratios would be the lowest. Fourteen thousand six hundred and sixty 15 eight is as many as you're going to get and that's using the local data. You can't 16 get 20,000. If you can't get 20,000, you also have to anticipate the economic 17 benefits or the multiplier effect is not going to happen. Now this is so immense 18 it's hard you know over the three years to think about it but 700 football fields, if 19 the numbers if the economic benefits are not what Mr. Benzeevi is predicting, 20 how can you say with any degree of assurance that the benefits outweigh these 21 22 terrible, terrible significant effects on the whole community in the region? I live across from Box Springs and I would definitely be impacted. 23

24

25 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much. Morgan Keith followed by Felipe Leos, Paul Martin, and Dawn Newkirk. If you heard your name, please make 26 27 your way to the microphone. I'll read those one more time. We have Morgan Keith, Felipe Leos, Paul Martin, and Dawn Newkirk. Moving on we have Antonio 28 Reza, Sean Fortine, Aruna Prabhala, Daniel Peeden, Darrell Peeden. If you 29 heard your name, please make your way to the microphone. You can just go out 30 of order. Whoever is up first can go. You can use the other microphone if you 31 32 don't want to bend over.

33

34 **SPEAKER SEAN FORTINE** - No business plans were presented with Highland 35 Fairview's project for their presentation. There were no plans for actually businesses that were going to be part of the development. Like there was the 36 37 tire project and the last time they presented a great presentation, but there were 38 no actual businesses and no water usage or pollution controls....I'm sorry I'm 39 being scatter brained now. Nobody actually knows what's going on. It's basically is a blank check. My trade is computer repair and I've even worked on concrete 40 plants. I sound like I support the project but my experience is that I was only 41 needed on a per-job basis. With a good network and hardware configuration, 42 you really don't need much hands-on labor for that and most of the work that is 43 44 done by administrators and can be done anywhere on the planet or even on the moon if you don't mind the lag because of all the software. Well my credibility 45 might not be great. Yesterday on CBS local morning news, they had a segment 46

1 on there was a survey that 36% of people that are unemployed are displaced by technology. And other jobs like janitors and gardeners can be outsourced by 2 contractors and brought in as needed to clean the place a few times a week. 3 4 Then small businesses with small profit margins in places like Seattle they are already having a softening market because of the high minimum wage and low 5 demand. McDonald's is also automating and then without some sort of legally 6 7 binding and enforceable civil or if applicable criminal penalties for failing to bring 8 in the promised jobs there's a really good chance that Mr. Benzeevi and Highlands Fairview can walk away with a pile of cash while the Moreno Valley 9 10 citizens and the City pays the expense of the health problems from it, so thanks.

- 11
- 12 13

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you Mr. Fortine. Can you please introduce yourself?

14 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** - Good evening Planning Commissioners. My name is Dawn Newkirk and my husband Ed and I have lived in Moreno Valley for 15 44 years. We reside in one of the seven rural residences that could become a 16 part of the WLC if approved. We built our current home located on Dracaea 17 Avenue just east of Redlands Boulevard in 1978, raised two children, and were 18 19 looking forward to spending our remaining years in the same home. Now at the completion of the FEIR and recommendation by City Staff that this project be 20 approved, I want you to know how its impact will affect our quality of life. 21 22 Changing the zoning from residential to industrial will render our property useless as residents. As we have under three acres of land, our land would not qualify to 23 build a warehouse. Our zoning would be changed to Light Logistics, which 24 25 restricts owners to few options such as storage units. If we were to explore industrial development, would we be afforded the same rights and benefits as a 26 27 developer of the WLC? Secondly, we would have a 60 foot high warehouse about 75 feet from our living room window and another 60 foot high warehouse 28 29 would be 500 feet from the back of our home. However, the most important adverse effects to the residents within the WLC project, and I say within the 30 project, our health risks. In the FEIR's significant impacts, it states that logistics 31 32 operations within the project could cause air pollutant, noise, lighting and health risk impacts to residents if they are adjacent to operating warehouses. 33 Incredibly, the FEIR does nothing to mitigate these issues. It just states that 34 there is no effective means to medicate these onsite residents from the planned 35 logistics warehouses and the land use is significant and unavoidable. Please 36 note, California has recommended funding of our medical services to those 37 38 impacts by air pollution. These services are very important to mitigate the 39 impacts. If the WLC is built, the only larger diesel magnet sources in the region 40 are those of Long Beach and LA. They have ongoing programs to provide health services to those impacted by air pollution and the residents of Moreno Valley 41 deserve the same consideration at the expense of the main developer who is 42 causing these impacts. By recommending this project as is, you put our health in 43 44 harms way. The WLC FEIR needs to be revised, recirculated, and include qualified health services paid by the developer for not only us within the WLC 45 Specific Plan but those living within the 1000 feet of the WLC and along the main 46

truck roads leading to the project as a condition of approval. It is your job, as
well as the job of the City Council, to protect all citizens from decisions that could
be detrimental to health and welfare. Thank you for your time. I appreciate it.

4

6

8

5 **CHAIR LOWELL** - What was your name again? Was it Dawn?

7 SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK - Dawn Newkirk.

9 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Be sure to stick around for the Commissioner Discussion
 10 because I do have some questions that might pertain to you.

11

13

12 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** - Okay, thank you.

14 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. I don't know who is next just please make your
 15 way and introduce yourself.

16

SPEAKER ANTONIO REZA - Good evening my name is Antonio Reza. I speak 17 Spanish. For 10 years, I've been living in Moreno Valley. This evening I just 18 wanted to say that the WLC is a great project. It has nothing to do with us, and it 19 has to do with reality with what's needed. Our community is growing. I mean 20 five years ago it was a small town. Now it's a city. When this project is 21 22 approved, it would be an amazing city. It would shine. You will go and be known in history as protagonists because what you're doing is your blessing so many 23 families. You're providing jobs as every job is dignified. We're very appreciative 24 25 for Iddo, someone that we admire and appreciate. His greatness is not found in his money. It's found in his character, his nobility, his hospitality, and we give 26 27 him thanks for being here. My children were raised here. With so much love, we serve the community with all the happiness and I believe that this will impact in 28 29 such as brilliant way. Here in Moreno Valley we will shine in the city, the country, and even the world with this great investment. Remember you as leaders, you 30 must take the most precise decisions and the most brightest of men and make 31 those decisions that require much wisdom. And I want to invite you all that this 32 33 decision that is motivate our Councilmember's to be courageous and to do the 34 best of the best for our community, for our families, and for our City. Thank you.

35

36 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Okay thank you, thank you. Pipe
 37 down. Thank you, thank you, thank you. Please introduce yourself.
 38

39 **SPEAKER DANIEL PEEDEN** - Hello my name is Daniel Peeden a resident in Moreno Valley for eight years, and I could probably go on and go on but I think 40 the definition of insanity is that you keep doing what you're doing and you keep 41 getting what you're getting. If you look at the region as a whole, we have the 42 largest concentration of warehousing and logistics in the United States. We also 43 44 have the worst pollution in the world; one of the worst pollution counties in the world. So when you look at developments like this, you have to take into the 45 consideration the opportunity to cause. Do we want to continue down the road of 46

1 being like everyone else and being average like every other city in San Bernardino and Riverside County or do we want to do something better and do 2 something different? I believe that's a decision that you guys have to make. You 3 4 look at the American dream and you guys sit there and you listen to Dawn and her husband Ken talk about what this development is going to do to their lives. 5 The American dream is buying a home and retiring in that home but then you 6 7 have a developer that comes in and creates a plan to take that all away from 8 them. That is not American way and that is not Moreno Valley. I believe the 9 Specific Plan right now says that, if we develop what is already supposed to be in 10 the Plan, we would create 21,000 jobs so why do we want to go back and do what everybody else is doing and look at their cities. Look at San Bernardino. 11 12 Harvard actually came out with a research study just recently a couple months 13 ago that stated that Riverside County and San Bernardino County have some of the worst economic upward mobility for children in the United States. This is 14 simply something you can Google. And it's a sad day when you look at our 15 region as a whole and you have speculative developers saying let's put all of our 16 money, all of our dollars and do whatever we can to get a project passed; take 17 away the votes from the American people, take away our democracy, highjack 18 our democracy so that you can get a project passed. If Iddo Benzeevi/Highland 19 20 Fairview did not invest over \$600,000 to our elections in November we would not be sitting here today discussing this poorly-planned project and that is a fact. So 21 22 I urge you all to take a look at how San Bernardino....LA Times just came out with an article about San Bernardino. Why is San Bernardino the way it is? 23 Speculative developers, corruption, money and/or politics making bets on an 24 industry that is volatile and makes no sense whatsoever. We can do better. 25 26 thank you.

27

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. We have Aruna Prabhala. We have
 Darrell Peeden. We have Russell Williams and Leo Gonzalez.

30

31 **SPEAKER DARRELL PEEDEN** - Darrell Peeden. I actually own a home in District 2 and I have been there for eight years, so this whole talk about Rialto is 32 absolutely nonsense. It's again nonsense. In the 1970s this region was the 33 34 American region, a place where the middle class was thriving. The City of San 35 Bernardino was named the All American City. Today because of warehouses and distribution, this region is a place of poverty, low wages, and cheap land. 36 We ignore the solutions in order to support those that buy our politicians and 37 38 incentivize the public in order to build a support base for a project that will do 39 nothing for the people but everything for the developer. You want progress, build 40 a library. You want a job, educate the population. You want revenue, work for the people and not the wealthy. We need to solve the problems that we face 41 today and tomorrow. This project is not our progress. It will be our downfall. 42 This project does not solve our job problems. This project will be taking jobs 43 44 from this city. This project that offers a guesstimated 20,000 jobs but everyone knows that is not going to be produced. The current plan produces 21,000 jobs. 45 Why are we discussing a project that produces 20,000 jobs and we all know 46

1 that's not going to happen. If this project was so great, why does the developer have to infuse over half a million dollars into our elections to ensure the project 2 gets passed? If it is so great then let it be on its own merits. That is obviously 3 Benzeevi said the environmental study process under the 4 not the case. California Environmental Quality Act measures worse case scenarios instead of 5 reasonable foreseeable impacts. Mr. Benzeevi stated that there is CEQA and 6 7 then there is the real world. If Mr. Benzeevi is claiming that CEQA is measuring 8 the worse case scenarios instead of reasonable foreseeable impacts then why 9 doesn't he apply the same claim to his projected job numbers and the cost it 10 takes taxpayers will incur for the development of this project? He won't even tell us what the project is going to cost the taxpayers. Since Mr. Benzeevi claims to 11 12 be an expert in warehousing, I am sure he knows everything has a cost so what 13 are the costs? We do know that RCTC has stated that our freeways will not 14 handle the increased traffic. We know there will be a significant increase in pollution. We know that temporary employment will increase. We know that low-15 paying jobs will increase. We know that City opportunity costs will be significant 16 based on the land that is already planned for. We know the city taxpayers will be 17 paying for infrastructure costs. We know that, so I challenge you to do the right 18 19 thing....

- 20
- 21 CHAIR LOWELL Thank you very much.
- 23 **SPEAKER DARRELL PEEDEN** And have him mitigate and tell the truth.
- 24

26

22

25 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much. Hi. What was your name, Sir?

- 27 SPEAKER LEO GONZALEZ Leo Gonzalez.
- 28

31

29 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Leo Gonzalez. We have a Russell Williams. We have Linde
 30 K. We have Adolfo Kruger and Darric Williams.

32 **SPEAKER LEO GONZALEZ** - I believe that message was just brought to you by Cory Jackson for District 2 for next election. My name is Leo Gonzalez and 33 I've been sitting here hearing everybody talk back and forth and apparently, if it's 34 35 not obvious enough, there's two sides opposing WLC and people that are for the WLC. I'm not here to talk about that because I'm here to talk about Moreno 36 37 Valley and I'm here to talk about what's important to the City, not what's 38 important in Riverside. So I want to ask you guys a question because 39 everybody's been doing the talking. I want to see where you guys are at. What is your vision for the City? Does it include crime? Does it include commute? 40 Does it include people talking bad about Moreno Valley because everywhere I go 41 I tell people, and I'm proud I live in Moreno Valley, and they say why would you 42 move there? Why do you live there? Because I believe this City's got the 43 44 biggest growing potential out of any other city in the Inland Empire. Unfortunately, you know somebody up here just said insanity is doing the same 45 thing over and over again and expecting different results. Well guess what guys, 46

1 if the people 10 years ago didn't have a vision for today...if you guys don't have a vision for it, then insanity is doing the same thing over and over again and we'll 2 be in the same exact spot we were 10 years from now where we are today guys. 3 4 So we can argue specifics about pollution and this, this, and that. Quite honestly, I think a lot of that comes, like I said, I'm not going to mention any names but 5 their initials are PE and I think a lot of these people are just drinking the Kool-Aid, 6 7 they're swimming in it because the way that they paint logistics in every other region besides Moreno Valley is very bias. They even post links to Amazon so 8 people can go apply for jobs that pay \$12.00 an hour, so people want to talk 9 10 about high-paying jobs; really \$12.00 an hour guys? Guys, what is your vision for the City because somebody here has a vision for the City and somebody else 11 12 is trying to do the same thing they've been doing over and over again and trying 13 to undo what he's trying to do guys. That's insanity. Commutes are insanity. My 14 wife and I this is our second time living in Moreno Valley. We spent over \$900 commuting to Corona for work. I said screw this, this is ridiculous. Let's me back 15 to Corona. Then I said screw it let's go back to Moreno Valley. Let's just build a 16 business here. Guys I don't want to feel like I made a mistake moving out here. 17 I want to raise my kids here. I have a vision for the City that it can compete with 18 Irvine and Ontario if we just follow the same exact steps that they did. That's 19 20 success. You deal with successful cities then you will become a successful city and they all started in manufacturing and logistics. Guys the facts are in front of 21 22 you. Pollution, traffic you live in Southern California. You don't want pollution or traffic, go live in Idaho. Approve this project guys, come on. Send this message 23 24 to City Council.

25

26 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Your name was Leo Gonzalez? We have a couple more 27 speakers that are standing in the wings and after these next few speakers we're 28 going to take a quick five minute recess to stretch your legs a little bit. Could you 29 introduce yourself before you start?

30

33

35

- 31 SPEAKER LOUIS VASQUEZ My name is Louis Vasquez. I'm with the Emergi
 32 Ready Company here in Moreno Valley and I belong to the chamber.
- 34 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** I don't have you on the list, Sir. What was your name again?
- 36 <u>SPEAKER LOUIS VASQUEZ</u> Louis Vasquez. I am on the list and I raised my
 37 hand earlier.
- 38
- 39 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Yeah, I was calling people up in order from the people that
 40 were here last meeting.
- 41
- 42 SPEAKER LOUIS VASQUEZ Well could I finish then?
 43
- 44 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Well....

45

46 **SPEAKER LOUIS VASQUEZ** - Or do want to let somebody else?

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - I'd like to let the people that were here last time to say their
 piece in order to be fair to everybody else.

- 5 **SPEAKER LOUIS VASQUEZ** Okay, no problem.
- 7 **COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA** He said he raised his hand.

9 <u>**CHAIR LOWELL**</u> - Yeah but he's not on the...you'll get your chance just not 10 right at this moment. What was your name, Sir?

11

13

15

4

6

8

12 **SPEAKER RUSSELL WILLIAMS** - Russell Williams.

14 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Thank you.

SPEAKER RUSSELL WILLIAMS - Thank you Mr. Chairman and fellow 16 Commissioners. My name is Russell Williams. I'm the Development Review 17 Manager for the Riverside County Transportation Department. I'm here to stress 18 the importance of the June 8th comment letter we submitted for the project, and I 19 20 do have copies of that for you if you're not familiar with the letter. We did receive a response to the letter. The information we received really was cut and pasted 21 22 from the EIR and it didn't address our concerns. Our primary concern is Gilman 23 Springs Road. We've been making substantial investments to improve the safety 24 and operations of Gilman Springs Road and it's currently a two-lane road. 25 Adding 6000 cars and 400 trucks on Gilman is going to create traffic issues, and I 26 think that's acknowledged in the EIR. But the EIR calls for improvements to 27 Gilman within the city portion and a payment of fees for the remainder. Having 28 only a portion of the road improved for any duration of time is going to create 29 safety and operational issues. We really need Gilman improved to a four-lane facility from State Route 60 to Sanderson Avenue or SR-79 as part of this 30 project. In the County letter, there were five measures we were requesting be 31 32 addressed as conditions of approval for the project and we urge you to revisit these prior to making a decision. The County is available to assist in their 33 34 implementation. We're here to help the process. The County Transportation is 35 not in support or opposed to this project, but a project of this magnitude can and should do more to ensure the safety and mobility of the traveling public. Thank 36 37 you for your time and consideration.

- 38
- 39 **CHAIR LOWELL** What agency did you say you were representing?
- 40

41 <u>SPEAKER RUSSELL WILLIAMS</u> - Riverside County Transportation
 42 Department.
 43

44 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Thank you. Okay did I call your name already, Sir? Yes by 45 all means. After you're done speaking, we're going to take a five minute break.

46

1 SPEAKER ADOLFO KRUGER - Okay I've heard all these pros and cons and everybody says oh how great everything is, alright. In Long Beach and San 2 Pedro, okay they're ports, their kids are just about dying from health problems 3 4 because of pollution there. Okay Moreno Valley, Brown Valley, is surrounded by mountains. Those places are on the ocean with lots of air movement. Here, 5 you're sitting between mountains in the valley. Mountains surrounding all those 6 7 trucks is going to kill a lot of people. It's not clean trucks and hey diesel uses 8 oxygen. People wake up. No oxygen and you're going to die. Okay? Hey, I've had experience. I've worked at Kaiser. I've been forced to go to Kaiser to work 9 10 when they're open. The first time it took half an hour for my nose to bleed. The second time it took 20 minutes. The third time 15 minutes, and I quit my job 11 12 because of it. I know what pollution is. I've lived here in Moreno Valley since March 43 years. I've seen the changes, okay? And all those trucks are clean 13 trucks but hey they still use oxygen. They're internal combustion engines. 14 Oxygen is getting less and less on the planet. Okay? People are dying now 15 because of the pollution. I can hear myself oh yeah jobs, job. It sounds like, hey, 16 I heard both on back and forth, back and forth create jobs, but are there really 17 going to be jobs? Are they really going to be jobs, okay? Just like Skechers the 18 19 most automated warehouse in America. What's automated? No manual jobs period, okay? People wake up. Automation means no jobs and I just keep going 20 on. And I just listened to that presentation for just about two hours. Two hours 21 22 but everybody else has three minutes and probably that's going to go out. Hey we already got on the South Side and the West Side. Now we're going to build 23 on the East side, so Moreno Valley is going to be surrounded by warehouses. 24 The property value is going to go down. They aren't going to go up. I lost it all, a 25 26 business, compared us...oh Newport Beach \$700,000 or more. Hey....

27

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. I would like to take a quick five
 minute recess. We will reconvene at 7:15.

30 31

MEETING BREAK

32 33

34 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you for coming back and joining us. We are still 35 continuing our Public Comments portion of this hearing. Next up, we have Darric Williams, Rivelba Cordio, and Megan Brousseau. And just as everybody is 36 migrating up to the microphone, I wanted to let everybody know who is watching 37 38 in the hallway or over in the gymnasium that we have quite a few empty seats 39 here in the City Council Chambers. If you'd like to make your way over here, we 40 can probably squeeze everybody in and watch it in person without having to watch the live feed. You're more than welcome to come over. Have I called 41 anybody's name that's heard their name and hasn't made it up to the microphone 42 yet? We have a Linde K. We have a Darric Williams. We have Rivelba Cordio 43 44 and Megan Brousseau. Okay nobody is making any motions, so we're moving on. If you heard your name, please come on up. Please and introduce yourself 45 46 too.

3 Commission. I didn't just hear my name. David Murray was speaker number 56. 4 5 CHAIR LOWELL - Sure why not. Go for it. 6 7 SPEAKER EMILIO RAMIREZ - Okay thank you, Sir. My name is Emilio 8 Ramirez. I'm speaking on Dave's behalf. 9 10 **CHAIR LOWELL** - I don't think we can do that. Did you fill out a green slip this afternoon or did you fill one out earlier? 11 12 13 **SPEAKER EMILIO RAMIREZ** - He filled it out earlier. He cannot attend. He is 14 on my Staff. I'm the director. He sent me... I have a statement on his behalf. 15 CHAIR LOWELL - You can pass the statement off to Staff, but we cannot let 16 17 you speak for somebody else. It would just turn it into a giant maze of people. 18 19 **SPEAKER EMILIO RAMIREZ** - Alright, thank you. 20 21 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - I appreciate it. Thank you. 22 23 **VICE CHAIR SIMS** - I'd be interested in knowing who you represent though. 24 **SPEAKER EMILIO RAMIREZ** - I'm the Director of the Community Development 25 26 Department for the City of Riverside. 27 28 PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - Mr. Chairman, if I may, if I may, if I 29 may.... 30 CHAIR LOWELL - Hang on, we'll work this out. 31 32 33 **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** - We actually had one circumstance 34 where a gentleman had called us in advance and wrote a letter and asked for a 35 speaker to speak on his behalf. 36 37 CHAIR LOWELL - Okay. 38 39 **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** - We don't have a problem with that. This gentleman has submitted a letter. I assume that he is going to be reading 40 directly from the letter, so he in fact is speaking on behalf of that particular 41

SPEAKER EMILIO RAMIREZ - Good evening Members of the Planning

43 44

42

1 2

45 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay. I'll defer to Staff. Then I'll let you go by all means.
 46 Thank you.

differently, I think open communication will be fine.

person. He's given us the letter. Unless my attorneys here are advising

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - Do you need this to read from, Sir?

4

5 **SPEAKER EMILIO RAMIREZ** - I have one, thank you. Thank you very much. As I mentioned, my name is Emilio Ramirez. I currently serve as interim Director 6 7 for the City of Riverside's Community and Economic Development Department, 8 and I appreciate the opportunity to speak in front of the Commission today. As 9 you may know, Riverside has carefully reviewed the project, including the draft 10 and the final EIR. We would have submitted our written comments to the final EIR sooner, but there were too many changes that we needed to review. 11 12 Riverside did the best they could to review the final EIR in time available and the 13 changes that have been made to the project description and objective and the 14 technical studies and the analysis of the drafted EIR. In fact, there are so many 15 changes to the EIR that it needs to be recirculated in our opinion. The impacts from this project are very important to the people of Riverside and Moreno Valley. 16 The project will bring 14,000 truck trips per day on average. That is about one 17 truck every six seconds. More than 11,000 of those trucks will have to travel 18 19 through the beleaguered 6215 Interchange, which is already regularly jammed to a standstill. Drivers, including trucks, will divert from the gridlocked freeway to 20 new service streets jamming those too in Moreno Valley and in Riverside. There 21 22 will be so many vehicle trips that, even if they are moved off peak, they will 23 create their own peak periods like a fire can create its own weather. There will no time of the day when people on the 6215 Interchange people from Riverside 24 25 and Moreno Valley will not suffer the heavy burden of the project traffic. Along 26 with the trucks and the cars and other vehicle trips come noise and air impacts. 27 The EIR claims no further mitigation is feasible, so Moreno Valley and Riverside will be stuck with a paralyzing truck and traffic burden. The project applicant has 28 29 not volunteered to fix his impacts to the 6215, so approving this project is condemning Moreno Valley and Riverside to gridlock, heavy trucks, cut-through 30 traffic, noise, air pollution and more based on an incomplete and flawed analysis. 31 32 Because the final EIR is inadequate and needs to be recirculated and because of 33 the overwhelming adverse impacts of the project, it should be denied. Thank 34 vou.

35

36 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Please be nice and hold your applause and boos. That's
 37 really kind of childish. Please stop. Okay moving on down the line. We have
 38 Darric Williams. We have Rivelba Cordio and Megan Brousseau. What was
 39 your name, Ma'am?

40

41	SPEAKER MEGAN BROUSSEAU -	Megan Brousseau
T 1	<u>OI EARER MEGAR BROODERO</u>	megun Diousseuu

42

43 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Brousseau. Sorry so close.

- 44
- 45

SPEAKER MEGAN BROUSSEAU - It's okay. Megan Brousseau for Inland 1 Empire Waterkeeper. We're here today just to speak mostly on our comment 2 letters to the final EIR. The World Logistics Center's current plan unfortunately 3 4 will drown the San Jacinto Wildlife Area in oily and greasy water. Waterkeepers letter detailed how the World Logistics Center refusal to install adequate runoff 5 treatment system will allow polluted water to runoff and drain directly into the San 6 7 Jacinto Wildlife Area and Wetlands. This polluted water will include oil and 8 grease accumulated from thousands of trucks. The runoff from this project will 9 directly impact the critical habitat and wildlife downstream. We do not want, nor 10 will we allow, a miniature version of the Salton Sea in Moreno Valley. The WLC responded to our concerns with a letter that appears to be mostly copied and 11 12 pasted from their previous response letter to the original EIR to which Waterkeeper has already refuted those claims. 13 So it is, in essence, a 14 nonresponse. The WLC unfortunately refuses to adequately clean their polluted runoff. Specifically our letter explained to them how the proposed retention 15 basins are clearly inadequate to clean the polluted water that will be leaving their 16 site. Detention basins are used to slowdown water before it leaves a facility in 17 order to stop flooding and sometimes reduce some pollutant loads. However, 18 19 they are not adequate for treating the storm water that is draining to the sensitive wildlife habitat in the already impaired San Jacinto River. The WLC ignores the 20 inevitability of polluted runoff. Even if the WLC builds the infiltration basins 21 22 required to adequately control runoff, it is inevitable that there will be a mount of polluted water that will still flow into the San Jacinto Wildlife Area directly 23 downstream. Their claims that their current plan will result in no net increase in 24 25 water or polluted water are therefore false and are evidence that they have not take these very serious and legally binding water pollution issues seriously. The 26 27 WLC's plan as is cannot handle a 100 year storm. It can't. It asserts that its facility will be able to mimic the natural conditions for a 100 year storm with no 28 29 backup and the reason they would like to assert that we can only assume would be that being able to establish that would allow them to evade compliance with 30 the general industrial permit. So just, in conclusion, we are a governing agency 31 as far as enforcement goes. We are an NGO, but we are an enforcement 32 agency on the Clean Water Act and as is their in violation of not only the Clean 33 34 Water Act but of CEQA and so there's just got to be some changes. It's not a 35 matter of opinion. It's just the law. Thank you.

36

37 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. Jim Rush followed by Gabe Colangelo, Vivian
 38 Moreno, and Hadaway Hadaway.

39

40 **SPEAKER JIM RUSH** - Good evening. Jim Rush with the IBW, which 41 represents over 2000 logical workers throughout Riverside County. Listening to 42 Mr. Benzeevi's presentation on the World Logistics Center, I'm quite impressed 43 at his level of commitment to the residents. He and his team have committed a 44 lot of time and energy to address and accommodate issues that have been 45 brought up over the years. The World Logistics Center is going to bring a lot of 46 good to the community. Twenty thousand jobs which will be offered to residents

1 throughout the Moreno Valley Local Hire Program, \$2 million for schools and community colleges, \$5.7 million for the City's funds, but I would like to address 2 This project is estimated to bring \$3 billion in the construction aspect. 3 4 construction spending and over 13,000 construction jobs for Moreno Valley. What are we going to do to ensure that these jobs go to local-area construction 5 workers and not workers from out of the county or out of the state for that matter? 6 7 I know there is a Local Hire Program, which I support the idea of, but is there any 8 accountability or recourse if these numbers are not met? Is there a Veteran's 9 Program like Helmets to Hardhats that will ensure a certain percentage of 10 Veteran's be employed on these projects? The answer is no. What the Resolution states is that it will encourage businesses to give a good faith effort. 11 12 Let me offer a solution to my questions. As a Planning Commission, City 13 Council, City Staff, and the community, we can set the standards as to how 14 projects are built in our community. We can do so by developing prequalification language or a Community Benefits Agreement that will ensure the project be built 15 to set standards and there will be accountability built in to ensure these 16 thresholds are met. Many cities and municipalities are going to these type of 17 agreements to ensure residents and their perspective communities are taken 18 19 care of. Mr. Benzeevi in his presentation stated, and I quote, we need jobs in Moreno Valley for the benefit of Moreno Valley. This also applies to the 20 construction jobs. In the construction industry, workers tend to travel to where 21 22 their work is to take care of their families and sometimes that means spending weeks or months at a time away from their families. As of right now, we have 23 23 electricians from Moreno Valley and 108 electricians from surrounding 24 25 communities that are not able to come home at night because they are working out of town. As a community, we need to guarantee we have local construction 26 jobs for local workers so they are able to be at home at night with their families. 27 We need to ensure and guarantee the vision Mr. Benzeevi has for the residents 28 29 of Moreno Valley, and I quote, what good is it to live in a palace in Moreno Valley if you're away from your kids and your family. It's worth less than a shack. We 30 would be in support of this project if, and only if, we can ensure the work goes to 31 32 local-area construction workers.

33

34 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. Gabe Colangelo. We have Vivian Moreno,
 35 Peggy Hadaway, Roy Bleckert, and Joseph Jones.

36

37 SPEAKER VIVIAN MORENO - Good evening Chair and Board, my name is 38 Vivian Moreno. I too am also a citizen from Riverside, and I consider myself a 39 regional citizen. Today I'm going to use only fact-based comments. Today I heard some concerns about traffic, pollution, and forced vision and that this is not 40 the best for the City of Moreno Valley. I want to read from this document that I 41 actually found, and it talks about this project. It talks about this project that's 16 42 million square feet of development. It will provide 12,000 to 15,000 jobs. It will 43 44 be phased over 20 years. It has 153 lots ranging from one acre to 100 acres and traffic mitigated by (TUMP) measure a street widening. I also want to read a 45 statement from this particular document here that says, although the building is 46

1 intended to be used as a warehouse distribution facility, an end-user has not been identified. Specific details regarding future operations of this facility are not 2 currently available. This is what I found, and I have been coming here and I have 3 4 been saying that a project is going to go somewhere. This project right here that I have read from sounds very similar to Mr. Benzeevi's plan, and I just want 5 people to look at the project site right here which happens to be in the City of 6 7 Riverside. So I want everybody to see this. This actual initial study was created 8 March 2015. It is on the March Joint Powers website. You can find it there, but my problem is that warehousing is coming. It's in Perris. It's here. It's in 9 10 Riverside. It's going to go somewhere. Whether these citizens approve it or not, I do believe it's going somewhere and I want to see all these people at the next 11 12 March Joint Powers. You can get this off the internet, and I want them 13 screaming there for the same reasons, for the same purpose. This is absolutely 14 ridiculous that people are coming down just here and screaming about this project. They should be across the region and everywhere. I was at a local City 15 Community Meeting last night, and I can tell you our new City Manager actually 16 mentioned this project. I have it on my phone. I recorded his meeting. He also 17 talked that we have to come together as a region, and they talked about the City 18 of Riverside being like the capital of this region. Hello! Okay I live in the City of 19 20 Riverside. I like the tax dollars. But I know what's going on in the City of 21 Riverside, and so I think people need to be more aware. Thank you very much.

22 23

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you.

24

25 **<u>GRACE ESPINO-SALCEDO</u>** - Chair Lowell. I'd like to make a correction to 26 Hadaway Hadaway. In fact, it is Peggy Hadaway.

27

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Roger. I was just reading it the way it was shown. Is Peggy
 Hadaway in the audience today? I don't see anybody raising hands. So that
 was Vivian Moreno. We have Gabe Colangelo. We have Peggy Hadaway, Roy
 Bleckert. Is Roy Bleckert here? How about Joseph Jones? Marisa Gonzalez?
 Irma Flores? We also have Christina Torres, Evan Morgan, and David Horspool.
 Please introduce yourself. I called out a whole bunch of names.

34

SPEAKER IRMA FLORES - My name is Irma Flores. I'm the Executive Director 35 of So-Cal Environmental Logistics Alliance, which is based here in Moreno 36 Valley. We promote green jobs and clean communities. I want to thank you for 37 38 the opportunity to speak this evening on the World Logistics Center. On June 39 11th, and again today, we submitted our comments to the City Council and the Planning Commission. For those here today, I just want to say that we're neither 40 for or against the proposed World Logistics Center. We are, however, paying 41 close attention that those involved in the decisions of this project do the right 42 thing. We will hold you accountable to do what is right for the citizens of Moreno 43 44 Valley and for the City of Moreno Valley. We will hold the World Logistics Center to do the same. Cities have an important role to play in ensuring environmental 45 justice for all of California's residents under state law. Environmental justice 46

1 means the fair treatment of people of all races, culture, and income with respect to the development, adoption, implementation and enforcement of environmental 2 Government Code 65040.12 Subdivision E laws, regulations and policies. 3 4 fairness in this context means the benefits of a healthy environment should be available to everyone and the burdens of pollution should not be focused on 5 sensitive populations or in communities that are already experiencing its adverse 6 7 effects. Moreno Valley must begin to recognize its obligations to consider 8 environmental justice in the CEQA process and the advantages of environmental justice. These include healthier children, fewer school days lost to illness and 9 10 asthma, a more productive workforce, and a cleaner and more sustainable environment. Environmental justice cannot be achieved, however, simply by 11 12 adopting generalized policies and goals. Instead environmental justice requires 13 an ongoing commitment to identifying existing and potential problems and to 14 finding and applying solutions both in improving specific projects and planning for Moreno Valley has two environmental justice related 15 future development. responsibilities, which are contained in the government code and in the California 16 Environmental Quality Act CEQA. First Government Code Section 1135 17 Subdivision A, Provide a Relevant Part: No person in the State of California shall 18 on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, religion, age, sex, 19 sexual orientation, color, or disability be unlawfully denied full and equal access 20 to the benefits of or be unlawfully subjected to discrimination under any program 21 22 or activity that is conducted, operated, or administered by the state or by any state agency, is funded directly by the state, or receives any financial assistance 23 from the state. While this provision does not include the word environmental 24 25 justice....

26

27 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much.

28

29 **SPEAKER IRMA FLORES** - Thank you.

30

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - We have Roy Bleckert, Joseph Jones, Marisa Gonzalez,
 Christina Torres, Evan Morgan, David Horspool. Striking out over here. Ana
 Cervantes, Robert Perez, Al Braydich, Pedro Hurtado. I'm going for a perfect
 game over here. Mary Lopez, Terri Hall, Jane Peeden. Did you hear your name
 called. Oh, I apologize, as I was going I didn't see anybody move. By all means,
 step to the microphone and introduce yourself please.

37

38 **SPEAKER GABRIEL COLANGELO** - Hi my name is Gabriel Colangelo. I've 39 lived in Moreno Valley for 35 years, and I want to thank all of you for actually taking the time to review this proposal first hand. I believe most of those who 40 were speaking out against it, I don't feel that they have. And I got the gist right 41 away that you guys are an informed group of people. So I'm not going to try and 42 educate you on the project as I feel a lot of people are doing. I feel you probably 43 44 know it better than I do and most of us here. But I just want to communicate that in talking to both sides of this project, or those that don't want it, we all really 45 want the same things. You know, we want better schools. We went high 46

1 property values. We want jobs. We want, for the most part, a better community. So the question is ultimately how are we going to get that better community? I 2 heard Iddo Benzeevi say he wanted to build a job training facility to train people 3 4 for these jobs. Tonight, you know, somebody thought the idea of libraries, so it's kind of what is the better thing for our future? And I think we have a library in 5 Moreno Valley already. I don't think many people go to the school libraries let 6 7 alone that one, but I don't know if that's our hope for the future. I think that it's 8 not bad, it's just I don't think that's where we're at. I mean, we'd all love to have 9 theatre and the arts and museums in Moreno Valley but we're not that. You 10 know, LA is struggling to keep those things open so I mean I think we really need to hear factually some things against this project. We've heard attempted facts. 11 12 I think last weekend that presentation a lot of those things were shut down. I 13 think you guys at the outset said hey let's put out this misnomer right off the bat 14 that this is not a real project and things of that nature. It is and we're still hearing those same things kind of recirculated. So, you know, I think there is this 15 misnomer out there that if one person benefits that other people have to 16 somehow be harmed by that person benefitting. We can all have a mutually 17 beneficial relationship going forward in this City, and so I think the argument 18 that's kind of laid out there is pollution is bad and trucks equal pollution. 19 20 Therefore, the WLC is bad. That is kind of just very simplistic skewed logic, but if not the WLC then what? I heard from Staff but Moreno Valley isn't just 149 out of 21 22 150. It's the second worst in the country. That's a better way of saying it. San Bernardino is the only one worse than us. We're worse than Detroit. What route 23 do we want to go down? You know, we're talking about diesel particulates and 24 25 it's like SeaDoo's at Lake Perris put out more pollution in a few hours than diesel trucks do in a year. You want to know the biggest CO2 contributor? It's cows. If 26 27 you want to go after that, let's take out all these cows that are living in Hemet and polluting our air. So really at the end of the day, I just say I love my city. I know 28 29 you guys are an informed group of people. Educate the Council. I hope they are too. But I would just ask you guys make sure that when they're making this 30 decision that they're making it on the facts. I've seen people click like on the 31 32 video saying it's not real, so just make sure they're educated and we're happy 33 with whatever you decide. 34

- 35 **CHAIR LOWELL** Thank you very much. Please introduce yourself.
- 36

37 SPEAKER EVAN MORGAN - How's it going? My name is Evan Morgan.

- 39 **CHAIR LOWELL** Evan Morgan. Thank you.
- 40

38

41 <u>SPEAKER EVAN MORGAN</u> - I moved here to Moreno Valley in 1993. I was in
 42 the sixth grade.
 43

44 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - You can pull the microphone. It's bendable. There we go.

45

1 **SPEAKER EVAN MORGAN** - Okay, so I moved here in sixth grade in 1993 and when I moved here there was a population of about 120,000 people. I was able 2 to ride my bike in empty fields as far as the eye could see. I lived on Fir Avenue 3 4 by LaSalle and it was all bare valley and then fields; horse properties. I used to go feed the horses, ride around bikes in the dirt fields, and there was nothing. 5 There was no Target. There were no houses. And slowly but surely as I was 6 7 growing up Moreno Valley put in this housing tract and my dirt jumps were gone 8 and the horses were gone. Then they put in this housing tract, and then they put 9 in this housing tract, and then they put in this housing tract and then we got a 10 Walmart and that was about it. We didn't ever expand with jobs to support all these new homes that were going in. And as I left for the army in 2002, right 11 12 after 9/11 happened, there were about 180,000 to 190,000 people living here 13 with no jobs. I had no career path. I basically thought you know the best thing 14 for me to do was join the army, so I did. Luckily, I scored high enough on my ASVAB and I was smart enough that I got into military intelligence and I was 15 trained to look at situations and evaluate them. And a plan isn't just the best idea 16 because you can say oh we're going to go blow up the enemy and kill them all. 17 That's a great plan. That's not really a plan. Just saying this project is terrible 18 we shouldn't do it isn't a plan either. Just saying this isn't the best thing for 19 Moreno Valley we shouldn't do it. That's not a plan. And I don't think that 20 logistics in general would be the best plan for Moreno Valley, but when you look 21 22 at things on paper it's the best realistic plan for Moreno Valley. What else is going to come here? We have more people living here than Temecula does, but 23 we don't have an Apple store. We don't have PF Chang or Cheesecake Factory. 24 25 Why? Because we have a low median household income because there's no iobs. There's no places for people to go, so we need what's realistic and what's 26 feasible and that's this logistics center. And if we don't get it, Riverside is going 27 to. They're already trying to put theirs in and that's exactly why their trying to 28 29 stifle our growth because they're going to be competing for the same companies that want these warehouse spaces, so I just think we should stop letting 30 Riverside politics influence Moreno Valley and just start progressing ourselves. 31 32 Thank you.

- 33
- 34 35

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much. Please introduce yourself.

SPEAKER PEDRO HURTADO - Hi my name is Pedro Hurtado. I'd like to 36 thank you guys for sticking around and listening to the public. I think it's great 37 38 and it takes a lot of patience sometimes. Looking up at the plaque on top of you I 39 see In God We Trust and that's beautiful because in some places that's gone, but just below God is the family and in God's eyes family is very important. And 40 to illustrate this I'm going to read you guys a little story, okay? A man came 41 home from work late tired and irritated to find his 5-year-old son waiting for him at 42 the door. Daddy may I ask you a question? Yeah, sure, what is it replied the 43 44 man. Daddy how much do you make an hour? That's none of your business. Why do you ask such a thing the man said angrily. I just want to know. Please 45 tell me how much you make an hour. If you must know, I make \$20.00 an hour. 46

Oh, the little boy replied with his head down. Looking up he said, Daddy may I 1 please borrow \$10.00. His father was furious. If the only reason you're asking 2 me to borrow money is so you can buy a silly toy or some other nonsense then 3 4 march yourself straight up to your room and go to bed. Think about how you're being selfish. I work hard every day and I drive 65 miles to and from work each 5 day to come home to such childish behavior. The little boy quietly went up to his 6 7 room and shut his door. The man sat down and started to get even angrier about 8 the little boy's question. How dare he ask the question only to get money. After about an hour or so the man calmed down. He started to think maybe there was 9 10 something he really needed to buy with those \$10.00 and really he never really asks for money. The man went up to the door of the little boy's room and opened 11 12 the door. Are you asleep son he asked. No daddy, I'm awake replied the boy. 13 I've been thinking about maybe I was a little too hard on you earlier said the man. It's been a long day and I was stuck in traffic and I took it out on you. all my 14 aggression. Here's the \$10.00 you asked for. The little boy stood up, smiled, 15 and thank you daddy he yelled. Then he reached under his pillow and he pulled 16 out some crumbled bills. The man seeing that the boy already had money 17 started to get angry again. The little boy slowly counted out his money and then 18 he looked up at his father. Why do you want more money his father said if you 19 already have some? Because I didn't have enough but now I do the little boy 20 replied. Daddy I have \$20.00 now. Can I buy an hour of your time? Please 21 22 come home early tomorrow. I would like to have dinner with you.

23 24

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you.

26 **SPEAKER PEDRO HURTADO** - Thank you.

27

25

28 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. Can you please introduce yourself?
 29

SPEAKER TERRI HALL - Good evening Commissioners, I'm Terri Hall. I'm a 30 resident of Moreno Valley. I'm against the WLC project due to the flawed EIR 31 regarding the inaccurate and underestimated Traffic Study, which will have 32 adverse health effects on our city population and the outlying communities as 33 well. The project's Environmental Study estimates the logistics center will draw 34 35 68,721 vehicles per day 14,006 of which would be trucks. During peak commute hours, area roads would see an additional 4532 vehicles in the morning and 36 4941 in the afternoon. The effects will be widespread throughout the Inland 37 38 Empire as far away as Highway 60 through Chino, I-10 through Beaumont and 39 Banning, and 1-215 in San Bernardino. The biggest bottleneck will be at the 60 40 and the 91 Freeways. With the congestion on our freeways, commuters in big rig trucks will overflow to our surface streets such as Moreno Beach, LaSalle, Irish 41 Avenue, Redlands Boulevard, Alessandro, and Theodore. For our neighboring 42 city Riverside, overflow traffic will affect Alessandro, Central Avenue, Arlington 43 44 Avenue, and Redlands would see more traffic on the sections of San Timoteo 45 Canyon. Not only will this project cause a major commuter nightmare and the additional traffic, especially from the diesel trucks, our air quality will greatly be 46

1 affected. The EIR relies on a Rat Study the ARB called inadequate and said 2 should be removed from the entire report. According to the Press Enterprise Dan Greenbaum, the President of Health Effects Institute, said the City's report 3 4 appears to have overstated the studies findings. Particulate air pollution not only causes increased deaths due to asthma and respiratory conditions, but very 5 small particulates get absorbed into the bloodstream causing heart attacks, 6 7 strokes, and cancer. Air pollution related mortalities shorten the average victim's 8 lifespan by 12 years. Approximately 7,000 Californians dies each year from 9 particulate air pollution, more than twice the number killed in car accidents. The 10 American Lung Association stated the Air Report shows that our community has received straight F's in all our air quality measures and has some of the worse air 11 12 quality in the nation. So why would you approve a project that has the potential 13 to shorten the life expectancy of every citizen? Lastly, if given a choice, would 14 you live next door to 40 million square feet of warehouse? I bet not, so why are 15 you forcing me to? Thank you.

- 1617 CHAIR LOWELL Thank you.
- 19 **SPEAKER ANA CERVANTES** Hi I got called, but I wasn't here.
- 2021 CHAIR LOWELL What was your name?
- 23 **SPEAKER ANA CERVANTES** My name is Ana Cervantes.
- 24 25

22

18

CHAIR LOWELL - Yeah by all means.

26 27 **SPEAKER ANA CERVANTES** - So I want to start off by saying what is Moreno Valley? Moreno Valley for me is a great place to start and build opportunities for 28 29 the local residents that want to be employed, successful, and make the city bloom where it will be financially stable and create city tax revenue. I personally 30 believe that there is still hope for Moreno Valley and the people that are against it 31 if they don't agree they can move elsewhere because I know that there's....I can 32 33 see the vision, you know, that the city is going to give birth to a lot of things that's 34 going to change the city positive. Thank you for your time.

35

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much. Let me recap the last few names that 36 we called that haven't shown up yet. We have Peggy Hadaway, Roy Bleckert, 37 38 Joseph Jones, Marisa Gonzalez. We have Christina Torres, David Horspool. If 39 you hear your name by all means make some noise or waves your arms up so that I see you. Robert Perez, Al Braydich, Mary Lopez. We have Jane Peeden. 40 We have Vivi Peeden. So far I'm striking out. We have Tom Behrens. We have 41 Milly Bailey. We have Kevin Tsang. I think we have a winner. Please introduce 42 43 yourself.

44

45 <u>SPEAKER MILLY BAILEY</u> - My name is Milly Bailey. I do work for Highland
 46 Fairview, but I'm representing myself as a resident here for over 11 years. Okay

1 our motto in Moreno Valley is people, pride, progress. So the WLC will bring progress and pride to the people because of a better Moreno Valley. Whether or 2 not Moreno Valley residents are employed by the WLC, Moreno Valley as a city 3 4 will benefit from the revenue from the industries within the World Logistics Center. So schools/colleges, the fire and police department, our local parks, and 5 our residents will benefit from the revenue collected through the WLC. The fiscal 6 7 budget for 2015 through 2017 shows that 4000 jobs have been created since 8 2013 but yet Moreno Valley as a city and its residents are still struggling. This is because the 4000 jobs that were created were minimum wage jobs that did not 9 10 produce living wages for a teen let alone a family. The World Logistics Center will provide entry-level positions in logistics jobs starting pay of \$25.63 an hour. 11 12 That's just for an AA degree or not. You don't even have to have a degree to be 13 a logistics worker. The World Logistics Center will provide more opportunities 14 than the jobs that were provided in 2013. There will be more opportunities for Moreno Valley if less residents were ignorant about researching and read the 15 Press Enterprise and believing those lies. With the construction of the World 16 Logistics Center lasting for 15 to 25 years, this will definitely mean the 17 construction workers, truck drivers, plumbers and etc., will have work within 18 those 15 to 25 years of construction. One job is better than no job. A career is 19 just a job that you are passionate about, so when people say that these aren't 20 careers they're just jobs that's representing stupidity because they are one in the 21 22 same. It's just a career is something you're passionate about, which is still a job. So I say yes to career. I say yes to jobs. I say yes to progress and I say yes to 23 the World Logistics Center. There is no pollution from the trucks. There's more 24 25 pollution coming from the anti's mouth than the dated trucks. They will be traveling on their own truck routes, so you don't have to take the San Timoteo 26 Canyon because it's not your car route. Okay there is less water usage for this 27 project than City Hall uses daily. The only thing the anti's are made about is they 28 do not qualify for any logistics positions. Because they are unable to research 29 the truth. I know they are unable to pass the logistics class. That's it. 30

31

32 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. Let me recap a couple more names. We have
 33 Mary Lopez, Jane Peeden, Vivi Peeden, Tom Behrens, Kevin Tsang, Enrique
 34 Marin, Allan Smiley.

35

SPEAKER ALLAN SMILEY - Thank you it was a long wait. In reviewing the 36 various documents and reports, I find that there is a gross misrepresentation and 37 38 a lack of true study that will impact the use of Cactus Avenue and will have 39 disastrous effects on all of Moreno Valley not just the East. This is not an East versus the West. This is a problem for Moreno Valley altogether. The report 40 totally understates the vehicle impact, the smog conditions, and the dangers to 41 the health and well being of not only those who live either on Cactus Avenue or 42 those within in the proximity of Cactus Avenue. From what I have read, there is a 43 44 proposal that Cactus Avenue would extend from the 215 to the end of Cactus past Redlands Avenue and JFK. The amount of traffic measured in reports just 45 approximately a few hundred vehicle trips a day, but that is only from the corners 46

1 of JFK and Cactus Avenue not for the entire traveling vehicles on Cactus. The amount of traffic does not take into consideration that would extend through the 2 City of Moreno Valley starting at the 215 exit to the Cactus Avenue Extension 3 4 onward to the logistics center. The amount of vehicle traffic amounts to thousands and thousands of trips daily with the majority of the vehicles being 5 trucks and thousands of employees of the logistics center. The majority of these 6 7 trucks will not meet standards of the 2010 as stated in the report because they 8 are independent vehicles. They are independent contractors not people who work or our own trucks at the logistics center. Therefore, the 2010 standard is of 9 10 no use. It's only a 30 day measurement on one particular animal a rat. Okay? The 2010 standard for diesel trucks would be impossible to impose on all 11 12 truckers, especially out of state truckers. No out of state trucker is going to try to 13 meet 2010 emission standards. They will have a lot of other places to go. 14 Therefore, the logistics center would have a great deal of trouble getting any materials delivered. Okay? Also the City has a problem enforcing the no truck 15 over 5 ton zone on the various city streets now. With that said, trucks would be 16 exiting Cactus Avenue and since Cactus Avenue would be jammed they will look 17 for other sources and other routes to take. That means trucks are going to 18 19 expand all through Moreno Valley, the center, the East, the West, and we are going to have pollution everywhere not just on the logistics center. Air quality 20 would be detrimental to all residents. Everyone's talking about the future of 21 22 children. What good is the future of the children if we have to have them 23 hospitalized all the time either from emphysema, leukemia and other particulates causing other dangerous health hazards. This study is really invalid and needs 24 to be reconsidered. 25

26

27 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much.

28

31

33

29 <u>SPEAKER ALLAN SMILEY</u> - Sure one matter first to report. Mr. Benzeevi will
 30 stop talking about monuments.

- 32 **CHAIR LOWELL** Time Sir. That's all of your time. Thank you very much.
- 34 **SPEAKER ALLAN SMILEY** This is ours.
- 35
- 36 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Please introduce yourself.
- 37

38 **SPEAKER ADRIAN MARTINEZ** - Good evening. My name is Adrian Martinez and I'm an attorney for Justice. Thank you for allowing me to speak tonight. I 39 want to address a few issues. CEQA is clear in its requirements. It requires that 40 the impacts from the project be articulated in a reasonable and accurate way. It 41 requires that you explore alternatives and it requires that you mitigate the 42 impacts. The Environmental Impact Report before you today fails on all three. It 43 44 must be recirculated. Whether you agree with this project or not, it's your duty to make sure that the analysis is accurate and allows the public to make an 45 informed decision. I want to address a couple of issues. There was a lot of 46

1 discussion from prior speakers about zero emission trucks coming from the ports of LA and Long Beach. I want to be clear. This project assumes that there aren't 2 many trucks coming from the ports of LA and Long Beach. It doesn't explain 3 4 where these trucks are going to come from. It doesn't explain if they are going to have these advanced technologies. The ports of LA and Long Beach don't even 5 have a program to achieve zero emission trucks yet. You can't assume that. 6 7 The project needs more mitigation. Letters have shown that there is feasible 8 mitigation that can minimize the air pollution impacts. You shouldn't be duped by the various commenter's articulating that these diesel trucks aren't dangerous. 9 10 They are, especially when you accumulate so many in one community along one road. It's important that the EIR take account of that and mitigate those impacts. 11 12 We have the worst air quality in the nation and we need projects like this, which 13 would be one of the largest projects in the nation attracting thousands of diesel 14 trucks to take responsibility for the impact. I want to address the climate change impacts. There was some discussion on we should focus on cows in Hemet and 15 other places. I just want to be clear this is going to be one of the largest 16 greenhouse gas emitters in the state. It'll be the third largest in Riverside County 17 if it were its own stationary source and that's despite what we think is a reduced 18 19 analysis that undermines the greenhouse gas impacts. It doesn't take into account these impacts. It doesn't provide mitigation. Instead it relies on a bogus 20 theory that projects don't need to account for vehicle miles traveled and 21 22 associated greenhouse gases. That's absurd. It's not substantiated by the California Environmental Quality Act. 23 It is not substantiated by California precedent. You cannot ignore these impacts. Under this assumption, there 24 would be no project that has any vehicle trips associated that require to identify 25 significant impacts from vehicles or mitigated. It's a terrible precedent to make. 26 27 Once again, I encourage you to recirculate this EIR. There's a lot of analysis that needs to be redone before it can fully inform you. 28

29

30 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Recapping a couple of names. We
 31 have Kevin Tsang, Enrique Marin. We have Robert Lowell. We have Brent
 32 Whitehead. We called your name a little bit earlier Tom so you're going to have
 33 to wait until we circulate again. By all means, come to the podium.

34

35 **BRENT WHITEHEAD** - My name is Brent Whitehead. I'm going to do something different here. I've heard nobody come up with what I want to ask 36 37 about and I think it's absolutely the most important thing before you guys 38 recommend anything to a City Council that's already decided to go for the 39 project. Is this better? Okay. Nobody has addressed the Badlands because it's out of your purview. You guys aren't responsible for the Badlands, but if you put 40 forward this program I hear lots of things positive and negative about it. I haven't 41 made a decision. Right now, I'm kind of like hold it up. You don't have to vote 42 now. There is no hurry. Who is going to fix the Badlands because you have to 43 44 have that fixed before you can institute this program and you have no idea if it's going to be done or not. It's up to Caltrans, the county, and whoever or whatever 45 entities there are. You don't know what their going to do. You don't know if their 46

going to allocate for this project. Their looking at a lot of them, so why would you
 recommend going forward now when you don't know if it's even possible. The
 rest of my three minutes is to you. Please explain.

4

6

5 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Thank you very much.

SPEAKER BRENT WHITEHEAD - By the way, I was told by people here that
 you would not respond.

9

10 **CHAIR LOWELL** - This isn't the time for us to respond. We're hearing Public 11 Comment. We're taking notes of everybody's questions and we'll.....

12

13 **SPEAKER BRENT WHITEHEAD** - Okay my comments are if you go forward, if 14 this City Council votes on this, you're voting for something that is a pie in the sky because if that doesn't happen over there you don't have a place for these 15 trucks. I don't care if there's 20,000 or 5000. I don't care if there's 20,000 jobs, 16 which there won't be, but it doesn't matter what I think on all that because there's 17 no project if there's no way to go and the freight goes east. All these other 18 concerns people have. All these things are for. People are up here just for 19 emotional issues. They want to vent. Those that want to cheer and boo gets us 20 nowhere. You've got to have a route to get this stuff out of town and right now 21 22 you don't and you don't know there will be one. So it makes no sense chronologic, there's nothing. How can you go forward right now and vote on a 23 project that's going to have many changes after you vote anyway? Why not wait 24 25 to vote until you have more information and you know you got a road to travel on. I live in Riverside. I used to live on the East End of town. 26

- 27
- 28 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Keep it down please. We're listening to him.
- 29
- 30 SPEAKER BRENT WHITEHEAD It'd be nice if all adults could be adults.
 31 Anyway I'm not saying yay for the project and I'm not saying nay.
 32

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Please keep it down. Thank you. This is not a second grade
 class. My second grader has a better attitude than you. Please knock it off. We
 do have bailiffs and I am not afraid to use them. I will give you extra time.

- 37 **SPEAKER BRENT WHITEHEAD** The time I've lost?
- 37 38

36

- 39 **CHAIR LOWELL** I will give you back the time.
- 40

41 SPEAKER BRENT WHITEHEAD - Thank you. I do live in Riverside. We are 42 going to be impacted there too. This isn't all about Moreno Valley. But I lived out 43 here. I have concerns about this town even though I no longer live here. I lived 44 on the East End. I know the impact. I know people worried about values and 45 their views. I had a wonderful view when I lived here. I no longer live here. I 46 have driven around today looking at this town. I drove out on the East End and

1 looked all around. I sat at Skechers for awhile. I saw four trucks leave Skechers. 2 They didn't say Skechers. Everybody things a Skechers truck says Skechers. Huh-uh. They're freight movers, so trucks do move during the day. I'm not here 3 to prove you wrong, I'm just looking at common sense. Trucks move. When you 4 have that many more trucks, you're going to have congestion like one gentleman 5 said night and day. That makes total sense. Whether or not it's projected, it 6 7 makes sense. Twenty thousand jobs. I ran warehouses. I ran over 1.2 million 8 square feet at one place. Truckers find the places to go of least resistance just 9 like water. Cactus, everybody is worried about Cactus, Cactus, Cactus, 10 understand but it'll get bad but it'll also slow back down because those truckers won't keep going that way, they'll go other routes. They'll also get off streets and 11 12 drive on Sunnymead and other streets in your town....

13

15

18

24

14 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Thank you very much.

SPEAKER BRENT WHITEHEAD - There isn't anywhere they can't necessarily
 go.

19 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Okay so we have Kevin Tsang. We 20 have Enrique Marin. We have Robert Lowell. That was Brent Whitehead. Who 21 else do we have? We have Stephen Medina, John Sims. Maribel Sandoval 22 sounds like a name we already heard. Please approach. Introduce yourself 23 please.

SPEAKER ROBERT LOWELL - Good evening Mr. Chairman and Planning 25 Commission, I'm Robert Lowell. I've been a resident of this area since 1982 26 27 when I came back to from the air force. Before it was Moreno Valley, it was Sunnymead, then Moreno and Edgemont. When Moreno Valley was finally able 28 29 to incorporate itself after three or four unsuccessful attempts, it predicated its existence on the huge influx of cash from March Air Force Base, which 30 sometimes employed upwards of 15,000 people both military and civilian. So it 31 32 was designed as a bedroom community not needing to have the industry and the 33 economic sources that you'd expect from a regular city. Unfortunately, this 34 source of revenue has dried up. With the end of the Cold War, March has shrunk 35 down from an air force base to a reserve base; weekend warriors. So we need this World Logistics Center. We need something to replace the influx of capital 36 from the base that has now been taken away from us. That is why we need this 37 38 World Logistics Center. We need to have a place for economic growth, 39 economic development, and stimulation of this town so we can stand proudly and say Moreno Valley here we are. We are an economic powerhouse. 40 The pollution I don't think is going to be a problem. It's not going to exist because 41 these trucks are going to be required by federal mandate to address their 42 pollution. Everywhere you look, you see the exhaust filters and the catalytic 43 convertors that are self cleaning. The traffic it'll happen. But think of the days 44 back in the 80s and such when they had the B52's and their smoky J-57 engines, 45 and we had the KC-135's and their smoky engines. And the particulate that 46

created, it was enormous. When I first got here, you couldn't see Box Springs Mountain on most days because of the terrible, terrible smog. We've cleaned it up. We've cleaned it up hugely. I think this will continue to be an action that will clean up any fears of this World Logistics Center. So I urge you to approve this plan, put this center on the map, put Moreno Valley on the map with a firm financial foundation. Thank you.

7 8

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you.

9 10 **SPEAKER STEPHEN MEDINA** - Hi my name is Stephen Medina and I just want to thank you guys for hearing me this afternoon. First of all, Brent 11 12 remember me? How you doing? Brent's a good guy, alright. He's a good guy. 13 It's just ironic that I see him here. Unfortunately, we're on both sides of the 14 fence, okay? I just want to share that first of all I was educated by the World Logistics Center in their meetings. I did some research personally, and I just 15 came to a personal decision given that I came from Los Angeles... go Dodgers. 16 We're doing okay, and I believe and we have faith we're going to pull it out this 17 year. Unfortunately, I came from LA and I knew that there was going to be 18 difficulty getting work. I'm self employed. I'm the guy that you hire to remodel 19 your house. I'm the guy that goes in and repairs your homes. I'm the guy that 20 travels everywhere from Corona, Rancho Cucamonga, Temecula. I'm like all 21 22 over and the two depressed areas that I see are San Bernardino and unfortunately parts of Riverside, i.e., Moreno Valley. I really strongly believe 23 even though there might be a lot of naysayers. There might be a lot of things 24 25 going on. This is something that is needed and it's needed now. My wife and I came here years ago. My wife and I wanted to start a high-end beauty salon 26 27 business. She came from Orange County and we wanted to start something like We couldn't because we did our research and we looked at the 28 that. 29 infrastructure of the city and we said people aren't going to be able to afford \$200.00 and \$300.00 hairdos and we weren't going to make any money so we 30 just left it. So I started with the construction business. So I've seen a lot of 31 changes in Moreno Valley and I just want to encourage that all the folks that you 32 see here have been well educated in the environment and the environmental 33 34 impact it's going to have. We've been educated on the world impact we're going 35 to have as far as the income coming in. We've been educated on how the impact is going to help the lower to middle income people. I work in homes from 36 HUD homes all the way to million dollar homes and I see the depressed areas. 37 38 This is the time when we will be able to help the community. As a matter of fact, 39 today on a personal level we went out and did some outreach at a lower area 40 income area in Moreno Valley to bring some good news and to do some cheerful work in outreach. This is my heart. This is how my wife and I feel about this 41 community, and there's a lot of other people here that feel the same way so I 42 believe this is an opportunity for the City of Moreno Valley to yes become a 43 44 landmark in Riverside County in Southern California and even throughout the rest of the country. Let's make Moreno Valley a place that is recognized on the 45

1 map economically, environmentally, and also businesswise for the rest of the 2 taxpayers here.

3

4 <u>**CHAIR LOWELL**</u> - Thank you very much. John Sims. Is John Sims in the 5 audience today? He filled out a Speaker Slip tonight, but I don't see him waving 6 his hands. Maribel Sandoval you already had your chance to speak today. You 7 spoke earlier, so you don't get two times at the podium today. Kara Billings 8 followed by Liza Digalizea and Susan Lansang.

9

10 **SPEAKER KARA BILLINGS** - Hi. A lot of people here have been talking about the children, the children and it's always been sort of a theoretical concept but I 11 12 am one of those children. I grew up here. I was born in Riverside. I've lived in 13 Moreno Valley my entire life. Now I'm in college and I'm a couple years away 14 from graduation. I mean you guys have heard a lot of the pros and cons, environmental, traffic, even employment about the World Logistics Center and I 15 would really like those concerns to be resolved. But I'm also concerned that the 16 City is becoming a warehouse city, which on one hand yes it's bringing in jobs 17 but a healthy community needs a wide spectrum of jobs and I don't think that's 18 19 what we're heading towards. Sure we have a lot of warehouse jobs, but I think that a lot of the future and a lot of people in my generation agree with me is in 20 healthcare, technology. That's more of a future than perhaps logistics or at least 21 22 we need to see more representation for that. And I just would like to see the City focus more on bringing in a wide variety of other kinds of jobs that maybe pay 23 more, have a wide variety of benefits, and can actually provide a livable wage. 24

25

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. We have Liza Digalizea. I hope I'm pronouncing
 that correctly. We have Susan Lansang, Conrado Lansang, Edward Pauw, Gary
 Hayes, Alice Hayes. What was your name, Sir? Thank you.

29

SPEAKER EDWARD PAUW - I'm representing the Pauw property that is up on 30 Theodore Street right near the Water District. It's adjacent to the side with the 31 Water District, and we're right on Theodore Street and near the 60. I just wanted 32 to point out some concerns we had about the project just because we would like 33 34 to be able to utilize our property and participate in what's going on in a 35 meaningful way, so we just had some concerns we wanted to mention. There are four things that are primary in our mind and one of those is that Street B cuts 36 through our property and slices it in two portions, a southern portion which we 37 38 can't use in any way and then a northern portion. We're zoned projected for 39 logistics development, which would call for 500,000 square feet, so if you cut it in half the northern portion you can't use to put that size of building on it. Then the 40 other thing is, if the Water District wants to stay outside of the plan, then how 41 would we fit in with logistics support? We would like to have some opportunity to 42 be assured of being able to participate in what's going on. Then also the plan 43 44 calls for putting a water pump station right on our property right along Theodore Street so that impacts our ability to use it and the siting of the property. Then 45 actually we're in two different development areas, six and eight, so that's another 46

1 issue. Then we're slated for phase two, which puts us out about seven years I 2 guess on the short end, so we are concerned about not being able to have some productive use you know just having to wait for some length of time. And we'd 3 4 like to talk to someone in the City about these concerns and then point out these things and also talk about how we can be accommodated in some way so we 5 have a larger number of uses and try to address these deleterious impacts to our 6 7 property and we see really it's probably an oversight in the whole process 8 because our acreage is less than 1% of the overall plan. It's 17 acres and so we 9 just want to be able to talk with the City and to be able to work through these 10 concerns that we have so that we can participate in a meaningful way in the project. Then we'd like to see things go ahead and go well for the City of Moreno 11 12 Valley with development, and so we want to be able to express our concerns and be able to meet with someone in the City. Thank you. 13

14

18

22

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you. We have Gary Hayes. We have Alice Hayes. 15 Regina Brockmueller, Pearlie Sims. We have Deborah Foots. If I called your 16 name, please come up to the podium. What was your name, Ma'am? 17

- 19 **SPEAKER REGINA BROCKMUELLER** - I'll go into that.
- 20 21 CHAIR LOWELL - Okay.

23 SPEAKER REGINA BROCKMUELLER - I have the unfortunate temptation in a short speech to try and cram everything I want to say to a three and five minute 24 25 timeframe. However, I recognize that I have to make my speech sweet and to the point. My first point is visionary, mainly my three to five points, mostly three 26 27 points....

- 28
- 29 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Can you please let me know your name?
- 30
- SPEAKER REGINA BROCKMUELLER Ha-ha. My name is Dr. Regina 31 32 Brockmueller.
- 33

34 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you.

35 SPEAKER REGINA BROCKMUELLER - Commonly known as Dr. B. I moved 36 away from the beach area over 30 years ago and sold my home which is the last 37 38 home located north of Home Depot on Fay Avenue. My Council Representative 39 was Bonnie Flickinger. I have plenty of reasons I decided to raise my family and 40 children in this area. One of the main reasons was I had an hour away from the beach and sand, mountains to ski, and an hour away from the airports. Visionary 41 just a brief history of our world, especially towns like San Francisco my first point, 42 self proclaimed Emperor Norton, was celebrating highly eccentric citizens in San 43 44 Francisco to the first decree suspension bridge that could be constructed to connect Oakland to San Francisco. They had to decree, but I'm not going to go 45 into that. I'm going to tell you that we are neglecting a population of 195,000 46

1 people. Why do we allow too few to pitch in their bitch or empty their feelings and words without looking into the servant of the visionary person much like our 2 own. Although Emperor Norton decreed to build a bridge that was widespread 3 4 with public and political appeal, the task was too much of an engineering and economical challenge at the time. Iddo Benzeevi is much like our previous 5 emperor, which I will discuss with you at another time. But the demands for the 6 7 community is bigger city. Demands for the bridge, which was the result of 8 economical social changes. Kevin Costner was a friend of my partner played 9 Farmer Ray Casella. When Farmer Ray heard a mysterious voice one night of his vision he felt like he needed to act. Despite Thompson listening, Ray built 10 Diamond Bar on his land supported by his wife Ann. Julius, Joe Jackson let it, 11 12 but Ray learned that his field of dreams was much more than bringing in former 13 baseball greats that played out to the bridge. Anyway, I'm not going to go into 14 that. As Ray did follow his dreams and people will come as Iddo Benzeevi will. Benzeevi is a visionary person who has settled down in any other city whose 15 already started to intend. 16

17

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. Calling Gary Hayes again. Alice
 Hayes. We have Pearlie Sims, Deborah Foots, Vernon White, Rosa Martinez,
 Margarita Espanza, Marina Smiley. Can you please introduce yourself?

21

22 **SPEAKER MARINA SMILEY** - My name is Marina. I'm a Moreno Valley resident, and I'm very proud to be an American. I came to this country from the 23 most dictatorship country in the world where 85% of people brainwashed and 24 that's why it's so painful for me to watch what is going on here. I have to admit 25 that the presentation of the logistics center was a piece of art. It was art of 26 27 manipulation and the masterpiece of brainwashing. The developer told us that the giant logistics center will be able to save us billions gallons of water, but he 28 29 never told us how many trillion gallons of water will be taken of our area. Fish already are severely suffering from the lack of water, so never mind Mr. 30 Developer how much the logistics center is going to save. We want to know how 31 much is going to use. Manipulation #2: Next we were shown the loveable 32 33 picture of the empty 60 Freeway ready to accept 14,000 trucks daily. I don't know anyone in Moreno Valley who ever sees this freeway empty. 34 The 35 developer is the only person who was able to see it. Even now, if you want to drive somewhere you are usually stuck in traffic of so-called empty freeways. I 36 want the developer to explain how in the world we'll be able to drive anywhere 37 38 with an additional 14,000 trucks. Really, on this narrow freeway? Manipulation 39 #3: Now let's discuss why has the developer razzle-dazzled us with the pictures of Paris and Sydney but didn't tell anything about Cactus Avenue that he plans to 40 turn it into a highway. Do you know why? Because he didn't want to spoil the 41 party by revealing his secret plan of connecting the logistics center to Cactus 42 Avenue. Now all of Moreno Valley, including school, nursing homes, and the 43 44 senior citizen communities are going to suffer not only from the diesel cloud of 14,000 trucks but additionally from the pollution and noise created by 45 approximately 20,000 cars and trucks in place traveling from 215 Freeway along 46

1 Cactus or any other streets of their choice in order to escape traffic on Cactus 2 Avenue and jammed freeway. Good job. The developer wants to make a living, 3 but his living is going to kill us. It seems to me that the developer owns Moreno 4 Valley that is why we the people of Moreno Valley demand a full investigation of 5 this proposed disaster. We, the people of Moreno Valley, demand to eliminate 6 any effort....

- 8 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Thank you very much.
- 10 **SPEAKER MARINA SMILEY** To turn Cactus into highway....
- 11 12

13

15

7

9

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you.

14 **SPEAKER MARINA SMILEY** - And connect it to the.....

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you. What was your name again Ma'am? I couldn't 16 understand. Smiley thank you. That's enough, that's enough. Thank you very 17 much. Thank you. That's enough also from you, Sir. We have Margarita 18 Espanza. We have Rosa Martinez, Alex Morales, Juan Aragones. I don't see 19 anybody making any noise. William Bustos, Eudoro Wuence, Andrew Guillon, 20 Santiago Hernandez. If you hear your name just put your hand up so I can see 21 22 you guys. Please make your way up towards the podium. Please introduce 23 yourself.

24

25 **S**

SPEAKER ANDREW GUILLON - Yes my name is Andrew Guillon.

- 27 **CHAIR LOWELL** Thank you.
- 28

26

29 **SPEAKER ANDREW GUILLON** - You know, I'm not here to quarrel and yell and say stuff to other people. I'm not naive. I live on the East End and I'm not naïve. 30 I know it's going to get built up out there. You know, what do we want? Do we 31 want that big logistics center? Housing is okay with me. I don't mind more 32 housing. Of course I'd like to keep it empty. Who wouldn't? I'm in construction. 33 34 I'm Local 12. If building gets done there, I could probably even walk to work. But I came here in 1989 with my kids. They grew up here in Moreno Valley, and they 35 like it out here. They hated the congestion in Orange County and believe me 36 there's a lot. I've been going there ever since back and forth. There's a lot of 37 38 congestion in Orange County. There are more warehouses near my mom's 39 house. That gets more crowded. I'm not saying it's a mess because the weather is nice; much nicer than here. I just don't know if I would like that there. I mean I 40 know the jobs might be there. You talk about 20,000 jobs or 13,000 jobs. I work 41 with Stantec. Keith Companies used to have a building here. We had an office 42 here in Moreno Valley, and we moved three times and all those people moved to 43 44 a new building. We never hired anybody else from that existing city. We just moved the whole thing lock, stock, and barrel. So that's all I want to say. I like 45 the open land out there. I know the people on the West side they don't care 46

because they don't live over there, but I like going down to the little post office to the eastern market over there. But, like I said, I'm not naïve knowing that it's going to stay empty forever; maybe housing, something that's less impactful like housing because people are going to need a place to live. I moved our here from Orange County so and this is where I moved. That's all I have to say.

7 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Are you for or against? There was kind of mixed emotions 8 there.

10 **SPEAKER ANDREW GUILLON** - I'm against it.

11

13

15

9

6

12 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Thank you, Sir.

14 **SPEAKER ANDREW GUILLON** - Thank you.

16 **SPEAKER SANTIAGO HERNANDEZ** - Good evening Commissioners.

17

19

18 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Could you please introduce yourself also?

20 **SPEAKER SANTIAGO HERNANDEZ** - My name is Santiago Hernandez and I'm a dental technician. I make dentures for the community, and I have lived in 21 22 Moreno Valley since 1993. When I just moved here, I used to commute to LA then I commuted to Orange County and then I commuted to Rancho 23 Cucamonga. I tell these people that are against this great.... I know it's a great 24 25 project, the World Logistics Center. I told these people that are against them why they offered to ask the community to the people of Moreno Valley if they 26 offer a better project I vote for them for anyone who has the money or has 27 anything to do the same thing that Iddo Benzeevi is doing for the community. 28 29 Okay, so I'm in favor of the project because they are going to bring a lot of opportunities for us to get a better life here. If I don't support this project, who is 30 going to support it? My grandchild? My son is already commuting to Anaheim, 31 so all our children/grandchildren, they are going to commute to other 32 33 counties/other cities. Think about it. You have the opportunity to be in the 34 history of Moreno Valley, so say yes, yes, yes to the project please.

35 36

37

39

CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much.

- 38 **SPEAKER EUDORO WUENCE** Good evening.
- 40 **CHAIR LOWELL** Good evening. One second. What was your name, Sir?
- 41
- 42 <u>SPEAKER EUDORO WUENCE</u> Eudoro Wuence.
 43
- 44 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Okay and after you we have Brianna Bracken. We have
 45 Emily Mora, and Julissa Wuence. Thank you, Sir.

46

SPEAKER EUDORO WUENCE - Yes, Sir. I'm in support of the World Logistics 1 Center and I'm curious about pollution traffic. When we see one truck on the 2 freeway, we see 20 cars or 40 cars on the freeway, so I don't think the trucks do 3 4 the pollution. The trucks are going from one point to another point, so that's the point of the trucks. So I don't think the trucks do the pollution because they are 5 sent from one point to another. The traffic is make it to the cars and the logistics 6 7 center sometimes is when they you know some people say 20,000 jobs come 8 from when they start building the project. They start building the gravel, sand, all this stuff they need. Thus when they start working people will benefit. A lot of 9 10 people are going to start....when they start bringing the sand and gravel we are going to start bringing revenue, taxes to the City, and the City is going to benefit 11 12 from this project. They are going to start building better schools, better buses, 13 better police cars, better fire departments; all this stuff. That's what we need to 14 secure our community. That's why we need these kind of projects here because we need something better for our city. We don't need another Walmart. Walmart 15 is everywhere. The Walmart is a benefit to the rich people too. Why don't we 16 benefit from this project here? Why do we have to vote for this kind of project? 17 Why we don't vote for Walmart and another Walmart over there and another 18 19 Costco building here? Why? We do we have to vote for this and why not for 20 Walmart? That's all I have to say.

21

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. So we have Alex Morales. We have Juan
 Aragones. We have William Bustos, Brianna Bracken, Emily Mora, Julissa
 Wuence. I see a bunch of people moving. Their just walking out the door. False
 hope. Anybody else? Do I have Izabella Perez, Anthony Beaumont, Jim Bryant?
 Anybody's names? Moving on. Consuelo Limon.

27

31

33

28 SPEAKER JIM BRYANT - I'm Jim Bryant.
 29

- 30 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Jim Bryant, perfect. Come on up.
- 32 **SPEAKER JIM BRYANT** Okay one thing about the.
- 34 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> You can pull the microphone a little closer to you. It's hard to
 35 hear.
- 36
- 37 SPEAKER JIM BRYANT Is this better?
- 39 **CHAIR LOWELL** Perfect, thank you.
- 40

38

41 <u>SPEAKER JIM BRYANT</u> - Okay one thing I was here for the presentation by Mr. 42 Benzeevi and he puts on a good picture show. All the things that he stated in 43 that that automation was the way of the future. Most of the people in here are 44 blue collar workers. They won't have jobs. When he put in Skechers, I was 45 against that one too. He was going to promise 1500 jobs, and I think we got one 46 out of Moreno Valley or 110 people got laid off in Ontario and 600 came out here

1 to man this station. He's talking 2000 jobs. He is underproducing. He couldn't come up with 1500 then. With automation, even in his pictures, it shows all these 2 guys working, welders. Then all of a sudden you see the new plant, and it's all 3 4 machines. But he is a good talker. Okay on trucks, I was unfortunate when they tore out the bridge and the birds decided to park there and they couldn't work on 5 it the trucks were coming down and going down Alessandro. They said that 6 7 vehicle traffic will be nothing. Every eight minutes, I had at least one semi going 8 by and these were empties going back to Pedro. And, at times, there were two and three semi's going by. It was like a mini earthquake, so there are trucks out 9 10 there and they are moving. And that's going west not east. Then they got smart after about two months and opened up their back gate, so they got out of the 11 12 residential area. He talks about construction jobs in the area. The construction, 13 the two warehouses we have now, the superintendent I know him. He is out of 14 Arizona. We're not even getting California people working out here, so there goes your big mound of money for construction of these units. And the one that 15 the warehouse is there now, the new one going in, is also an Arizona company 16 that's doing it. I'd like to have you check into who is going to be putting in all 17 these street lights. We're getting four right now, big ones. Roads are going to 18 19 have to widen for the trucks to make the turns. Who is paying for all this? I don't like it coming out of my paycheck. There's sidewalks, sewers, all that type of 20 good stuff and the City is going to have to come up with the money to foot that. 21 22 They should be saying thank you and do it themselves or pay for them. Again, like I said, automation takes jobs away. It doesn't produce jobs. Most of the 23 people that are here, like I said, the ones that are holding up their little signs that 24 25 went to work. They won't be here for a long time and there won't be any blue collar. It will all be machinery and computers. 26

- 27
- 28 CHAIR LOWELL Thank you very much.
- 29

31

30 **SPEAKER JIM BRYANT** - That's all I got.

32 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - So we have Consuelo Limon, Roberto Martinez, Louis
 33 Vasquez, William Klauck. We also have Manuel Aguiar, Regina Haynesworth.

- 34
 35 SPEAKER WILLIAM KLAUCK My name is William Klauck.
- 36

37 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you.
38

SPEAKER WILLIAM KLAUCK - First of all, I caution the City Council that even 39 though there may seem to be a majority in favor of this project being a mature 40 adult after sitting amongst them today and sitting amongst the proponents to this 41 project today and hearing their murmurs and disrespect for the opponents I hear 42 the immaturity of a 13-year-old. So I ask if you would want a 13-year-old 43 determining what your City is going to do. Secondly, I've heard the word change 44 thrown around quite a bit by some proponents of this project, but as we have 45 learned from our current federal administration change does not necessarily 46

1 mean improvement and change without improvement is simply destruction. Considering the matter of the apparent compulsion to push through the World 2 Logistics Center at pretty much any cost, I question whether some of our 3 4 representation has the best interest of the people of Moreno Valley in mind. There are far too many questions still unanswered, or I should say unwilling to be 5 answered about this proposed project and those that have been answered 6 7 cautioned about pollution, traffic congestion, lowered property values, safety 8 issues, and the general lowering of the quality of life, especially on the East side have been argued by the opinions of those in favor of the project rather than by 9 10 any actual facts. Do we really think that the 20,000 jobs total by this projects proponents will be new employment opportunities or is the reality that 14,000 of 11 12 these jobs will come from the additional truckers inundating our town on a daily 13 basis who already have jobs combined with the 5000 construction workers to 14 build the project who also already have jobs and that only about 1000 at best jobs would be left as permanent employment opportunities for Moreno Valley 15 residents, if that many. And how about the 14,000 trucks added to our streets 16 and freeways every day, 98,000 every week, 420,000 every month, and 17 5,040,000 every year? Do we really think these truckers will be polite and 18 professional enough to travel out the normally congested Highway 60 to 19 20 Theodore or will Iris, Cactus, Alessandro, Eucalyptus, and all other East/West 21 corridors be inundated with truck drivers who have better ideas for getting across 22 town? I have a lot left to say. I may come back.

23

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. We have Manuel Aguiar, Regina
 Haynesworth, Danny Workman. These were all people that signed up this
 afternoon. They should be here. We have Ian MacMillan, Jorge Gonzalez,
 Alondra Gonzalez, and Miguel Gutierrez. Please introduce yourself, Sir.

28

SPEAKER IAN MACMILLAN - Honorable Commissioners my name is lan 29 MacMillan and I'm a Planning and Rules Manager with the South Coast Air 30 Quality Management District. We appreciate the time that the project applicant 31 and City Staff have taken to discuss this project and the inclusion of some 32 33 mitigation to reduce air quality impacts such as Tier 4 construction equipment 34 consistent with other projects. To be clear, we neither support nor oppose this 35 project. However, we are speaking here tonight to express our serious concern about two fundamental problems with the EIR in its current state. First, the 36 37 projects inadequate mitigation of the emissions from its 14,000 daily truck trips 38 and second the misleading characterization of a study regarding diesel exhaust. 39 As you know, the Inland Empire experiences some of the worst air quality in the 40 nation with ozone and fine particulate matter levels that routinely exceed national ambient air quality standards. If these air quality standards are not met on time, 41 besides local residents continuing to suffer from poor air quality the region will 42 face mandatory federal sanctions including the loss of most federal transportation 43 44 funding. This consequence is important given the reliance of this project on the transportation network. Unfortunately, the mitigation proposed in the EIR for 45 trucks takes virtually no steps to help that region meet these standards on time. 46

1 The EIR's requirement that all trucks meet EPA's 2010 tailpipe standard only provides about a 1% benefit beyond existing regulations. This is clearly not 2 enough. Fortunately, there are options available to remedy the situation. In our 3 4 comment letter, we provide ample evidence that trucks that have tailpipe emissions below the 2010 standard are commercially available today. Further, 5 trucks that are 90% cleaner than the 2010 standard are expected to become 6 7 commercially available in 2018 about the time that the first warehouse for this 8 project would be built and even cleaner trucks are expected soon after that. 9 AQMB Staff believe that it is feasible and imperative for this project to include a 10 program to review and implement these new technologies as they become available similar to other good movement projects and ports. This can include a 11 12 mechanism such as an emissions cap that declines through time as newer 13 technologies become available and a requirement that tenants take advantage of 14 incentive funding to upgrade their truck fleets. Finally, the EIR misleads the public with its characterization of the HEI Study on diesel exhaust. In simplest 15 16 terms, the study's sample size was too small to make any determination about the cancer potency of diesel exhaust. Rather the study simply confirms what we 17 already knew. Newer truck technologies have lower emissions and consequently 18 lower health impacts than older technology. We believe the EIR's cherry picking 19 20 of a single study and misapplication of its result to this project is contrary to the 21 substantial weight of evidence recognizing the cancer-causing potential of diesel 22 exhaust. The LEED Agency should instead only rely on the results of the HRA already included in the EIR to make determinations of significance under CEQA. 23 The choice before you tonight is not about promoting jobs or clean air, it's really 24 about promoting a future that provides both. Thank you for the opportunity to 25 speak before you tonight. AQMB Staff is available to help craft revisions to 26 27 projects, mitigation, and to answer any questions.

28

29 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - I have a quick question for you since you are from Southern 30 California Air Quality I figured this would be an opportune time. Why did the 31 AQMB focus their efforts on this particular project as opposed to any numerous 32 warehouse projects before us for the last several years? Please stop the 33 applause. This is a legitimate question, and we don't need reinforcement from 34 the peanut gallery. Thank you.

35

SPEAKER IAN MACMILLAN - So we have actually come and spoken before 36 37 the Planning Commission on numerous projects in the past. If you'd like, we can 38 provide a record of numerous projects where we've either provided comment 39 letters or testified before the City on other projects besides this one and it's not just in Moreno Valley. We have concerns with any project that has potential air 40 quality concerns whether it's a warehouse project or other kinds of projects we 41 express our concerns if the air quality impacts we believe are real and have 42 43 feasible mitigation.

44

1 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay. I know that my fellow Commissioners all have a lot of 2 questions. Will you be available in the Commission Debate portion even if it 3 goes to another meeting?

4

7

5 **SPEAKER IAN MACMILLAN** - Yes. We can make ourselves available as 6 needed and I'll have additional Staff here who can provide information.

8 <u>**CHAIR LOWELL**</u> - I appreciate it. Thank you. Okay we George Gonzalez, 9 Alondra Gonzalez, Miguel Gutierrez. We have Steve Healton, Bruce Mattei, Alva 10 Anyiotta, Linda Burger-Grafstrom. I see one person moving. We also have 11 Manuel Aguiar and Jim Moynihan. Please introduce yourself. You can just pull 12 the whole thing down.

13

14 **SPEAKER LINDA BURGER-GRAFSTROM** - Sorry I have some vocal issues because of some health-related issues. Good evening, my name is Linda 15 Burger-Grafstrom, and I moved to Moreno Valley in 1986 as a brand new teacher 16 to work and live in this community. I understand that the Commission tonight has 17 a very difficult task before you, and I'm glad I'm not on the Commission to be 18 19 honest with you. As a resident and a worker of this community, I have some 20 major concerns that mostly involve the health-related issues. I'm deeply concerned about the outcome of your recommendation and how that will affect 21 22 the health and welfare of hundreds of thousands of residents throughout the region for years to come. A lot of speakers tonight have addressed the future of 23 our children. Well as a teacher that is my concern as well. I am concerned 24 25 mostly about those students who will be living and going to school closest to the logistics center and most vulnerable to the increased health risk associated with 26 27 the diesel exhaust created by the logistics center if its approved. According to the California Government Office of Environmental Hazard Assessment, the 28 29 prevalence of diesel powered engines makes it almost impossible to avoid exposure to diesel exhaust or its bi-products. Also those spending time on or 30 near roads and freeways, truck loading and unloading operations, operating 31 diesel powered machinery, or working near diesel equipment face exposure to 32 33 higher levels of exhaust and face higher health risks. Those risks will include 34 greater rates of asthma, heart disease, and cancer. The projected health risks 35 are one reason why the Moreno Valley Unified School District issued their opposition to the WLC. As someone who has undergone both radiation and 36 37 chemotherapy for two different types of cancer, I do not wish to witness my 38 students having to go through the same experience. I urge each of you to 39 consider the enormous health risks posed by this project to the residents and children of our community before issuing your final recommendation. Another 40 speaker tonight asked the question what is a job worth. I encourage each of you 41 on the Commission to instead ask yourselves if increased logistics jobs are worth 42 43 the lives of the workers themselves and the health of our residents. Thank you. 44

1 <u>**CHAIR LOWELL**</u> - Thank you very much. Sorry I just saw some movement. I 2 thought it may have been a speaker that I called. Manuel Aguiar, Jim Moynihan,

3 Carlos Vega, Melissa Montgomery, Steve Harrington.

4

5 **SPEAKER STEVE HARRINGTON** - Good evening. Thank you for the opportunity to address the Commission today. My name is Steve Harrington. I 6 have 27 years of experience in transportation, warehousing, and logistics. I'm 7 8 involved with the leadership of the Distribution Management Association and I work at the National Center for Supply Chain Technology Education. I need to 9 10 make a point first of all in that this is the logistical epicenter of the country. There are 1.7 billion square feet of warehouse space in Los Angeles County, the Inland 11 12 Empire, and Orange County employing over 500,000 people. Last year, 18 13 million square feet of warehouse space was developed in the Inland Empire. 14 This year, 14 million square feet is currently under development. Whether this project comes to Moreno Valley or not, whether you make the decision to bring 15 those jobs to the residents of Moreno Valley or you decide that the residents of 16 Moreno Valley need to get in their cars and commute to all of the other 17 communities where they need to go to go to work that decision is up to you. 18 19 Whether you looked at the legal wrangling or the CEQA or the EIR or all that other mumbo-jumbo, the bottom line is that you need to bring good jobs to the 20 residents of Moreno Valley. I started out picking up boxes going to college part-21 22 time working in a warehouse when I was 18 years old. It took me seven years to get through school. I worked hard. I finished school. After completing my 23 education, I ended up working through a series of career opportunities, inventory 24 25 control manager, a clerk, department head, foreman, shipping supervisor, receiving supervisor, warehouse manager. I ended up working for a Fortune 500 26 27 company because I got additional training and because I worked hard. They talk about these jobs being dead-end jobs. They're not dead-end jobs. They're 28 29 entry-level jobs. They're entry-level jobs like entry-level jobs in all sorts of other occupations. You can either choose that that's a dead-end job for yourself or you 30 can choose to improve your own circumstance and move up the career ladder 31 and get additional training and as a Fortune 500 Company that pay benefits, that 32 pay profit sharing, that provided 401K, that had salaries in the \$14.00 to \$50.00 33 34 an hour range for its employees, who employed people who serviced our 35 equipment, who took care of our IT, with an HR department, with an accounting department. I could go on and on about outside of the people we employed all of 36 37 the other jobs that we created as a result of the existence of our business, which 38 didn't include the fact that the people who worked at our business went and 39 shopped locally and went and ate locally and went and used local services which 40 benefited the local community, so you have that opportunity in front of you. I am 41 for the project because it makes sense.

42

43 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. We have Claudia Elias, Maria Elias,
44 Mario Elias, Marla Perez, and Ruben Perez. I don't see anybody jumping up.
45 Virginia Palomares-Salcido. He does not look like a Virginia. I wasn't going
46 there.

2 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - Yeah those were people who turned them in
 3 between 5:00 and 6:00 p.m.

5 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - I know. We have Dora Garcia, Marlene Ramos Gurrola, 6 Eddie Lopez, Christina Elias, Ernesto Sarabia, Maria Ibarra, Marvel Elias, Porfirio 7 Manzano, and last but not least is Brandon Carn. David Padilla. Okay, with that 8 said, instead of going through all 165 names again is there anybody in 9 attendance tonight that put in a Speaker Slip that has not spoken yet? Okay, if 10 you could come up one at a time and please introduce yourself and we'll just 11 verify that you're on this lovely list of ours.

12

15

18

20

22

1

4

13 <u>SPEAKER BRANDON CARN</u> - Good evening Commissioners, I'm Brandon
 14 Carn.

16 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay, before we get started, I just want to make sure we
 17 have you on here.

19 SPEAKER BRANDON CARN - Thank you.

21 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Brandon Carn. You turned your's in tonight didn't you?

23 SPEAKER BRANDON CARN - Yeah.

24 25 **C**

25 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay go ahead. Thank you.
 26

27 **SPEAKER BRANDON CARN** - One of the first things I want to mention is I have problems with the EIR because looking at the two different drafts you have maps 28 of ownership for Highland Fairview's property around this boulevard that 29 30 contradict each other. One says they have 1600 acres, which is actually accurate if you check the tax records through the County's office and the City's 31 32 GIS Maps. The other one says you own all 2600 acres. That's actually false and inaccurate and it actually was in the Benzeevi presentation for the last meeting. 33 34 One of the things I was very disappointed in there's not much substance to the Power Point that was presented. You have a lot of stock photos, a little bit of 35 animation, a lot of generalities about industry. Where are the blue prints? Where 36 37 are the renderings? Where are the mockups? Where are the specifics of the 38 buildings that are proposed for this type of project. I'm not against logistics or 39 that type of profession, but we have no project or development that's really being 40 examined and analyzed. You had more substance to Skechers when it was 41 coming here or Prologis when I came back and spoke about that than you 42 actually have about this type of development. The next thing I'm seeing is this is not by far the first attempt by a Benzeevi-related Corporation to develop a project 43 44 promising billions in revenue and tens of thousands of jobs. That in fact goes 45 back to the mid 1980s. You had the Moreno International Trade Center, which was a logistics aerospace airport that was promising 30,000 to 50,000 jobs. The 46

1 10,000 foot runway never was built. You had the Moreno Highlands project, which two different times you has Specific Plans for. The last one, the one you're 2 going to replace it with, was the Specific Plan for that promising \$2 to \$2.5 billion 3 4 in revenue and 20,000 to 30,000 jobs depending on the source that you were siting. It's all public record in City archives; never produced, never built. All 15-5 year build-out and there are probably about eight other major projects in the 6 7 Inland Empire that Benzeevi has promised since the mid 1980s; Banning 8 Municipal Airport, redevelopment of Norton Airforce Base that promised tens of 9 thousands of jobs and millions in revenue was never built. Iddo Benzeevi and 10 this corporation really have absolutely no track record of it speak of even including Skechers. I can elaborate on why and I included that in a written email. 11 12 Another thing I'm also noticing is looking at the EIR and the Development 13 Agreement in particular, how in the world do you anticipate the funding of it? It's 14 so vague that you are not giving a specific amount or a plan later on to develop how much of City Taxpayer Fund, which is estimated between \$100 to \$150 15 million in our taxpayer money in the next how many years going towards 16 infrastructure that's going to cost \$500 million. Why are we paying for most of 17 that whatsoever when Highland Fairview is going to contribute \$500 million? 18 19 There are a lot of different concerns about that. Is Highland Fairview capable of building a project on this scale? They don't even own the land they own. Of that 20 3000 acres of so that they have for the Specific Plan, they own less than half of 21 22 it. I'm also concerned about the type of living that people will do there. When they rezone that 10% of the property land you're going to let a corporation that 23 has no track record, nothing but a few temporary construction jobs with 24 25 Aquabella which was abandoned, the un-built Mason Corridor which has no plans submitted, anything like that rezone 10% of the property and the land half 26 27 of which less than they own. What are you going to do about that? That's 28 insane.

- 29
- 30 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Thank you very much.
- 32 **SPEAKER BRANDON CARN** Thank you.

33

31

- 34 <u>SPEAKER MAXINE DAVIDSON</u> My name is Maxine Davidson.
 35
- 36 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> You can pull the microphone down.
 37

38 SPEAKER MAXINE DAVIDSON - I live in the 9255 area. I put my name in at
 39 the last meeting, but there were 300 on the list so I came back tonight hoping I
 40 would be heard.

- 41
- 42 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> What was your name again?
 43
- 44 **SPEAKER MAXINE DAVIDSON** Maxine Davidson.

45

46 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Thank you.

2 SPEAKER MAXINE DAVIDSON - I live on Maltby Avenue and I moved to Maltby Avenue after retiring from a 40 year career in OR nursing. Nurses know 3 about planning. You prepare for it before it happens. You make sure that 4 everything that comes flying through the door you're prepared for. I moved there 5 to live one mile from my daughter and her husband three years ago. Two 6 7 months later, my husband and I were the direct recipients of the mud flood of 8 2012. Even though our paperwork said that we were not in a flood zone, we 9 obviously are. My husband was standing in four feet of mud and water up to his 10 hips and the fire department could not even get past our house. What a way to meet you neighbors. Yes we are in a drought but so is Texas. They've had 11 12 massive flooding and we are now hearing of the possibility of El Nino. I've come 13 here to address the fact that the infrastructure in this area is inadequate for 14 flooding. We saw when it rains in California it pours. We have never had adequate infrastructure. Statistically we have had heavy rains in 1862, 1914 with 15 30 inches of rain in the Pasadena area. The Agua Dulce Damn was built as a 16 result of that. In the 50s as a little girl living in Edgemont, there was significant 17 flooding. In 1969, I remember the Santa Ana River becoming a raging river, not 18 19 an underground river that we normally see today. It washed out the Van Buren 20 Bridge. The Cooley Ranch at the 215 and 10 was under 10 feet of water. In 1997 and 1998, we had El Nino, which were flooding years. It will be over 100 21 22 years since the 1914 flooding in California. Will 2015 be that year for the 100 23 year flood? I live on the East End, and I'm scared to death. Are we prepared? 24 Is Moreno Valley prepared for that? I think not. The City Council made promises 25 to the people south of Alessandro and east of Redlands that the FEMA Damn 26 would be done. We received information from the engineers that that will 27 probably start in January but anyone who lives in Southern California knows that statistically the heavy rains start in January. The drainage ditch that parallels 28 29 Campbell has not been taken care of either, so I would ask you as you prepare for this to significantly see that the infrastructure around the residences of the 30 31 World Logistics Center are taken care of first.

32

1

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you. It was kind of hard to tell Ma'am. Were you for
 or against? That wasn't a joke. I'm serious. Are you for or against? Thank you.
 Can you introduce yourself, Sir?

- 37 **SPEAKER GUILLERMO CERVANTES** My name is Guillermo Cervantes.
- 37 38

36

38 39 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Thank you.

40

41 SPEAKER GUILLERMO CERVANTES - I have lived here in Moreno Valley 42 since 2006/2007. I work for Aerospace Industry. I've been in the industry 25 43 years. I have commuted a lot on the freeways, Orange County and Riverside 44 County. The thing that brought my attention here is...I'm not an expert in politics. 45 I served this country and I see a lot of people have fear. I don't know what is the 46 fear for. First of all, I support this project. Why? Because it makes sense for

1 people like me who travel a lot as I am missing a lot of time with driving the freeways instead of being with my family. Again I saw a lot of people talking 2 about a lot of things, technology and everything, but one of the things I think this 3 4 city is blessed because we have a unique opportunity. But all the explanation, the technology again, for me, I don't care. For me, I care for the future of my 5 family because let's say my family is here now. I barely see them. I don't know 6 7 how many people are over here. I counted, but I see so many people. So you're 8 afraid, for example, I saw a lady asking for better jobs. Go get educated and be involved in the circle of progress. Why you are afraid for making progress for the 9 10 possibility of other jobs. Like I said, I support the aerospace companies. I have to travel a lot and even though I don't have an aerospace job here I don't care 11 12 about that. We have a lifetime opportunity for other fields, so if people want to have better pay, get educated or get more involved in the progress of the City of 13 Moreno Valley. So my point is great opportunity this project. I think it's not 14 being afraid for the future. My point is you do not have to be afraid for nothing. 15 You can believe in God. I trust in God. We build opportunity through ourselves 16 because this is the United States. This is a free country. We fight for the 17 freedom, so this is simple. So just go and we will see the future results. This is a 18 19 lifetime opportunity for everybody, so thank you very much.

20

22

24

27

29

31

33

- 21 **CHAIR LOWELL** Thank you very much. What was your name again?
- 23 SPEAKER GUILLERMO CERVANTES Guillermo Cervantes.
- 25 <u>PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER</u> Excuse me. He may have been
 26 speaking on behalf of Ana Cervantes. That's the only name I have so.
- 28 **CHAIR LOWELL** You're fine. Thank you.
- 30 **SPEAKER DARLINE BAILEY** I can't talk. My name is Darline Bailey.
- 32 **CHAIR LOWELL** Thank you.

34 SPEAKER DARLINE BAILEY - My daughter is going to read my notes, but I 35 just would like to say years ago we had Bobby Kennedy and there was a song that says "Can anybody here tell me where my old friend Bobby is, can anybody 36 tell me where he's gone?" I feel like can anybody here tell me where my old 37 38 friend employment is? Can anybody tell me where it's gone for Moreno Valley? 39 And I would like to say what do we want? When do we want it? And like the gentleman speaker before. I am not a 13-year-old and I'm highly educated about 40 the WLC and the EIR. The EIR is highly exaggerated to inform all individuals 41 and parties involved of any and all possible environmental conditions. These 42 numbers are not concrete and should not be examined as fact. Even with 43 44 exaggerated numbers, there is still no severe nor significant changes to our environment nor our health issues. As the previous woman said about her 45 cancer, she received it from her environment? Because the WLC did not exist to 46

give her cancer. There were other projects that could have caused her health conditions. Those projects definitely cause pollution as you can see. The anti's talk about pollution but do not pick nor complain about the other existing projects that are causing pollution to the other side of Moreno Valley. This is just a hate group against Iddo and progress for Moreno Valley. They are only here to benefit themselves not to help Moreno Valley. That is all. Thank you.

7

8 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you very much. I see Mr. Tom Thornsley is over 9 there. Tom Thornsley would you like to speak? Before I let you get started, is 10 there anybody else in the room, or even in the audience or the gymnasium 11 wherever you may be, that has filled out a Speaker Slip that has yet to speak? It 12 looks like you have the last say.

13

14 **SPEAKER TOM THORNSLEY** - That's an honor. I had the last say at Skechers too. Good evening Commissioners. You've heard a lot tonight, especially a lot 15 about the air issues, about cancer issues. I want to cover another issue that isn't 16 quite covered yet and has to do with the actual land use designations here in the 17 City. For the last several years, the City has abandoned bringing forward any 18 19 land use designation that would remain as business park. In business park uses you would allow for the smaller start-up businesses. The kind of businesses that 20 are supposed to be the ancillary businesses that will support something like the 21 World Logistics Center. You're looking at a project that is so short sited in not 22 offering some diverse opportunity within it for the kinds of uses that should 23 support its operation. One 3000 square foot gas station is not going to do much 24 for that entire 40 million square feet of warehousing. It would be the same as if 25 you were looking at a housing tract project on 1000 acres and you only let them 26 build the same style of two-story homes. You've got to have some diversity. 27 You've got to have some variations. You've got to have something that helps 28 29 support what you're going to do. We're going forward with a type of use that is the lowest job producer by square foot or per acre of any use that you can do 30 within a City. If you look at the results of analysis of the number of employees 31 per square foot for something like Skechers, it drops to even a lower level than 32 33 what they've used in the EIR. So out here now, we're looking at something like four jobs per acre across the entire project site. That's a ridiculous thing to do. 34 35 We need jobs that are in the higher density range. With that kind of density, you're going to have more people having to commute out of the City at some 36 37 point because we simply won't have enough jobs for the 120,000 or so people in 38 this City who are employable. Another thing you need to look at is what the 39 Development Agreement offers in there. In the Development Agreement, they 40 redefine DIF. In that definition, there are no monies collected for roads, bridges, or signals. I ran some calculations. I just did the TUMF fee. I based it on 41 41 million square foot buildings using the formula that we now use for high cube, 42 and it only generates \$27 million. That's not enough to finish one intersection on 43 44 the freeway, and there will not be enough other generating funds coming from the remainder of the vacant land out there, so you need to have that looked at 45 and think about that across all those fees. 46

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Thank you, Tom. On that note, I would like to leave the
 Public Comment portion open for the time being. I would like to take a break and
 reconvene at 9:30, and I will ask one more time before the closing of the Public
 Comments portion if there is anybody that hasn't spoken yet.

6

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - Mr. Chairman, I just want to report
 that our sheriff's have reported to me that there is nobody left over in the other
 facility, so in case you're wondering if there is anybody there.

10

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - I appreciate it. We're still going to take a break. Let's
 reconvene at 9:30. Thank you.

13 14

15 MEETING BREAK

16 17 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Good evening. Welcome back. We are still in the Public Comments portion of this hearing. We have in excess of, I dare say, 40 or 50 18 people that have filled out Speaker Slips that have not spoken yet. It does not 19 20 look like their in attendance, so I'm doing one last call. Anybody that has filled out a Speaker Slip that has not spoken yet and would like to do so, this is your 21 22 last chance. I'm not going to go through and read off the list. There's way too 23 many of them. You know who you are. If you haven't spoken and you want to 24 speak, this is your last chance. I don't see anybody moving towards me. I don't 25 see anybody raising their hands. Anybody out in the audience, out in the hallway 26 or anything? Okay, that's it. Going once, going twice, Public Comment portion is 27 now closed. I don't see anybody from Highland Fairview. I was just going to ask them if they want to come up and talk. 28

29

30 PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - If you'll hold on one second and let
 31 me....
 32

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay we'll give them a moment. We need some filler
 elevator music or something. We can have karaoke over here. Just bear with us
 for a moment. We'll get the Applicant back in here. Again we're still just waiting
 for the Applicant to get back. Their purses and stuff are still here, so.

37

38 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - They're probably getting their notes together.
 39 You might want to give them the option of doing it at the next meeting in case
 40 they have....

41

42 <u>**CHAIR LOWELL**</u> - Well they're here so. Okay it looks like the Highland Fairview 43 is represented again. I would like to ask if Highland Fairview would like to 44 respond to any of the comments they've heard tonight. We're going to go 45 through Commissioner Debate shortly hereafter. I just wanted to know if you 46 wanted to directly respond to any of the comments. If not, we can move forward.

2 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Good evening, my name is Iddo Benzeevi. I am the President of Highland Fairview. Thank you for the opportunity to be here 3 4 tonight and continue the duration of the World Logistics Center project. A lot of things have been said, and we are very privileged that there is that much interest 5 in our project in the community. We thank very much everybody who has stayed 6 7 this late and on previous occasions to voice their thoughts, concerns, ideas, or 8 anything else that may be of value for all of us as we evaluate the project. 9 There's been so many things said that we could probably spend a lot of time 10 trying to explore each and every one of them, but a lot of what has been said some of which was somewhat inaccurate, some of it entirely inaccurate. One 11 12 thing that may relieve a lot of people's anxiety is one thing that I heard be 13 repeated continuously was the issue of trucks and I keep on hearing 14,000 14 trucks, 14,000 trucks. These are not 14,000 trucks. There are 14,000 truck trips. There's actually 4200 trucks altogether. That's a big difference. There's not 15 14,000 trucks. There's 4000 trucks and 14,000 trips. In other words, you can 16 have one truck going 14,000 times back and forth or you can have a few hundred 17 trucks or a couple thousand trucks, 3000 trucks, doing all the deliveries. So I 18 keep on hearing 14,000 trucks. It is not 14,000 trucks. It's truck trips, so that's 19 20 one thing that may relieve a lot of the concern. But that was one of the big inaccuracies that we keep on hearing throughout the night, so if you read the EIR 21 22 carefully and the traffic analysis, which by the way at a cost of over \$4 million is a very, very extensive and very detailed analysis of traffic. I have made a few 23 notes that perhaps we can address. The City of Riverside I was very happy to 24 25 see them here today. I've not seen them be so concerned about the City of 26 Moreno Valley. I wonder if they will come here and invest in our community, 27 build jobs, feed our poor, teach our children, but it's nice to see that they are now very concerned about the well being of Moreno Valley when they continue to 28 29 develop across the street and don't quite invite us to hear our concerns. But it is very encouraging that originally they were here voicing their concern and also 30 support of things that could happen in Moreno Valley. Nonetheless, in Riverside, 31 if you look outside of Moreno Valley and we have looked at literally every low 32 segment from here all the way to the ports of LA. Most projects don't do that and 33 34 therefore they would have never found all those issues their talking about. But, 35 at the end of the day, there's two intersections in Riverside that we have a direct impact to. One will impact 3.7% at build-out and the other one about 5%. It's 36 37 very minimal and most of those streets have very little to do with the World 38 Logistics Center. The job numbers actually come from not from us. It's part of 39 the EIR. It's been evaluated by professionals some of who are here and can be asked questions about how they generated the numbers, but it's all based on 40 government statistics, the Bureau of Labor Statistics and I think I've said it before 41 42 the only people who really know where you live and where you get your paycheck is the government. That's the only reliable source for those types of 43 44 numbers, and that's the numbers we used in the EIR. Again this is not our 45 numbers. This is not a number we are proposing. This is a number that is generated out of the usual methodologies that are applied to the county, the 46

1

1 state, the federal government, and everybody else so we're just inline with everybody else's analysis. We can all have opinions, and everybody is entitled 2 to their own opinion but not to the wrong facts, and the only facts we can rely on 3 4 is the actual accepted methodologies that are used by all the government agencies. Some people talked about infrastructure and the money it would cost 5 the City. I want to make it very clear Highland Fairview, the World Logistics 6 7 Center, we will be paying for all the necessary infrastructures to support the 8 World Logistics Center. I'm not sure how to define all better in English, but whatever part of all is not understood I am willing to try and explain it. But we will 9 10 pay for all the necessary infrastructures. There is some confusion with DIF where in our Development Agreement it says for those sections for that 11 12 infrastructure for which we'll be paying and actually installing, not paying but 13 actually installing, we won't pay DIF because DIF is there to pay for those 14 improvements. If you're making them, if you're putting them in the ground and you're constructing them, you don't pay the fee. So this is not a benefit to 15 Highland Fairview, actually it's a benefit to the community. We actually will put in 16 the infrastructure no matter what it costs. Sometimes DIF fees are below what it 17 actually costs to provide infrastructure. We will actually provide the infrastructure 18 19 that is necessary to support the entirety of the development. In terms of some deficiencies that exist in the roadways around the county and the State of 20 California and Southern California, no single project can fix all the deficiencies 21 22 that have been accruing over years and years and years. But as we all see other cities, like somebody said there's lots of traffic in Orange County, they keep on 23 generating jobs. They keep on attracting industry creating a job base and 24 25 opportunities for their communities while there is still traffic. And it's not that we shouldn't reduce it, but the only real way we can ever reduce traffic is by bringing 26 27 jobs where people live because if you build more housing in one county or one city and jobs in another county or another city the more houses you build and the 28 29 more jobs built over there the more lanes you have to add and the more houses, the more lanes you add you never finish building lanes. The only time you 30 reduce traffic is if you create jobs where people live. In fact, if everybody had a 31 job in Moreno Valley, nobody would really care what the 91 Freeway looks like to 32 go to Orange County every morning because you'll be here. That's the whole 33 34 point. That's how we reduce traffic. In fact, Caltrans has built all the necessary 35 freeways to support the population. What trips them up is that every city produces a General Plan that says job-to-housing balance, which means 36 everybody stays pretty much within the vicinity of the cities. If everybody in the 37 38 City really acted that way, the freeway traffic would look like what it looks like 39 after rush hour where everybody is where they're supposed to be and you can 40 pretty much get everywhere. So the good news is with more jobs in our local community, the less traffic we will actually have. And, even if traffic is the case, it 41 will not be due to anything we will do in Moreno Valley because Banning grows 42 or Beaumont grows or the desert grows or Redlands grows or Perris grows that 43 44 traffic will be generated. But if we had jobs in Moreno Valley we wouldn't really care about what the traffic is like in LA or Orange County or anywhere else or 45 San Diego, so it's to our benefit to bring local jobs. Some people have compared 46

this plan to the job generation numbers out of the Moreno Highlands Specific 1 Plan. It's a plan that was generated over 20 years ago. Some people have it 2 wrong as to what I own or what I don't own or what project I had, but that's for 3 4 another day. The City knows very well what we own and what we bought and what we pay taxes on. However, the notion that we have half the land of the 5 World Logistics Center is just absolutely wrong. We own 100% of the land that's 6 7 in the World Logistics Center, and the City may clarify what the definition of 8 project is because they've asked us to actually plan an area that is larger than 9 our own holding to benefit all the surrounding areas to make sure there is a 10 consistent land use and that the area will evaluate all these areas. But to the jobs numbers, people keep referring to Moreno Highlands generating 20,000 11 12 jobs. Well if you look at the land uses 5 million square feet of office. I don't think 13 the entire Riverside County has 5 million square feet of office and it's very easy 14 to zone...if it was only that easy, right, to zone high intensity land uses that in theory create a lot of jobs, but the only thing missing from those designations is 15 reality. We can't fill 5 million square feet of office space in Moreno Valley. The 16 whole county I don't think has....downtown Riverside doesn't have 5 million 17 square feet, so we can zone Manhattan and say we'll generate 7 million jobs in 18 19 Moreno Valley within 30 acres but this is not the real world and we need to be responsive to the real world. And we're being responsive in several different 20 ways by providing money, \$7 million nearly, for education, job training in 21 22 conjunction with the City, taxes generated for public education about \$22 million from taxes alone from property taxes. This is not anything in addition, so there 23 are things that are addressing creating the job opportunities right here in Moreno 24 25 Valley. As far as the air, there's been a lot of discussion about the air. I can tell you with certainty that the World Logistics Center has the most stringent, most 26 advanced standards, most advanced standards, for air quality in every 27 environmental aspect. We can always do more but this is the only project, and 28 29 an AQMD representative was here and he very quickly said we want the World Logistics Center to be conditioned to do as much as other projects do. And, if 30 you would've asked him a followup question, the only other project he is talking 31 about is the ports of LA and Long Beach, which again don't have as stringent of 32 standards as we do. But, beyond that, there is no other project that we are 33 34 aware of in California that has this level of standards. There is no other project 35 that has 2010 clean diesel technology as a condition of the project nowhere, and we have asked them and we've met with them. And, by the way, they're great 36 37 folks. There's nothing wrong with AQMD. They are very smart people there that 38 are really trying to hard and have done tremendous to clean our air. But, for our 39 part, we're moving the market forward because there's no other project that has this kind of environmental standards associated with it. Somebody talked about 40 the water; how much water we spend or save, and I'm not sure exactly what 41 they're talking about. But to clarify the statement we have made, compared to 42 Moreno Highlands compared to what is already allocated there, the World 43 44 Logistics Center utilizing our water technologies and the systems we'll use 1.5 billion gallons of water less than what is already allocated there in the existing 45 plan. As far as traffic is concerned, Moreno Highlands will generate 210,000 trips 46

1 a day. The World Logistics Center will produce about 70,000 trips a day. Not cars, trips. There's a big difference. It's like if you have a pizza delivery car and 2 he makes 100 trips delivering pizza at night it does not mean there is 100 cars or 3 4 100 delivery trucks. There is one truck making 100 appointments. It's very different. We're not going to see 100 cars on the road. We'll see one guy driving 5 around or one girl, whatever it might be. So if it relates to comparing the 6 7 advantages of the existing land use, which has not provided or produced any 8 benefit to the City, it's been vacant for 20 some years because it was conditioned in our opinion unrealistically 5 million square feet of office. I mean Moreno Valley 9 10 never mind your lifetime, I don't think that's even real to create those types of jobs here. The market has even shifted from there. As far as the air, CEQA as 11 12 you know only evaluates direct impacts. In other words, if we had 1000 buses 13 going to the World Logistics Center, we would only evaluate the impacts of those 14 1000 buses on the road and the pollution they may make. But what CEQA doesn't do is evaluate the 20,000 people that may have gone on these buses 15 that will have come off the road. There's no offset, so we have to understand 16 what it all means. And so maybe to alleviate some of the, you know, potential 17 concerns that are perhaps unjustified needlessly those numbers don't imply what 18 some people suggested there's that many cars on the road. Now what does 19 4000 trucks mean? And, by the way, when they say about 14,000 truck trips 20 those include in the definition of truck the UPS trucks, the Federal Express trucks 21 22 and those kinds of trucks as well. The hard what we call the heavy duty trucks, 23 the ones we really refer to, I think are about 4200. And these go over a 24-hour period pretty much in an even distribution. So most of the trucks in the peak 24 25 hours, and I think we presented that in our presentation, most of those movements occur off-peak. In other words, most of the industry stops before the 26 27 morning rush hour. They peak about half an hour to an hour before the morning rush hour starts and they start about an hour after the evening rush hour 28 29 diminishes and they travel most of the time at night and off-peak. They travel in different patterns. Every land use is a different pattern, and I think we discussed 30 that last time. Shopping centers create a lot of traffic. A shopping mall will 31 create a lot of traffic, but nobody goes to the mall at 8:00 in the morning and 32 comes back there at 5:00. We have a different pattern in life. Most of us get up 33 34 in the morning, go the office at 8:00 or our place of work and come back at 5:00. 35 That creates the a.m. and p.m. rush hours, but malls get busy after hours or perhaps on the weekends. So if you say there is a big mall that will even create 36 100,000 trips a day those 100,000 trips will not occur in the morning rush hour. 37 38 So for everybody's benefit the World Logistics Center, and you can look at it in 39 the EIR, based on substantial traffic engineering that was done will actually 40 reduce traffic on the freeway segments because that many more people will actually be here. The last thing I want to say about air pollution and traffic is 41 again offset. If we don't have jobs in town, people complain about what the 42 pollution might be and there is certainly pollution. There isn't anything...anybody 43 44 who has a formula of how we create jobs/economic opportunity and has the formula of how to do it without traffic with no impacts, let me know and we'll apply 45 it in this project. We're always looking for the best standards. There is no such 46

1 thing. You build a high school, you build a school, you build a kindergarten, you build a shopping center, or you build a library, there will be traffic in and out of it. 2 The question is, is it is good traffic or bad traffic? Bad traffic is when everybody 3 4 has to get up in the morning and leave our City to go somewhere else away from the family, loved ones, and our City spending their money somewhere else and 5 then coming back in the evening after most of the activities here have been 6 7 passed during the day. That's bad traffic. Good traffic is like any business. If 8 you have a restaurant, you want traffic to come to you. Traffic that brings economic opportunity, jobs, right and prosperity. This is the kind of traffic we 9 10 want to see in Moreno Valley; people coming to Moreno Valley bringing business, jobs, and other opportunities. The last thing I want to say about jobs, 11 12 the logistics industry has a big breadth and depth of jobs. There's lots of 13 occupation and we have some slides and perhaps later on we can take some 14 time to do that. I don't want to take too much of your time now, but like some gentleman said depending on how much you want to apply yourself you can get 15 a PhD in supply chain management. It just depends what opportunity you're 16 looking for and it is also known that the logistics industry has the highest upward 17 mobility. People literally start, and I think one gentleman here said he started 18 19 picking up boxes and ended up managing large operations. Those buildings whether their robotics or other things take a lot of skilled people to operate and 20 manage. You don't operate a 1.8 million square foot facility with three people. 21 22 Second about the jobs and where they come from, by definition any company that will come to Moreno Valley will be coming from somewhere. Right? They're 23 coming from somewhere. If Apple computer came from Cupertino California 24 here with 5000 jobs nobody is going to say well my God the poor people in 25 Cupertino California. We would like to have Apple here. We would like to have 26 27 some of the high paying jobs, and we'd sure love some of their employee's maybe to become Moreno Valley residents because our City will grow. And the 28 29 question that will be is who are we growing the City with? Who will be our next residents, our neighbors/friends in our community. And that's what we want to 30 do create opportunity that people do move here and perhaps move here because 31 those jobs are being created. I also want to say that it isn't all high-paying jobs, 32 anything. You know, it's like in army only generals, there's no such thing. Any 33 industry works by the same pattern, right? You say hospitals are high-paying 34 35 jobs, but if you look at the county hospital here, there's probably about 3000 employees with around 100 to 150 doctors. I know that because we're also in 36 the hospital business and about 400 to 500 nurses. So 2500 other people are 37 38 working what? There's a lot of janitorial. People are washing the rooms every 39 day. There's the laundry mat for, you know, 300 beds changing all the time. 40 There's the cafeteria. There's parking lot attendants, building management and so forth. There's a lot of jobs all across the board, but we need an industry that 41 also is moving to be more and more technologically driven, which means the 42 skills required are ever rising. And, within five to seven years, the only way you'll 43 44 get a job in any of these buildings is some kind of advanced training, some kind of college education. So I encourage everybody to do it, and to that end, we also 45 will be spending about \$7 million to make sure that happens while we're also 46

1 working with the community college, with UC Riverside, our own school system to create programs. We can use this money as the catalyst to prime the pump to 2 make sure those opportunities will be there. The last thing about air, when you 3 4 get up in the morning and you're driving in bumper-to-bumper to work for an hour, two hours, half an hour, you're sitting on the freeway drinking the 5 concentrated orange juice of pollution. There's no question that you could spend 6 7 however many time around our project and it's not nearly anything than when 8 you might spend half an hour in bumper-to-bumper traffic on the freeway surrounded by cars and trucks, you know, 10 feet (5 feet if you don't tailgate) 9 10 away from you. So we have to look at the alternative and the real world options. When I say the CEQA world is not always the real world, it's because it's not 11 12 always designed to analyze and evaluate against other real world options. It 13 simply narrows the analysis to what is the impact. I sometimes compare it to 14 going to a doctor, right? Some people say, oh we to read all these pages. When you go to a doctor and he gives you a blood test or an MRI report you read and 15 understand the entire blood chemistry. The doctor who reads the report is the 16 expert. He evaluates it and says you know what you go take this vitamin and 17 you'll be fine. The EIR is basically the diagnosis on a project. It doesn't evaluate 18 anything else. And when you do this diagnosis it tells you, you know what, you 19 lack a vitamin; that's our mitigation, and then you're okay. And we paid our 20 taxpayer, as well as us, millions of dollars for professional staff like the doctor. 21 22 When we go to the doctor, we don't tell him what the blood chemistry and what the blood test says, we ask the expert to tell us is it good or not? We paid 23 millions of dollars, and you have a lot of good professionals in the City plus a lot 24 of consultants that the City hired to evaluate this and to tell us whether it 25 26 functions well and whether it meets the criteria and the standards. And I think we 27 have, and I know that Staff has recommended that it is done well. My closing statement, and I'll be open to whatever process you want to do next, is that we 28 29 feel very honored that we can be part of this community. When I say part of this community, some of you may have seen I'm around here. We have our offices 30 here. We didn't rent some office space to be here a few years, we actually own 31 the building. We are here. We employ people here. You see us in the 32 community and perhaps this is some of the reason that some of this is going on 33 34 because I am sometimes perhaps too accessible. Nobody knows who Mr. 35 Prologis is. Nobody knows who Mr. First Industrial is. Nobody knows who Mr. Prudential is, but they seem to know who Mr. Highland Fairview is. So it's easy 36 37 to, you know, humanize it and then make disparaging remarks about people they 38 don't know. But to everybody that is sitting at home that may have made some 39 remarks or another, I'm actually not upset. I actually have a lot of compassion for 40 all these people because I tell you every time you get energized in life and the only time you feel good about yourself is when you go out there and you 41 disparage somebody you don't know or you hate somebody you don't know 42 something is going on with you and what we need to do is all have a little more 43 44 compassion not hate, not innuendos, not fights, no wars. I come from a place....I come from a country, before I came to America, from Israel. I know what wars 45 are. We're not about war. I hope this community can come together. I hope we 46

1 can all come together. We're serious people doing serious things. We've spent hundreds of millions of dollars in this community. We will continue to invest 2 money in this community, and when everybody ran for the hills and there were 3 4 5000 foreclosures in the City and nobody built anything, we actually invested money and built the Skechers building employing 1100 construction workers. 5 And I thank the person here from the IBEW Union, the electricians union. 6 7 They're a great union. They do phenomenal work. And they know that it's 8 always been our intention to hire local, as local as we can get. If we can't find it in Moreno Valley then in Riverside. We're all in the same region. We did not all 9 10 come here on the same ship, but we're all in the same boat. And we need to support every initiative that Riverside has, that JPA has, Perris has, all our 11 12 surrounding communities because it's like a league. When the league does 13 better, we all do better. But sometimes we want our team to win the Superbowl, 14 not every season, not all time, but we need to win for Moreno Valley some of the time. And, while everybody else is doing it, it will have something that's for our 15 benefit. Lastly, people talk about mixed use. In a project of this size, you have to 16 look at the City as the project. And what is the mixed use? Mixed use is not to 17 have 95% of it be all residential. Mixed use is not to have so much retail that we 18 lose most of it. That's struggling. Mixed use is to have enough mix for jobs to 19 support all these other things, so look at this project and the City worked with us 20 and the reason you don't see a lot of mixed and other uses. I would of loved to 21 22 have shopping centers inside the World Logistics Center to suck up all that business because all the employees are going to be there, but the City was right 23 in saying we want to use this project to show up all our existing retail. Right? 24 25 Before Big Boy's shut down at Stoneridge Center, they were hoping that this project would go ahead where employees and people, daytime population, if you 26 27 work in Moreno Valley you'll probably eat lunch in Moreno Valley and you might shop and support some of our businesses in town which is what this is all about. 28 This project is really not about the jobs at the World Logistics Center but really is 29 the primer, right, for the economic pump that needs to get Moreno Valley going 30 again. So I thank you and, if you have any questions, we'll be here if you need 31 32 us.

- 33
- 34 35

36

COMMISSIONER DEBATE

37 CHAIR LOWELL - Thank you very much. So what I would like to do is move on to our Commissioner Debate. We are being asked to do quite a monumental 38 39 task. There are five different things that we are being asked to look at. The first thing we're being asked to do is to certify the EIR. The second thing we're being 40 asked to do is approve the General Plan Amendment. The third is to approve the 41 Change of Zone. The fourth is a Tentative Parcel Map and five is to approve the 42 Development Agreement. Because each one of these items on the face is such 43 44 a large object, I would like to have our Commissioner's discuss each one independently. So I'd like to discuss the EIR and keep our questions focused on 45 the EIR. Then second we will move to the General Plan and keep our questions 46

focused on that. That way we can kind of make some headway because in the past we've kind of bounced back and forth, which on smaller projects is not too big of a deal so I would like to start talking about the EIR. Does anybody have any questions in the EIR?

5

6 PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - Mr. Chairman, may I interject just 7 for a guick second? I just wanted to make a couple of points based on Highland 8 Fairview's rebuttal there. Just for the record, one thing was the ownership of the 9 land. I think Mr. Benzeevi may have just misstated a little bit. The 100% 10 ownership is related to the Development Agreement. The property within the Development Agreement is 100% owned by Highland Fairview. Within the World 11 12 Logistics Center Specific Plan, the majority of the land is owned by Highland 13 Fairview but there are some parcels and you heard from some of the testimony 14 this evening there are a few parcels that are not owned by Highland Fairview. It's about 2263 acres is what Highland Fairview owns and about 2610 acres is 15 the total Specific Plan area. I just wanted to make that clear for the record. With 16 regard to the CEQA evaluation, just to clarify the statement that the CEQA 17 document only looks at the project impacts, well that's true but it also looks at the 18 19 background environment. It looks at the cumulative environment. It looks at the projects impact itself, and it also does assume the world around you both in the 20 short-term and the long-term, so the CEQA document does do more than just 21 22 maybe just a limited focus which I took from Mr. Benzeevi's comments. With 23 regard to Mr. Benzeevi had indicated that there were few exhibits that he might 24 be able to share with the Commission for the record with regard to jobs. If that's 25 an important exhibit, it should be shared. Or, if the Applicant wants to share just so that it's clear and on the record, this would be an opportunity to do it and you 26 27 can ask for those to be shown as part of your deliberation. But, since they weren't shown, they were only referred to. You may want to consider giving him 28 29 an opportunity to show those, and I believe that we did load that up with our 30 media staff in case you want to see that at some point during the deliberations.

- 31
- 32 33

CHAIR LOWELL - Do you know if there's a lot of slides or?

34 **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** - I don't know. I just, because you mentioned it, I just want to make sure that for the record if he wants to interject 35 those into the record for any particular reason. If it's not that important to him, I 36 37 just wanted to make it clear that this would've been the opportunity, or is the 38 opportunity, to do that. Just with regard to the size of the project, with some 39 reference there, the City is about 52 square miles. His project area is a little more than 3800 acres. The total acreage for the City is about 33,000 acres, so 40 the project area represents about 10% of the City. So it is a large project, but it is 41 only about 10% of the land mass in the City. So those are just a few things I 42 43 wanted to clarify.

44

45 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay, so do we want to move onto Commission Debates or
 46 do we have any questions of Staff for the Applicant in the meantime?

<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - I have a question/comment before we even get
 into Commissioner Debate.

4 5

6

CHAIR LOWELL - Okay.

7 **COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA** - I would like to have an opportunity to ask a 8 question or two of the Applicant regarding his response to the Public Comments, 9 especially since quite a bit of the public is still here and maybe we can get a 10 couple of those things out in the open. But, as far as the Commissioner Debate goes, I'm sorry it's 10:00 at night. I've been up since 5:00 this morning. I would 11 12 prefer to continue the debate to another day. I would like to have some time to 13 go over the comments that were brought tonight, the additional paperwork that 14 we were given, the additional comments that we were given, and look at all of it 15 in light of what we've done today and come back a little bit more refreshed and ready to go through the points and debate. I do not feel ready personally to go 16 17 into Commissioner Debate tonight.

- 18
- 19 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Okay. Commissioner Barnes.
 20

21 **COMMISSIONER BARNES** - A couple of things. First of all, I want to thank the 22 public for the quality and the content of almost all of the information, questions, 23 and comments that they've provided. It's generated pages and pages of notes 24 and that's going to generate lots of guestions, but I do appreciate that from the 25 public. Also I agree with Commissioner Van Natta that it's late. I'd prefer to go 26 through this information, the new information that we were given as she stated, 27 and start fresh at the next meeting. I think the quality of the discussion will be 28 better. That's my opinion.

- 29
- 30 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Anybody else have any comments on any of the meeting?
 31 You're up.
- 32

33 VICE CHAIR SIMS - Yeah I want to echo what Commissioner Barnes said. I 34 think this is a huge decision for the City and for the region and the guality of the 35 comments on both the for's and against the project, it's appreciated that people take the time and effort to come out and voice their opinion. I think you just dig 36 37 into this stuff and there's just a lot of information and it's.....l too think we need 38 time to go back and review what we heard tonight, soak it up a little bit with what 39 we've been reviewing already for some period of time and then come back at this 40 fresh. I really do think that's a smart choice.

41

42 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Okay. Before I ask for a motion, I'd like to ask the Applicant
 43 if they would like to provide us with the slides that they mentioned earlier.
 44

45 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - I'm not sure if you want to see them now or if 46 you want to see them fresh when you come again. I just want to ask that, if you do continue it, if you can continue to a very close date. There's a lot of people here that are flying in from all over and this is the second time they've flown in and I hope that they can stay around for a few days, so we can have that next meeting in very short order. I think last time you even debated whether or not you wanted to do it on Saturday but any day very close to it will be highly appreciated, especially the tremendous stream that's here that's really flown in from everywhere; a tremendous effort to get here and be here with us.

- 8
- 9 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> I have spoken with Staff in the past, and depending on how 10 the rest of the Commission feels, we were thinking about this upcoming Tuesday.
- 11
- 12 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> I mean it's obviously your decision, but I'm
 13 hoping....
 14
- 15 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> With that said, I don't know if you want to present the slides 16 tonight or if you just want to submit them to the public record and we can look at 17 them on our own and you can talk about them next time.
- APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI It's a bunch of slides. Do you want me to go
 through them because it will take time or do you want me to do that when you
 come back in the next meeting?
- 23 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> If you can just supply them to us....
 24
- 25 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> Yeah.
- 26
 27 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> We can look at them on our own and you can talk about it too.
 29
- 30 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> I think they're on your City computer if I'm not
 31 mistaken.
 32
- 33 CHAIR LOWELL Okay.
- 35 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** The record, it's on your computer, I'm not sure.
- 36

- 37 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** We can coordinate that with Staff I guess.
- 38
- PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER If you provide them as requested
 by the Chairman, we can make them part of the official record and since it
 sounds like the Commission is going to be continuing the item that material will
 be available to the Commission to consider. I believe the reference you were
 making was to maybe some slides related to jobs.
- 44
- 45 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> There's several slides that relate to a lot of 46 different aspects in preparation to the questions that may be asked so there is a

1 whole slew of slides some of which relate to jobs, but there are slides there on 2 other subjects as well.

- 3
- 4 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Okay.
- 5

PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - If the slides are duplicates of what
 was already shown in your original presentation, then I don't think it's necessary.
 But, if it's additional information that hasn't been seen in the previous
 presentation, then that's what we need.

- 10
- APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Yeah, I think most of them are new. There may be some that are derivatives of slides we may have shown, but I think substantially most of them will be new slides.
- 15 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> That presentation, how long would you estimate it would
 16 take?
- 17

14

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - You know, if you want to take five minutes we can just go through the slides and you can kind of see. I don't think it will take too long. Some of it is just an anticipation of some of the issues that might be raised and so we have them as an exhibit that might help explain some things. But, at this point, there just a group of slides that represent different aspects of the project. They're not a presentation in and of themselves.

- <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> I'm okay with going a couple more hours tonight, but I'm kind
 of feeling that the rest of Staff.....
- 28 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** I did have....
- 29
- 30 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> So we have Mr. Barnes up next followed by Commissioner
 31 Van Natta.
 32

<u>COMMISSIONER BARNES</u> - I appreciate the Applicant's desire to get this over
 quickly. I think we all have the same desire. I think Tuesday is a little premature
 given that we had 70 speakers.

- 36
- 37 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> That will give us a solid week to look at
 38 everything.
- 39
- 40 **<u>COMMISSIONER BARNES</u>** Okay.
- 41
- 42 **CHAIR LOWELL** Okay.
- 4344 <u>COMMISSIONER BARNES</u> Just tossing it out there.
- 45

- <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> I do have other things I do on Tuesday's, but I
 can reschedule that. That's not a problem.
- 3

4 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Good if we can have the Applicant give us his few slides and 5 then we will discuss rescheduling or continuing the meeting.

6

7 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - And I did have a question for the Applicant
 8 based on his response to the.....
 9

- 10 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Well then I guess before we get to that, by all means 11 Commissioner Van Natta.
- 12

13 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - Several people had mentioned the additional 14 use that Cactus Avenue might get, and could you respond to that because there 15 were several people who talked about that. What's going to happen to Cactus 16 Avenue?

17

18 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** - Cactus Avenue will not get anymore traffic than it's designed for. You have to remember, Cactus Avenue is for of our General 19 Plan of streets and roads. It's not fully built out. At the very East End, I think it 20 might be two lanes or a lane plus a turn lane. But ultimately it's designed, I think, 21 22 to a four-lane road that is designed to carry a certain amount of load. In fact, it was designed anticipated to take Moreno Highlands, which has 210,000 trips a 23 day; a lot more than the World Logistics. Plus, it's not designed....another thing 24 that I heard is the trucks will go through there. It is not a truck route and none of 25 26 the World Logistics Center trucks will go on Cactus.

- 27
- 28 29

COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA - That's what I wanting to hear.

- 30 **CHAIR LOWELL** - And I do know from previous discussions about truck routes that you can make a truck route all day long and say this is the only direction the 31 trucks can go, but it's really up to the individual drivers. And it's more of an 32 enforcement issue than a designation issue. So if Redlands Boulevard or Gilman 33 Springs is a truck route and they decide we're going to go down Indiana, we're 34 35 going to go down La Salle or Hemlock, well if it's not a truck route that's an enforcement issue and there's nothing we can do about it. It's just like a speed 36 limit. You can set a speed limit at 65, but I don't think anybody in this room 37 38 actually drives 65 when the freeway is open. So it's an enforcement issue, not 39 necessarily an issue that we have to deal with here.
- 40

41 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - Yeah. To that end, we also by design, the way 42 they transform the World Logistics Center is into Cactus that extension will make 43 it very difficult for trucks to even negotiate and it will become apparent to truck 44 drivers this is not a way to go. So you're right, but at the end of the day, it's 45 enforcement. You can have all the laws in the world to drive 55 miles an hour, 46 and if somebody wants to speed he can do it enough times before they'll give

1 you a ticket or revoke your license but you do it at your own peril. I'm not going in any particular order. Like I said, these are these arbitrary slides are basically 2 some of the things, but I will show you quickly and you can decide if you want to 3 4 ask questions. We talked about the jobs as a wide variety of jobs that are involving logistics, and there is a question of always where do these numbers 5 come from and how were they developed in the EIR. So the source from the job 6 7 data it comes from the Bureau of Labor Statistics, Employment Development 8 Department of the State of California, US Census Bureau, Department of Labor, 9 the State of California Department of Finance for the State of California, and 10 SCAG. So these are the sources for the data that is being used by the experts to generate the employment and the job opportunities. Again it's not generated by 11 12 us, but I think the experts are here and I will perhaps ask you to refer to them for 13 any direct questions about how that gets evaluated. But these are the sources of 14 where the data comes from. It's not made up by Highland Fairview. The jobs, as indicated in the EIR, are an estimated number of jobs. And you can see there 15 are different kinds of jobs, direct jobs within the City, within the County, and there 16 are different types of, you know, direct/indirect and so forth. But essentially it 17 settles around 20,000 jobs, and this has been collaborated by several different 18 19 independent economics that the City at different times hired to evaluate this type of project. One was Beacon Economics and they also came in with a range 20 21 between a very high....

22

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Just real quick, let me interject. On the IT side of things,
 those slides are not coming up on our monitors, which I believe means it's not
 going out on the telecast. We just get a slide that says Staff Report. Oh, it just
 popped up. Thank you. By all means, continue. Thank you.

27

28 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - And so again people talk about more 29 automation, more technology and less and so they did evaluation what they call high-tech and traditional logistics, which are planned and so as you can see with 30 the high tech/highly automated is about 16,000 jobs and with conventional type is 31 almost 10,000 jobs more; 25,000 jobs and again the set amount on the plan 32 33 because nothing will be 100% one way or 100% the other way. There will be 34 users that have a variety and so the estimated average is 20,000 so when 35 people...yes?

36

38

- 37 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** I'll let you finish your sentence.
- APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI So when people say is it exactly 20,000 jobs, it
 is our estimated number of jobs and the experts can explain how that comes
 about but these are estimated and there is a range.
- 42

43 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - One of the speakers tonight suggested that the existing
 44 General Plan suggests that 21,000 jobs would be prepared or be available
 45 should the current area be built out to the existing zoning. Have you analyzed

1 what the proposed job projection would be or job creation would be if the existing

- 2 General Plan was built out compared to what Highland Fairview is proposing?
- 3

4 **<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u>** - Yes. Like I said, and perhaps these are not the most choice of words, but it's a little bit of a fantasy there is 5 million square feet 5 of office as part of the land use generating those kinds of jobs. I don't think we 6 7 can fill up 5 million square feet of jobs of office space in Moreno Valley in a long, 8 long, long time. I don't think it's realistic, and I'm not even sure the projection of when you can get that much office space in Moreno Valley. It's so far off that I'm 9 10 not sure what the jobs will be like that far down the road. You know, you may work from your home or you work for....you know, office space may not be the 11 12 type of work place we go to that far down the road but office has been challenging entirely in the Inland Empire. Some of you may go the Orange 13 14 County. I remember on the 91 there was a big project midway by Corona just by the 215 sat empty for a long time. It's very difficult to fill up office space even 15 closer to Orange County, so those job generation numbers it's easy to create a 16 zoning that has intensity of use. But it has to be responsive to the real world, and 17 I don't think that's responsive to the real world. 18

19

20 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Yeah but you're focusing only on the office space. What 21 about the retail, the commercial, the restaurant, all the other smaller uses that 22 would still be generating jobs?

23

24 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Right so, as you know, we have maybe over capacity in retail in Moreno Valley. I don't know of one literally outside of big box 25 or like a Costco. I don't know of any size shopping centers that are doing 26 extremely well. Most of them have vacancies. They're struggling, they're hard. 27 You know, stores open and close even national franchises like Big Boy's, 28 29 OfficeMax and others. We don't have a lack of retail in Moreno Valley. What we lack is daytime population to support this retail, and we do have an exhibit 30 perhaps you look where originally when we worked with the City Planning 31 Department they directed through Eucalyptus a direct connection from the World 32 Logistics Center area to the existing retail areas of the other malls; the Target, 33 the Walmart centers and be able to show those businesses up with all the 34 35 daytime population that would be basically the employment at the World Logistics Center. So it creates this energy. If you've been to Irvine, we have an office in 36 Orange County in Irvine at Spectrum. If you'll notice, the Irvine Company did the 37 38 same. They aggregated all the retail in one spot and basically funnel everybody 39 to the Spectrum Shopping Center. There's a few support, you know, kiosk type small convenient centers. But all the retail is congregated in one area and the 40 City Plan was essentially trying to emulate that same thing that does work. In 41 any event, the Beacon Economics came out. And there is a whole report that 42 one can look at, but they looked at significant positive impacts to the community 43 44 but not just the community for Riverside County as a whole but the surrounding And it was also corroborated by one more study that was 45 communities. commissioned from John Husing who is generally known to be an expert on the 46

1 Inland Empire economy for the last 30 some years. And without spending too much time on this report, he also came up with a general independently those 2 three people were totally independent at three different times and also came up 3 4 with a number of 20,000. Again, it's an estimate. It can have a range. And it talks about why it is right there because so much of our logistics is done and sell 5 off one building here and one off building there. It is a master plan and 6 7 understand that's, for example, our project has unified standards for how it 8 maximizes the benefits and minimizes the impact. And somebody said that somebody doesn't talk about the impacts. We have literally 10,000 pages of a 9 10 report that analyzes every impact to its minutia. So all of that is there. It has been there for two years and four months in the draft EIR and in the final EIR as 11 12 well. And the kind of job categories this is a sum from 2015 supply chain and 13 logistics. You can see there is a lot of different job categories that are within the logistics industry. I won't spend too much time on this today, but it's all available. 14 This was different again. I said it's an arbitrary collection of slides, but people 15 sometimes wait for manufacturing jobs. And I hear some people say well why 16 can't we have manufacturing? Again it's not the real reality of the world here, 17 especially in California. You can see this is a graph and California manufacturing 18 employment was down tremendously. Manufacturing is not what our strong point 19 is in California, the traditional manufacturing. Logistics is as you see. California, 20 this is a graph indicating where literally we're very last in all the states in 21 22 manufacturing. Manufacturing is not really coming back to California, so if we're waiting for that, we may be waiting for a long time. It maybe is not coming back. 23 It's really transforming into logistics, which in a sense is the new manufacturing. 24 25 It's how we put products together and how we do things, and you can see that is the national statistics on where we are. We're literally 50 out of 50 states. Again 26 27 you can see it's not even getting manufacturing jobs. You can see by 2011 we're at 0.5% gain. We're just not even really on the map in that area. This is not very 28 29 clear, but the graph on the right (the pie chart) shows the California percentage of total US manufacturing jobs is 1.1%. We're really not what people think. If 30 we're waiting for that, this is not our strong point here especially in Southern 31 California. This is not the employment that will be coming to our region, and you 32 can see the decline. It's not that we lost jobs, it's just that manufacturing jobs are 33 34 being replaced by what is the new manufacturing. The number one growth in 35 any sector is logistics in our region. We talked about providing \$7 million for our Development Agreement for workforce training with the City and we'll be deciding 36 37 over time how to implement those programs. And it's very important because we 38 need to do it through all ages because you don't learn anything overnight, and 39 this is the world that's coming and we need to be prepared with our next 40 generation of kids also that will come up with the new tools. It's like when I grew up I was still trained, believe it or not, with slide rulers. And today nobody is 41 trained in slide rulers. You know, you have calculators and computers. So 42 things change and all the knowledge you had about operating a slide ruler is 43 44 meaning less when what you have to be trained is maybe on a computer, operating a computer, or programming a computer so this is the same thing that 45 is happening to us here. So we'll be developing those programs, and we need to 46

1 have some heros in robotics and technology instead of just in sports. And because the jobs are changing, right, we're moving technology not so much labor 2 as it used to be. And, I think we said it before, 80% over the next decade 80% of 3 4 all jobs will require technical skills. And so, if we don't get prepared for it, it doesn't matter what we bring in town. Industry is moving forward and we need to 5 be ready. So I won't spend too much time on the statistics, but those types of 6 7 jobs (the kinds of jobs we'll find in those buildings) are growing at 300% faster 8 than all the rest of the jobs. And you can see that total occupation is actually going below the redlines. The STEM jobs are going way above and this is kind 9 10 of what this industry needs. We also have a local hiring program, and I elaborated on it last time. I may not have to repeat it now, but we will create a 11 12 mechanism whereby Moreno Valley residents will start getting the training since 13 we will know who the tenants are/who the users of the World Logistics Center will 14 be in advance of what the general public may know. We may be able to provide an opportunity for Moreno Valley residents to apply first and have first dibs at 15 those job opportunities if they're qualified. And the jobs are very technical 16 anywhere from the installation of those systems to managing them. This is, I 17 don't know if you're interested, it's a little video that kind of shows what's 18 19 happening in the industry. It's about three minutes. If you want to put it on the 20 record, I can try to run it.

21

24

26

- <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> I guess so. This is a lot of stuff that was in your previous
 presentation.
- 25 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI This one wasn't.
- 27 **CHAIR LOWELL** This is a new video?
- 28
 29 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI It's another slide, yeah. It's....
- 30

31 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Go for it. 32

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Does somebody have a way to start? Let's
 see. How do you....l'm not sure how this computer works to push play.

35

37

- 36 **CHAIR LOWELL** There we go.
- 38 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> No it's, oh yeah there we go. Anybody has
 39 volume? No sound to this?
- 40

42

41 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Guess not.

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - It just talks about the different jobs and
 opportunities in this very fast moving field and what's happening in logistics
 today. I guess its back to the silent era. We're talking about advanced
 technology and we're watching silent movies now. It's talks about all the types of

job opportunities and what's in logistics. I don't know if you want to go through it
 since it's silent, but it talks about the systems that it takes to run those
 operations. Somebody killed it? Okay.

4 5

7

5 PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER - They were trying to get the audio
 6 so.

8 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Maybe we can go back to it. Again, I won't spend time on this, but when this project started back in 2011, the City of 9 10 Economic Development looked for opportunities and hired consultants and developed a plan. The City Council, I think four Councils ago, adopted it. It's still 11 12 our Economic Development Policy. It calls for logistics on the East End east of 13 Redlands Boulevard, which culminated and the City recognized that they didn't 14 have enough land allocated to jobs meaning industrial producing land uses and we need to expand that. They looked at how much we need to expand to get to 15 approximately one job per household and that's how the acreage of the World 16 Logistics Center came about. And Mr. Sandzimier corrected me. Yes we own 17 100% of what Highland Fairview owns, but as I mentioned earlier the City 18 required a larger area be planned, including other properties that we don't own. 19 20 And that's because they wanted to be sure there was enough land, land in excess of what Highland Fairview has, to make sure we meet a closer job-to-21 22 housing balance. That's why there's other properties in that plan that doesn't belong to us. That's the letter that the City asked to us to do that planning. This 23 is the boundary, maybe this will clarify it, of the entirety of the project area. This 24 25 is the area that is called the World Logistics Center that's in blue, and this is the Highland Fairview ownership. Maybe that sort of clarifies it. So the blue is the 26 World Logistics Center Specific Plan. The grayed out area is actually ownership 27 that Highland Fairview owns. We actually own what is graved out. This is the 28 basic Circulation Plan that will be around the project. This is the justification of 29 what will happen. We have the lowest job-to-housing 0.47 today. We only have 30 9% of our land allocated to job producing land uses where you can see other 31 cities are way above. That's why we need a lot more fast tracking because we're 32 way behind. The World Logistics Center, which includes properties not just ours, 33 will bring us close to the 15% mark which is the threshold of where we become 34 35 sustainable. And Moreno Valley is the second largest city and only has 2.7% of the market. All the other cities that seem to voice concern here have three times 36 as much and continue to build, but they seem to be concerned about Moreno 37 Valley having a little more. And they all have about three times as much. We 38 39 talked about it before. There's only 94 acres left. People say why should it be 40 over on the 215 corridor? There's only 94 acres left, not on only one parcel, a variety of parcels. None of them are very conducive to these larger buildings but 41 some people talk about maybe doing smaller industries and smaller buildings. 42 That might be an area where that can be done. And so our biggest 43 44 underestimated risk is not having enough land for job producing land uses. We talked about the fact that we needed it in Moreno Valley for the benefit of Moreno 45 Valley. Just like the west side of Bay Street, all the benefit and the tax revenue 46

goes to Riverside. It may be convenient for Moreno Valley adjacent to Moreno Valley, but it's not in Moreno Valley for the benefit of Moreno Valley. The same thing with the jobs across the street. The west side of 215 there in Riverside in the JPA and in Perris but they're not in Moreno Valley for the benefit of Moreno Valley. So we need to do that. And the impacts some other cities are concerned about the traffic Moreno Valley may send down there all literally all the trucks that we see on the 215 or really the 60 don't belong to Moreno Valley.

8

9 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - We don't really want to cut you off, but it's kind of a rehash of 10 the same presentation you gave us last time.

11

12 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Yeah some of it is, and so let me go through the places that we have not touched on if you'd like to see it. Again, we have 13 14 2010 EPA standards. People talk about how you measure it to get how do we know? This we didn't talk about last time. There is mechanism and technology 15 today, which basically can determine what truck is and it goes into a big log so 16 you know what is the 2010 so the enforcement becomes easier. The HEI Report 17 we heard a lot about it but it's done. This is who produced the HEI Report. The 18 19 people seem to dismiss the Federal EPA, some of the big environmental groups like the NRDC, Department of Energy, Air Resource Board and so forth. On the 20 air quality, we talked about it so I will skip forward. One thing that might be 21 22 interesting, even if you take away this HEI Report that says there is no cancer risk or precancer and you apply what everybody seems to want to apply including 23 AQMD, we don't impact any area outside of the project boundary. So, if you look 24 25 at the HEI, there's basically no impact whatsoever. And, even if you use the accepted methodology that everybody says to use which is part of our EIR, you 26 27 can see that there is no property impacted outside of the World Logistics Center in any event. So it's kind of mute, but it's the latest available studies and it's 28 29 incorporated in the EIR. Fish and Game buffer, we talked about it. They have 30 that property. We will also build a buffer along Redlands Boulevard.

31

32 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - I think we're all pretty familiar with the presentation.

33

34 **<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u>** - Okay we'll go past that.

35
 36 CHAIR LOWELL - Unless it's something tremendously new, I think we're good.

37

38 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** - This is, by the way, the idea of connecting all the retail to the existing retail through Cactus Boulevard and that's why they 39 limited the amount of retail within the project. This is the buffer, and we talked 40 about this. I'll skip through. By the way, just in terms of standards whether it's 41 okay, this is Proctor & Gamble. It was recently approved and recently built, and 42 you can see the housing across the street. We have way bigger buffers, berms 43 44 and so forth so the standard applied everywhere else in the City we exceeded by a lot. This is the buffer that will be there, and I won't spend time around there. I 45 will skip through some of these slides that I think you've seen. Oh, this is maybe 46

1 important to understand. There's 4220 trucks, not 14,000. There's 1500 medium 2 size. There's 1100, almost 1200 of the UPS/Fed-Ex type and 27,000 cars, which correlate closely to the amount of employment that people will be visiting the site 3 4 too. But that's essentially what the actual trucks are. There are 4200, not 14,000. And there are 70,000 trips generated by the project. The heavy trucks 5 are only 12%. This is not the majority of the traffic on the road. I'll skip that 6 7 because we all know. This is the Moreno Highlands somebody else for 8 comparison. It's 210,000 compared to 70. I won't spend...this is where it's offpeak. The project actually operates off-peak, so it's very different. This is the 9 10 truck route designation. As you can see, what's in blue, will be truck routes. And you can see on Cactus there is no truck route on Cactus and also Alessandro to 11 12 Redlands Boulevard doesn't have a truck route designation. So, if somebody will 13 go on it, it will be breaking the City's standard. I won't spend time on this, but this 14 actually maybe you'd like to see it if we can run it. But when you look at the traffic numbers, we actually animated the actual traffic analysis so you see it in 15 3D. So those scary numbers you see on the paper, this is animated. I don't 16 know if it will run, maybe we will do it next time. 17

- 18
- 19 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** I think we saw it last time, didn't we? 20

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Okay that wasn't but anyways okay. So thank 21 22 you for the reminder. I appreciate it. This is just development standard. 23 Anyways, this is one thing we haven't discussed. It's not part of the EIR, but the amount of energy we have the Moreno Valley utility and it estimates that the 24 25 project will generate around an \$11 million profit to the utility. That is very conservative. It's probably going to be closer to \$15 million or \$18 million when 26 27 you actually do the analysis so that's a big revenue source as a result of the project for the City as well. 28

- 29
- 30 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> In one of your presentations you said that the electric
 31 demand far exceeded the available electricity and you also stated that Highland
 32 Fairview would be responsible for building all of the support infrastructure for the
 33 facility.
 34
- 35 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Right.
- 36

37 **CHAIR LOWELL** - So would you actually be building the electric facility?

- 39 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Yeah and I'll show you, so....
- 40

42

38

41 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - But typically electric utilities like to build their own.

43 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - We would but I don't know if Moreno Valley will
44 have the resources to actually provide that. We'll build the pizza store so they
45 can sell pizza. We may have to build them the pizza store so they can sell us
46 pizza, so hopefully....so we also have a natural gas, you know, CNG energy on

1 site to support it. Somebody asked, I think you did last time about the truck 2 parking where does that happen and so those blue areas are basically the way we account for a lot of it so they don't have to go to any side streets. If you blow 3 4 up those, these are parking areas. It may be a little bit of schematic, engineers understand it better, but you can see how the pockets are and we have literally in 5 those pockets ability to park several trucks while they're waiting so they're not 6 7 going out to surrounding areas. So, within the project, we will accommodate all 8 our traffic. Their sort of like almost like the bus turnout where you get off traffic 9 but you can wait there.

10

13

15

19

21

24

26

- 11 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** While you're there. Back up to that drawing 12 one back. Okay there. No.
- 14 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI This one?

16 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** - That one. Okay residential traffic/car vehicles, 17 if I'm going from the corner of Moreno Beach and Cactus and I want to get to 18 Gilman Springs Road, will I be able to enter there and go across?

- 20 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Yeah.
- 22 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> So there is nothing preventing traffic from 23 going across and getting to Gilman Springs Road?
- 25 **<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u>** Not at all. Not at all.
- 27 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** But Alessandro would be stopping there, right?
- 28

<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - Well, if you can see, there is a little gap. I can't
 point to it from here.

- 32 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** I can see it.
- 33

31

34 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** - The issue with Alessandro is, as you're going 35 through the town, it's almost not yet a highway and the homes, and I call it the town of Moreno I know it's not a town but the area of Moreno, those houses face 36 Alessandro. And, if you build it to its ultimate, it literally comes to within a few 37 38 feet of the front doors or even worse, if you have to back up out of the garage, 39 you'd have to be backing out into a major almost a highway. So with the City Planning we thought the best solution would be to keep the old alignment. 40 Somebody talked about historical alignment. All the historical alignment of 41 Alessandro Boulevard stays, except it will not allow heavy traffic to go through 42 the town of Moreno. We will keep it a residential nature, so it won't have that. 43 44 But all the other traffic, which Cactus Boulevard for example has no homes 45 facing Cactus. You can from there literally to the 215 with no houses facing Cactus. So it's actually designed better for that. In terms of demand, the people 46

1 say there's projected 413 million square feet of demand for logistics so certainly we're very responsive to the market and opportunities that will come our way. I 2 won't spend too much time on that. The other issue was the lowering of property 3 values. It's actually exactly the opposite that happens. So we did a study of the 4 City area and in blue is around Skechers and the area in red is Sunnymead 5 Ranch and that area. We looked at home values before Skechers through today 6 7 and so we should see a reduction in home values of homes close to Skechers 8 and an increase in home value of areas away from Skechers. But actually the 9 opposite happens. The blue line is the average home price around Skechers, 10 which rose 26%, and literally over by northwest on the freeway Sunnymead Ranch all this area rose by 13% over the same period of time from 2011 to 2015. 11 12 So the notion that jobs and industry reduces property values is exactly opposite 13 to what really happens in the real world, and those in real estate know that very 14 But that's almost counterintuitive to some people. They think that it well. reduces the property value. In fact, if you bought a home next to Skechers, you 15 would have the highest appreciation in the City today. Again some people 16 anticipated and they're already selling those little parcels that you talk about and 17 somebody is already selling that little piece for \$6.5 million. I think that is worth a 18 19 lot more than some of those old houses there, so I think the City did a big service for some of those property owners increasing their property values. There's 20 other property in the City that's not even close, but we noticed that people are 21 22 already talking about trying to sell their properties and saying a lot is new in commercial development (schools/hospitals) are coming in and says about 2.5 23 miles east of the site of the World Logistics Center development under EIR 24 25 review proposed Specific Plan must apply 41 million square feet and they're selling property based on so it's actually stimulating some new activity in the City 26 27 as the result of expecting this business opportunity. Some of the homes that remain there you can see they're actually very far away from where buildings will 28 be so those homes are located either close to Theodore and really far away from 29 where the blue arrows are where development will occur. It's about 1300 feet 30 one way, and there's one that's actually a mobile home that's abandoned today 31 but nonetheless it's a residential unit. It's abandoned but it's about 155 feet away 32 so it's even further than the average setback we have for new buildings in the 33 34 City. This is going back to infrastructure and phasing. This is basically, as you 35 know, we brought in the infrastructure to do Skechers. And, as a result, the blue is the electric and the red is the other utilities. We actually enabled other areas 36 37 to open up like the ALDI facility uses our infrastructure and the phasing will 38 essentially the first will come out from the freeway at Theodore so the first phase 39 this is basically where it is today right where Skechers is. So the first phase will build this leg and open up and the berm along Redlands. So the first phase will 40 be that leg of Theodore and the berm along Redlands that comes down in the 41 first phase and opens up this area. The second phase of the utility comes out 42 there and opens up these areas. The third leg comes. The fourth leg comes and 43 44 then eventually the project gets built out. So we're starting where utilities are and we will progress in a logical fashion down through the development of the site. 45 But the first phase is that leg through Theodore and the berm on Redlands. 46

2 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - And where is that property the gentleman was
 3 speaking about that is being split in half?

4

1

5 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Do you see where Skechers and where Eucalyptus would be? Do you see where Skechers is? There's Eucalyptus. 6 Eucalyptus goes across. Now that's not our property. This is the alignment. 7 8 That street, Eucalyptus Street, goes through in the middle of this property. Now I 9 think we can meet with Staff and that road can be realigned. There could be a lot 10 of things, but this is not a land area we own. This is not Highland Fairview. It's going to be between the City and that property owner and how they want to align 11 12 Eucalyptus. But remember, in the Specific Plan, this is not an engineered road 13 vet. It's basically talking about the general connections and when the specific 14 projects come in they will be able to locate the street, which is more conducive to 15 the development of that site depending on what proposal they will have. We have no objection to however they want to run the street area. Whatever the City 16 will desire to do, that is fine. 17

18

19 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - And the person who said there house is 75
 20 feet from a 60-foot warehouse building?

21

22 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** - I don't know where that is exactly, but if they 23 point it out we could look at it. I just wanted to show when people think there is 24 residential within industrial sometimes you have a few properties that are not part 25 of a Specific Plan. And if you look at, this is where the Proctor & Gamble building 26 is located, and Iris, you can see those red blocks these are where existing homes 27 are today. See these homes? So all of this will be residential so the notion that 28 there is some residential properties that eventually would be at some point 29 nonconforming use then eventually get trapped into it is not a new condition. In 30 fact, the existing industrial area has, as you can see, a lot more existing homes than the World Logistics Center site, which by the way some of those homes we 31 32 own. So there's homes there, but they are considered homes but we own some of them. Not all of them, some of them. But this is again what it might be when 33 34 it's builds up all these residential would have no berms or buffers. It's made up. 35 This is not what the buildings look like, so I think I'm going backwards. We'll go guickly through it. By the way, that building that is across from the school, across 36 37 from a church, and across from some homes and that's the very latest building 38 that was built with existing standards. So we exceeded a lot of the existing 39 standards there. If somebody points it out to me and I will be happy to talk about 40 it. I don't know of anything that's 75 feet away. But this is Proctor & Gamble and 41 you can see the relationships there in terms of

42

43 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Ma'am if you keep bursting out like that I will have the bailiff
 44 come over and talk to you.

- <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> Okay I think this is pretty much for the record.
 You have the slides, and we can elaborate another time.

- CHAIR LOWELL That's a lot of slides.
- **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** Yeah I don't think we have to see all of them 7 again, but they are there as I said as a backup if a question came up.
- **CHAIR LOWELL** Thank you.

OTTAIN LOWELL THAIN you.

- 11 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> This is the letter from the person who said that 12 they're 75 feet away from a 60 foot high warehouse and that is Dawn Newkirk. Is 13 Dawn Newkirk here? If we put the map up there, could you tell us which property 14 is yours?
- APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI I'll try to go back to see that Site Plan and
 maybe we can point to it.
- 19 COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA Yeah.
- 21 <u>SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK</u> I appreciate you addressing this because this
 22 has been a big concern to us.
- **COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA** There it is. Is that it?
- **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** No we will go back. That is....
- 28 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Dawn if you want to come up, you can point it out when it
 29 shows up on the screen.

<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - He'll get to that part on the map.

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Yeah I'm going to find it. Oh, it's you. Yeah
 sure. Yeah, yeah we'll find it. Yeah and you know where I live too so anytime
 you yeah. I don't know how to go through this faster but I hope I don't sprain
 my...can you find that?

- **CHAIR LOWELL** It was one of the last few slides. It was the one with the....
- **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** If you go up maybe.
- 42 <u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> Actually any of that should...
 43
- **CHAIR LOWELL** I want to say it was towards the end.

- 1 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI I think it's if you go up, sorry. Maybe I'll go 2 closer.
- 3
 4 CHAIR LOWELL What about the slide 62 or something? That's a start. No.
- 5 6 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** - Well that would show where it is.
- 8 **CHAIR LOWELL** Alright. Yeah, that is what I was looking for.
- 10 **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** Can you put all the slides up to 11 look at a collage so we can pick it?
- 12

7

9

13 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - Yeah there was one, there we go. There's the overall.

15 **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** - Thank you.

16
 17 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - You know, if you didn't have so many slides, it'd be easier to
 18 find it. Slide 135. Is that the one you're looking for? Try the next slide. I guess
 19 the next one, the pink one.
 20

- SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK Okay so where are....there was one map in
 there that showed there would be a warehouse directly across Dracaea and one
 directly behind.
- PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER If you could speak into the
 microphone since we're recording.
- 28 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Yeah, if you could say that again.
- 29

24

30 SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK - Okay we live off Dracaea Avenue. This has not 31 been addressed I don't think. The houses off Theodore have been addressed, 32 but we live east of Redlands Boulevard on Dracaea Avenue. There is a map that 33 I ran across that has a warehouse across Dracaea Avenue and it would be 34 between 75 and 90 feet from our house and from the back of our house another 35 warehouse was proposed and it says possible warehouse. That would be about 36 500 feet from the rear of our house.

37

38 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - Okay so I'm not sure what map. We haven't 39 done any map like this, but there are so many people making up stuff on the 40 project I wouldn't be surprised if there was such a map floating around here. But, 41 where you live, the closest building will happen 585 feet that way and don't forgot 42 there is a buffer.

- 43
- 44 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** It will be how much? 585?
- 45
- 46 **<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u>** 585 plus our buffer.

3

7

9

11

SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK - Okay so that's about right.

4 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - Right and then this is not you. You will be 5 buffered by one more property that will be about 560 plus the buffer and the 6 buildings start over there. So there is nothing that's 75 feet from your home.

- 8 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** Okay what about that one?
- 10 **CHAIR LOWELL** She is referring to the southern side of the street.
- 12 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** Yeah the southern side, so the southern side 13 the closest it could be 164 feet.

14

16

15 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** - From your front door.

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - From your front door and there's also a buffer. Right? There will be a landscape buffer and the building doesn't come to that line. Technically, by zoning, you could say that. But a building is not going to be there. There will be parking. You know, it will be located somewhere below that. If you look at the Proctor & Gamble building that you saw there, you saw the relationships.

23

25

31

33

35

37

39

41

24 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** - Okay.

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - They don't have a buffer. They don't have a
 landscape buffer, but this is actually further away than the standards in those
 other areas.

- 30 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** So this would be 164 down to here?
- 32 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Yeah.
- 34 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** And then...
- 36 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** To this line, yeah.
- 38 SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK And what is on down here?
- 40 **<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u>** Past that is where we can build buildings.
- 42 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** So it's a 164 foot buffer is what you're telling me.
- 43
 44 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Yeah but also from visually I don't think you'll
- 45 see much because here is a big landscape buffer of about 60 feet. That's quite
- 46 big. How far is this room would you say?

<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> - Probably about 80 feet, maybe 100 feet.

4 **<u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u>** - Maybe not quite, so it will be from maybe that 5 wall. This area in here will be a buffer and then buildings will start.

7 SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK - And then there is access off of Redlands
 8 Boulevard?
 9

- 10 **APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI** Yeah. See there is access right here.
- 12 SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK Okay.

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - Yeah, you'll also have access later on to a
 route this way if somebody will desire.

17 SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK - So 560 on from this furthest point?

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - From you, it's much further. It's probably I'd
 say maybe 750 or 800.

- 22 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** Okay.
- 24 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Yeah.

26 **SPEAKER DAWN NEWKIRK** - Okay, alright. Well thank you very much for 27 your clarification.

28

3

6

11

13

16

18

21

23

25

- 29 **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Thank you.
- 30

31 <u>APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI</u> - Remember, anytime you'd like to talk about it,
 32 we're open. Thank you.

33

34 **CHAIR LOWELL** - Unless anybody has any questions that they want to get off 35 their chest right now, I think now would be a good time to talk about continuing the meeting. Anybody have any questions they want to get off their chest right 36 now? Okay then what I'm proposing to do is to continue to meeting until this 37 38 upcoming Tuesday. Yes, this room is available. Let's see what date that is. 39 Yeah, so I'm proposing to continue the meeting to this upcoming Tuesday, which is June 30th. Does anybody have a problem with starting this meeting at 7:00? 40 Would you like to start earlier, later? 41

42

44

43 **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** - 7:00 is fine.

45 **CHAIR LOWELL** - 3:00. I'm kind of in the mindset of starting at maybe like 6:00

46 but unless anybody has any reason to start that early.

<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - I don't know because I'm picking up someone from the airport. I'm okay with 7:00.

- **CHAIR LOWELL** Anybody want to weigh in on 6:00 or 7:00?
- **<u>VICE CHAIR SIMS</u>** 6:00 would be good.
- **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** Airport run? LA, Ontario, where?

<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u> - Ontario.

- **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** That's not too bad. Okay then unless Staff has any opposition to it, I'd like to continue this meeting to Tuesday the 30th at 6:00 p.m.
- PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER I think you need to make a motion
 and a second and then....
- **<u>CHAIR LOWELL</u>** I was just asking if that was okay before I went down that 20 road.
- **PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER** That would be fine with us.
- **CHAIR LOWELL** And is this room still available?
- 26 <u>PLANNING OFFICIAL RICK SANDZIMIER</u> That's my understanding. Alan
 27 have you heard any different? We believe it's available.
- <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Okay then I would like to motion to continue this meeting to
 Tuesday, June 30th at 6:00 p.m. here in the City Council Chambers.
- **COMMISSIONER BARNES** I second that.
- 34 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI If I may.
- 36 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Yes, Sir.
 37

APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI - I'm fine with the date but I've been standing up 39 here and we never get a full hearing but there is a big team here with me and I 40 don't want you to think that I'm the only one who can speak or will speak for the 41 project. There is a big group of experts and people with Highland Fairview that 42 are hear also to answer questions, and so I want you to know that that maybe 43 next time we could introduce everybody so you could direct questions to the 44 particular experts.

- **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** I'll work on coming up with a whole bunch of questions.

- 4 APPLICANT IDDO BENZEEVI Okay good.
- **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** Yeah.

CHAIR LOWELL - On the table, we have a motion and a second to continue the 9 meeting until June 30th at 6:00 p.m. Can we have a rollcall vote please Grace, or 10 do we want to use our lovely tablets? We can't do that?

- **GRACE ESPINO-SALCEDO** It's up to you.
- **CHAIR LOWELL** Can we use it?
- **GRACE ESPINO-SALCEDO** Yes you can.
- **CHAIR LOWELL** Well let's try it.
- **COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA** Where it says vote you click on vote.
- <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> I don't know if we can do it. Let's just do a rollcall vote. It
 would be easier.
- **<u>COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA</u>** Yeah. Get it over with.
- **COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ** Yes.
- **<u>COMMISSIONER BARNES</u>** Yes.
- **COMMISSIONER VAN NATTA** Yes.
- **CHAIR LOWELL** Can you keep it down please. We're trying to take a vote.
- **COMMISSIONER BAKER** Yes.

- VICE CHAIR SIMS Yes.
- 39 <u>CHAIR LOWELL</u> Yes. Commissioner Korzec is absent. So the motion carries
 40 6-0. We will continue the meeting on Tuesday, June 30th in this room at 6:00
 41 p.m. Thank you and have a good night.
- **Opposed** 0
- 45 Motion carries 7 0

NEXT MEETING	
	mission Special Meeting, June 30, 2015 at 6: y Hall Council Chamber 14177 Frederick Stree
Richard J. Sandzimier Planning Official Approved	Date
Brian R. Lowell Chair	Date